CLH report

Proposal for Harmonised Classification and Labelling

Based on Regulation (EC) No 1272/2008 (CLP Regulation), Annex VI, Part 2

International Chemical Identification:

Barium diboron tetraoxide

EC Number:	237-222-4
CAS Number:	13701-59-2
Index Number:	Not assigned

Contact details for dossier submitter:

Swedish Chemicals Agency

Esplanaden 3a, P.O Box 2

SE-172 13 Sundbyberg, Sweden

kemi@kemi.se

+46 8 519 41 100

Version number: 2

Date: 2019-08-09

CONTENTS

1	IDENTITY OF THE SUBSTANCE	4
	1.1 NAME AND OTHER IDENTIFIERS OF THE SUBSTANCE.1.2 COMPOSITION OF THE SUBSTANCE	
2	PROPOSED HARMONISED CLASSIFICATION AND LABELLING	6
	2.1 PROPOSED HARMONISED CLASSIFICATION AND LABELLING ACCORDING TO THE CLP CRITERIA	6
3	HISTORY OF THE PREVIOUS CLASSIFICATION AND LABELLING	8
4	JUSTIFICATION THAT ACTION IS NEEDED AT COMMUNITY LEVEL	
5	IDENTIFIED USES	
	DATA SOURCES	
6		
7	PHYSICOCHEMICAL PROPERTIES	
8	EVALUATION OF PHYSICAL HAZARDS	9
9	TOXICOKINETICS (ABSORPTION, METABOLISM, DISTRIBUTION AND ELIMINATION)	10
	9.1 SHORT SUMMARY AND OVERALL RELEVANCE OF THE PROVIDED TOXICOKINETIC INFORMATION O	
	PROPOSED CLASSIFICATION(S)	
	9.1.1 Justification for read-across from boric acid and borate salts 9.1.1.1 Consideration of barium as the counter ion	
	9.1.1.1 Consideration of barrain as the counter ion	
	9.1.3 Toxicokinetic data on barium salts	
10	EVALUATION OF HEALTH HAZARDS	22
	10.1 Acute toxicity - oral route	
	10.1.1 Short summary and overall relevance of the provided information on acute oral toxicity	
	10.1.2 Comparison with the CLP criteria	
	10.1.3 Conclusion on classification and labelling for acute oral toxicity	
	10.2 ACUTE TOXICITY - DERMAL ROUTE	
	10.2.1 Short summary and overall relevance of the provided information on acute dermal toxicity	
	10.2.2 Comparison with the CLP criteria	
	10.2.3 Conclusion on classification and labelling for acute dermal toxicity	
	10.3 ACUTE TOXICITY - INHALATION ROUTE	
	10.3.1 Short summary and overall relevance of the provided information on acute inhalation toxicity 10.3.2 Comparison with the CLP criteria	
	10.3.3 Conclusion on classification and labelling for acute inhalation toxicity	
	10.4 Skin corrosion/irritation	
	10.5 SERIOUS EYE DAMAGE/EYE IRRITATION	
	10.6 RESPIRATORY SENSITISATION	
	10.7 Skin sensitisation	
	10.8 GERM CELL MUTAGENICITY	
	10.9 CARCINOGENICITY	
	10.10 Reproductive toxicity	
	10.10.2 Short summary and overall relevance of the provided information on adverse effects on	
	function and fertility	
	10.10.2.1 Animal studies	
	10.10.2.2 Human data	
	10.10.3 Comparison with the CLP criteria	
	10.10.4Adverse effects on development10.10.5Short summary and overall relevance of the provided information on adverse effects on development.	
	10.10.5 Short summary and overall relevance of the provided information on daverse effects on develo 84	spinent
	10.10.5.1 Animal studies	
	10.10.5.2 Human data	89

	10.10.6	Comparison with the CLP criteria	91
	10.10.7	Adverse effects on or via lactation	92
	10.10.8	Short summary and overall relevance of the provided information on effects on or via lactation	96
	10.10.8.1		96
	10.10.8.2		
		Comparison with the CLP criteria	
	10.10.10	Conclusion on classification and labelling for reproductive toxicity	97
		IFIC TARGET ORGAN TOXICITY-SINGLE EXPOSURE	
		IFIC TARGET ORGAN TOXICITY-REPEATED EXPOSURE	
	10.13 ASPI	RATION HAZARD	97
11	EVALUA	FION OF ENVIRONMENTAL HAZARDS	97
12	EVALUAT	FION OF ADDITIONAL HAZARDS	97
13	ADDITIO	NAL LABELLING	97
14	REFEREN	VCES	98
15	ANNEXES	5	. 101

1 IDENTITY OF THE SUBSTANCE

1.1 Name and other identifiers of the substance

Table 1: Substance identity and information related to molecular and structural formula of the substance

Name(s) in the IUPAC nomenclature or other international chemical name(s)	Barium diborate				
Other names (usual name, trade name,	Barium metaborate				
abbreviation)	Trade name: Busan 11-M1				
ISO common name (if available and appropriate)	Not applicable				
EC number (if available and appropriate)	237-222-4				
EC name (if available and appropriate)	Barium diboron tetraoxide				
CAS number (if available)	13701-59-2				
Other identity code (if available)	Not applicable				
Molecular formula	BHO2.1/2Ba				
Structural formula	$0^{\rightarrow B} 0 0^{\rightarrow B} 0 Ba^{2+}$				
SMILES notation (if available)	[Ba+2].[O-]B=O.[O-]B=O				
Molecular weight or molecular weight range	222.9466				
Information on optical activity and typical ratio of (stereo) isomers (if applicable and appropriate)	Not applicable				
Description of the manufacturing process and identity of the source (for UVCB substances only)	Not applicable				
Degree of purity (%) (if relevant for the entry in Annex VI)	Not relevant				

The current classification and labelling proposal for barium diboron tetraoxide covers all crystalline modifications of the substance.

1.2 Composition of the substance

Table 2: Constituents ((non-confidential information)
-------------------------	--------------------------------

Constituent (Name and numerical identifier)	Concentration range (% w/w minimum and maximum in multi-constituent substances)	CurrentCLHinAnnex VITable3.1(CLP)	Current self- classification and labelling (CLP)
barium diboron tetraoxide EC no: 237-222-4 CAS no: 13701-59-2	CONFIDENTIAL	Included in group entry, Index no. 056-002-00-7: Acute Tox. 4*, H302 Acute Tox. 4*, H332	Not Classified Acute Tox. 4, H302 Acute Tox. 4, H332 Repr. 1B, H360FD Skin Irrit. 2, H315 Eye Irrit. 2, H319 STOT SE 3, H335 Aquatic Chronic 3, H412

Table 3: Impurities (non-confidential information) if relevant for the classification of the substance

Impurity	Concentration	Current CI	H in	Current	self-	The impurity
(Name a	nd range	Annex VI Ta	ole 3.1	classification	and	contributes to the
numerical	(% w/w minimum	(CLP)		labelling (CLP))	classification and
identifier)	and maximum)					labelling
Not relevant for the	e classification and labelling	proposal for bar	um dibo	oron tetraoxide		

2 PROPOSED HARMONISED CLASSIFICATION AND LABELLING

2.1 Proposed harmonised classification and labelling according to the CLP criteria

Table 4: Proposed harmonised classification according to the CLP criteria

					Classific	ation		Labelling			
	Index No	International Chemical Identification	EC No	CAS No	Hazard Class and Category Code(s)	Hazard statement Code(s)	Pictogram, Signal Word Code(s)	Hazard statement Code(s)	Suppl. Hazard statement Code(s)	Specific Conc. Limits, M-factors	Notes
Current Annex VI entry	Group entry 056-002- 00-7	barium salts, with the exception of barium sulphate, salts of 1- azo-2- hydroxynaphthalenyl aryl sulphonic acid, and of salts specified elsewhere in Annex VI of 1272/2008	-	-	Acute Tox. 4* Acute Tox. 4*	H302 H332	GHS07 Wng	H302 H332		*	A1
Dossier submitters proposal	TBD	barium diboron tetraoxide	237-222-4	13701-59-2	Repr. 1B Acute Tox. 4	H360FD H302	GHS08 GHS07 Dgr	H360FD H302		Oral: ATE = 530 mg/kg	
Resulting Annex VI entry if agreed by RAC and COM	TBD	barium diboron tetraoxide	237-222-4	13701-59-2	Repr. 1B Acute Tox. 4	H360FD H302	GHS08 GHS07 Dgr	H360FD H302		Oral: ATE = 530 mg/kg	

Hazard class	Reason for no classification	Within the scope of public consultation
Explosives	hazard class not assessed in this dossier	No
Flammable gases (including chemically unstable gases)	hazard class not assessed in this dossier	No
Oxidising gases	hazard class not assessed in this dossier	No
Gases under pressure	hazard class not assessed in this dossier	No
Flammable liquids	hazard class not assessed in this dossier	No
Flammable solids	hazard class not assessed in this dossier	No
Self-reactive substances	hazard class not assessed in this dossier	No
Pyrophoric liquids	hazard class not assessed in this dossier	No
Pyrophoric solids	hazard class not assessed in this dossier	No
Self-heating substances	hazard class not assessed in this dossier	No
Substances which in contact with water emit flammable gases	hazard class not assessed in this dossier	No
Oxidising liquids	hazard class not assessed in this dossier	No
Oxidising solids	hazard class not assessed in this dossier	No
Organic peroxides	hazard class not assessed in this dossier	No
	hazard class not assessed in this dossier	No
Corrosive to metals		
Acute toxicity via oral route	harmonised classification proposed	Yes
	harmonised classification proposed data conclusive but not sufficient for classification	Yes Yes
Acute toxicity via oral route	data conclusive but not sufficient for	
Acute toxicity via oral route Acute toxicity via dermal route Acute toxicity via inhalation	dataconclusivebutnotsufficientforclassificationdataconclusivebutnotsufficientfor	Yes
Acute toxicity via oral route Acute toxicity via dermal route Acute toxicity via inhalation route	data conclusive but not sufficient for classificationdata conclusive but not sufficient for classificationhazard class not assessed in this dossierhazard class not assessed in this dossier	Yes Yes No No
Acute toxicity via oral route Acute toxicity via dermal route Acute toxicity via inhalation route Skin corrosion/irritation Serious eye damage/eye	data conclusive but not sufficient for classificationdata conclusive but not sufficient for classificationhazard class not assessed in this dossierhazard class not assessed in this dossierhazard class not assessed in this dossier	Yes Yes No
Acute toxicity via oral route Acute toxicity via dermal route Acute toxicity via inhalation route Skin corrosion/irritation Serious eye damage/eye irritation	dataconclusivebutnotsufficientforclassificationdataconclusivebutnotsufficientforclassificationnotsufficientfordataforhazardclassnotassessed in thisdossierhazardclassnotassessed in thisdossierhazardclassnotassessed in thisdossierhazardclassnotassessed in thisdossierhazardclassnotassessed in thisdossier	Yes Yes No No
Acute toxicity via oral route Acute toxicity via dermal route Acute toxicity via inhalation route Skin corrosion/irritation Serious eye damage/eye irritation Respiratory sensitisation	data conclusive but not sufficient for classificationdata conclusive but not sufficient for classificationhazard class not assessed in this dossierhazard class not assessed in this dossierhazard class not assessed in this dossier	Yes Yes No No
Acute toxicity via oral route Acute toxicity via dermal route Acute toxicity via inhalation route Skin corrosion/irritation Serious eye damage/eye irritation Respiratory sensitisation Skin sensitisation	dataconclusivebutnotsufficientforclassificationdataconclusivebutnotsufficientforclassificationnotsufficientfordataforhazardclassnotassessed in thisdossierhazardclassnotassessed in thisdossierhazardclassnotassessed in thisdossierhazardclassnotassessed in thisdossierhazardclassnotassessed in thisdossier	Yes Yes No No No
Acute toxicity via oral route Acute toxicity via dermal route Acute toxicity via inhalation route Skin corrosion/irritation Serious eye damage/eye irritation Respiratory sensitisation Skin sensitisation Germ cell mutagenicity Carcinogenicity Reproductive toxicity	data conclusive but not sufficient for classificationdata conclusive but not sufficient for classificationhazard class not assessed in this dossierhazard class not assessed in this dossier	Yes Yes No No No No
Acute toxicity via oral route Acute toxicity via dermal route Acute toxicity via inhalation route Skin corrosion/irritation Serious eye damage/eye irritation Respiratory sensitisation Skin sensitisation Germ cell mutagenicity Carcinogenicity Reproductive toxicity Specific target organ toxicity- single exposure	dataconclusivebutnotsufficientforclassificationdataconclusivebutnotsufficientforclassificationnotsufficientfordataforhazardclass notassessed in thisdossierhazardhazardclassnotassessed in thisdossierhazardclassnotassessed in thisdossier	Yes Yes No No No No Yes No
Acute toxicity via oral route Acute toxicity via dermal route Acute toxicity via inhalation route Skin corrosion/irritation Serious eye damage/eye irritation Respiratory sensitisation Skin sensitisation Germ cell mutagenicity Carcinogenicity Reproductive toxicity Specific target organ toxicity- single exposure Specific target organ toxicity-	data conclusive but not sufficient for classificationdata conclusive but not sufficient for classificationhazard class not assessed in this dossierhazard class not assessed in this dossier	Yes Yes No No No No Yes
Acute toxicity via oral route Acute toxicity via dermal route Acute toxicity via inhalation route Skin corrosion/irritation Serious eye damage/eye irritation Respiratory sensitisation Skin sensitisation Germ cell mutagenicity Carcinogenicity Reproductive toxicity Specific target organ toxicity- single exposure	dataconclusivebutnotsufficientforclassificationdataconclusivebutnotsufficientforclassificationnotsufficientfordataforhazardclass notassessed in thisdossierhazardhazardclassnotassessed in thisdossierhazardclassnotassessed in thisdossier	Yes Yes No No No No Yes No
Acute toxicity via oral route Acute toxicity via dermal route Acute toxicity via inhalation route Skin corrosion/irritation Serious eye damage/eye irritation Respiratory sensitisation Skin sensitisation Germ cell mutagenicity Carcinogenicity Reproductive toxicity Specific target organ toxicity- single exposure Specific target organ toxicity- repeated exposure	dataconclusivebutnotsufficientforclassificationdataconclusivebutnotsufficientforclassificationnotsufficientfordataforhazardclassnotassessed in thisdossierhazardclassnotassessed in thisdossier	Yes Yes No No No No Yes No No

Table 5: Reason for not proposing harmonised classification and status under public consultation

3 HISTORY OF THE PREVIOUS CLASSIFICATION AND LABELLING

Barium diboron tetraoxide can be found in Annex VI of the CLP Regulation under the group entry with the Index number 056-002-00-7 and following name "barium salts, with the exception of barium sulphate, salts of 1-azo-2-hydroxynaphthalenyl aryl sulphonic acid, and of salts specified elsewhere in Annex VI of EC No 1272/2008".

4 JUSTIFICATION THAT ACTION IS NEEDED AT COMMUNITY LEVEL

There is no requirement for justification that action is needed at Community level.

Since barium diboron tetraoxide is considered to fulfil the criteria for classification as toxic to reproduction (Repr. 1B, H360FD), a harmonised classification is thus justified according to Article 36(1)(d) of the CLP Regulation.

The proposed classification and labelling of barium diboron tetraoxide for reproductive toxicity is based on data on the substance itself, with supporting data from read-across from other tested borates (e.g. boric acid) and borate salts (borax or disodium tetraborate decahydrate). The read-across is justified because after oral exposure the substances dissociate and result in the formation of boric acid as the main species at acidic and neutral pH. The resulting classification is comparable to that of the other borates in Annex VI.

5 IDENTIFIED USES

Barium diboron tetraoxide is used for manufacturing of coatings and paints, thinners and paint removers in the industry, and by professional workers and consumers.

6 DATA SOURCES

Data from the REACH registration dossiers of barium diboron tetraoxide¹ and barium², from ECHA dissemination, were used. Additional information sources are represented by the CLH-report for boric acid (2013) and the respective RAC Opinion (2014).

7 PHYSICOCHEMICAL PROPERTIES

 Table 6: Summary of physicochemical properties

Property	Value	Reference	Comment (e.g. measured or estimated)
Physical state at 20°C and 101,3 kPa	White crystalline solid	REACH registration (ECHA dissemination,[2018])	
Melting/freezing point	1367.5 °C at 101.3 kPa	REACH registration (ECHA dissemination,[2018])	BUSAN 11-M1 fused between 1367.5 and 1482.5 °C. A weight loss of 3.6 mg (out of 31.3 mg) was observed for the sample.
Boiling point	No data	-	
Relative density	0.714 ± 0.001 g/cm ³ at 25 °C	REACH registration (ECHA dissemination,[2018])	

¹ Retrieved in November, 2018 at <u>https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered-dossier/15812/1</u>

² Retrieved in December, 2018 at <u>https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered-dossier/19625</u>

Property	Value	Reference	Comment (e.g. measured or estimated)
Vapour pressure	less than 8.1 x 10 ⁻⁷ torr at 25 °C	REACH registration (ECHA dissemination,[2018])	
Surface tension	No data	-	
Water solubility	822 mg/L at 25 °C	REACH registration (ECHA dissemination,[2018])	BUSAN 11-M1 was found to be moderately soluble in water having a solubility of 823 ppm.
Partition coefficient n-octanol/water	Pow = 0.2 at 25 °C, giving a log Pow of 0.69897	REACH registration (ECHA dissemination,[2018])	Based on guideline requirements the Pow was reported in the study as less than 10, giving a log Pow of less than 1.
Flash point	Not applicable	-	
Flammability	Non-flammable	REACH registration (ECHA dissemination,[2018])	
Explosive properties	Not applicable	-	
Self-ignition temperature	Not applicable	-	
Oxidising properties	Not oxidising	REACH registration (ECHA dissemination,[2018])	The test item/cellulose mixture did not burn when the ignition source was put in contact with the cone. The mixture carbonised and the colour changed into grey/black. Barium diboron tetraoxide is considered to be inert in terms of oxidizing properties.
Granulometry	92.3 % of the powder has a particle size of between 0.3 and 10um	REACH registration (ECHA dissemination,[2018])	
Stabilityinorganicsolventsandidentityofrelevantdegradationproducts		-	BUSAN 11-M1 was found to be slightly soluble in octanol having a solubility of 0.38 ppm.
Dissociation constant 8.9 at 25 °C		REACH registration (ECHA dissemination,[2018])	
Viscosity	Not applicable	-	

8 EVALUATION OF PHYSICAL HAZARDS

Physical hazards were not assessed in this dossier.

9 TOXICOKINETICS (ABSORPTION, METABOLISM, DISTRIBUTION AND ELIMINATION)

Method	Results	Remarks ³	Reference
	Human data		
Boric acid and borate salts			
<i>In vivo</i> percutaneous absorption study in humans Males and females aged 22 - 50 with 8 people per group were exposed to the test substance. Urine was sampled as well as T-shirts worn and skin washings sampled.	In vivo dermal absorption:The absorbed dose of boric acid was 0.226 ± 0.125 , with flux and permeability constants calculated at $0.0094 \ \mu g/cm^2/h$ and $1.9 \ x \ 10^{-7}$ cm/h, respectively.Borax (disodium tetraborate decahydrate) percent dose absorbed was 0.210 ± 0.194 , with flux and permeability constants calculated at $0.00875 \ \mu g/cm^2/h$ and $1.8 \ x \ 10^{-7}$ cm/h, respectively.Disodium octaborate tetrahydrate absorbed dose was 0.122 ± 0.108 , with flux and permeability constants calculated at $0.010 \ \mu g/cm^2/h$ and $1.0 \ x \ 10^{-7}$ cm/h, respectively.	Test material: boric acid, disodium tetraborate decahydrate, disodium octaborate tetrahydrate Purity: unknown Reliability: 1 (reliable without restriction).	Wester et al. 1998a
Percutaneous absorption through human skin <i>in</i> <i>vitro</i> <i>In vitro</i> diffusion from aqueous solution was determined in receptor fluid accumulation over a 24h period. Human cadaver skin (dermatomed) was clamped onto an AMIE Systems in- line cell in a flow-through apparatus, with 1 cm ² surface area of skin exposed. Receptor fluid was pumped at a rate of 3 mL/hr and collected every 4 h to 24 h. After 24 h the skin surface was washed. Boric acid (enriched) was applied at 0.05 %, 0.5 % and 5 % and either an infinite dose of 1000 mL/ cm2 or a finite dose of 2 mL/ cm2. Changes in boron isotope ratios by IPCMS	Dermal absorption: The absorbed doses of boric acid were 1.2 for 0.005 % dose, 0.28 for 0.5 % dose and 0.70 % for 5 % dose. These absorption amounts translated into flux values of 0.25, 0.58 and 14.58 mg/cm ² /h and permeability constants (Kp) of 5.0 x 10-4, 1.2 x 10 ⁻⁴ and 2.9 x 10 ⁻⁴ /cm/hr. The above doses were at a standard 1000 µL/cm ² dosing solutions. When the 5 % dose was applied at 2 µL/cm2 (in vivo dosing volume), flux decreased some 200-fold to 0.07 mg/cm ² /hr and Kp of 1.4 x 10 ⁻⁶ cm/hr. Borax (disodium tetraborate decahydrate) dosed at 5 %/1000 µL/cm ² had 0.41 % dose absorbed. Skin surface wash recovery was 87.7 ± 5.9 % dose. Flux was 8.5 µg/cm ² /h, and Kp was 1.7 x 10 ⁻⁴ cm/h. Disodium octaborate tetrahydrate dosed at 10 % /1000 µL/cm ² was 0.19 % dose absorbed. Skin surface wash recovery was 91.3 ± 25.2 % dose. Flux was 0.8 x 10 ⁻⁴ cm/h. These <i>in vitro</i> results from infinite dose (1000 µL) were several magnitudes higher than those obtained <i>in vivo</i> . The results from the finite dose (2 µL) were closer to the <i>in</i>	Test material: boric acid, disodium tetraborate decahydrate, disodium octaborate tetrahydrate Purity: unknown Reliability: 1 (reliable without restriction).	Wester et al. 1998b

Table 7: Summary table of toxicokinetic studies

vivo results (also 2 µL).

(Inductively Coupled

 $^{^{3}}$ Where applicable and unless stated otherwise, the reliability scores of the studies presented in Table 7 are according to the CLH dossier of boric acid, assessed by RAC in 2013.

Method	Results	Remarks ³	Reference	
Plasma-Mass Spectrometry) were used to measure absorption.				
Dermal absorption in infants The plasma boron content in 22 newborn infants was assessed, following repeated daily applications of a water-emulsifying ointment containing the equivalent of 3 % boric acid to the napkin region; 3 g ointment administered in total to each infant, corresponding to 90 mg boric acid (equivalent to 15.7 mg boron). Boron	The mean plasma-boron concentration decreased over a 5 days period, from a pre- treatment value of 0.49 to 0.29 mg/L, the corresponding values in ten untreated neonates being 0.62 and 0.21 mg/L, respectively.	Test material: boric acid Purity: unknown Reliability: 2 (reliable with restrictions).	Friis-Hansen et al. 1982	
Literature review of published and proprietary data	Absorption: inhaled boron is absorbed and systemically distributed, almost complete gastrointestinal absorption following oral exposure. Distribution: widely distributed throughout the body including reproductive tissues, but has a low affinity for fat. At high doses, boron accumulates in the bone. <u>Metabolism</u> : being an inorganic element, boron is not metabolised by humans, but the parent borate is recovered in the blood, tissues and urine. <u>Elimination and excretion</u> : excretion primarily through renal elimination; over 93% of the inhaled and ingested dose is excreted in the urine; a calculated mean half- life of 13.4 h (range 4 – 27.8 h) in nine cases	The report considered human exposure to equivalent boron doses calculated from compounds such as boric acid, boron oxide, borate salts (e.g. calcium borate) and various hydration states of sodium borate salts (anhydrous, pentahydrate, decahydrate).	ATSDR Report, 2010	
<i>In vivo</i> human excretion of boron, specifically examining renal clearance 16 pregnant women in the 2 nd trimester (14 – 28 weeks) and 15 nonpregnant women (designated as age- matched references). Blood samples for boron, creatinine and urea were collected at the start, at 2 h and 24h. Urine was collected during the first 2h	The pregnant and non-pregnant boron intake was 1.35 mg boron/24h and 1.31 mg boron/24h, respectively. <u>Renal clearance for 2h period</u> : Renal boron clearance measured over the initial 2h was 68.30 ± 35.0 mL/min/1.73 m ² for pregnant subjects and 54.31 ± 19.35 mL/min/1.73 m ² for non-pregnant subjects based on surface area. Based on body weights, the renal clearances were 1.02 ± 0.55 mL/min/kg and 0.8 ± 0.31 mL/min/kg for pregnant and nonpregnant subjects respectively.	The source of boron used for the measurement of renal boron clearance was the dietary boron normally present in human food (present in high amounts especially in fruits and vegetables).	Pahl et al. 2001	

Method	Results	Remarks ³	Reference
in the Clinical Research	Renal clearance for 24h period		
Centre and during 22 h	The renal clearance was 61.04 ± 36.7	Purity: unknown	
outside the centre for	mL/min/1.73 m ² for pregnant subjects and		
measurement of volume,	$43.85 \pm 21.59 \text{ mL/min}/1.73 \text{ m}^2$ for	Reliability: 1	
boron and creatinine.	nonpregnant subjects based on surface area.	(reliable without	
	Based on body weights, the renal clearances	restriction).	
	were 0.92 \pm 0.59 mL/min/kg and 0.64 \pm 0.4		
	mL/min/kg for pregnant and nonpregnant		
	subjects, respectively.		
	Diagma lavalar		
	Plasma levels: The baseline plasma levels of boron were		
	0.022 ± 0.013 and 0.023 ± 0.015 mg B/mL		
	for nonpregnant and pregnant subjects		
	respectively. At 2h and 24h, the levels were		
	as follows: 2 hours: 0.024 ± 0.015 and 0.018		
	\pm 0.011 mg B/mL for non-pregnant and		
	pregnant subjects respectively; 24 hours:		
	0.027 ± 0.018 and 0.013 ± 0.006 mg B/mL		
	for non-pregnant and pregnant subjects		
	respectively.		
	Differences in the serum creatinine		
	clearances indicated that urine collection had		
	not been complete over the entire 24 h		
	collection period.		
	Comparison of renal boron clearance with		
	creatinine clearance indicated that tubular		
	reabsorption of boron occurred in both		
	pregnant and non-pregnant women.		
Neutron activation	Boron was not present in the blood or serum	Environmental	Minoia et al.
analysis-electrothermal	of healthy Italian subjects.	exposure to	1990
atomic absorption		boron	
spectroscopy (ETA-AAS)	Boron was present in the urine of 119		
and inductively coupled	subjects. The mean concentration \pm standard	Reliability: 2	
plasma atomic emission	deviation was $1890 \pm 126 \ \mu g/L$; with an	(reliable with	
spectrometry (ICP-AES)	experimental range of 470 – 7800 µg/L.	restrictions)	
analysis	The reference values were 9490 - 3290 μ g/L		
46 elements from urine,	and range of uncertainty was $> 3290 - 7800$		
blood and serum of	μ g/L.		
unexposed Italian subjects			
living in the same region,	The upper limit form metabolic anomalies		
were determined.	was $> 7800 \mu g/L.$		
The subjects were			
considered representative of			
five subgroups resident in			
urban, suburban, rural and			
low and high hill areas.			
A questionnaire supplied detailed information on age,			
sex, area of residence,			
occupation, smoking habits,			
body weight, alimentary			
habits, socioeconomic and			
ethnic factors as well as on			
the elemental composition			
of the drinking water from			

Method	Results	Remarks ³	Reference
the municipal supply and			
mineral water used. Barium salts			
Durium sails			
Inhalative exposure to soluble barium	Excretion:	Barium- containing stick	Zschiesche et al. 1992
compounds	Group A: increased renal excretion of Ba, with median concentrations of 101.7 μ g/L	electrodes or barium-	
18 workers (welders) exposed for one week to welding fumes containing 31 – 37% barium, were investigated.	urine and 89.1 μ g/g creatinine. The highest concentrations in the individual spot samples were 407.7 μ g/L urine and 370.6 μ g/g creatinine.	containing self- shielded flux cored wires	
The workers were divided in three groups (A, B, C) based on the type of electrodes used, where the first two groups had no	Group B: increased renal excretion of Ba, with median concentrations of 113.1 μ g/L urine and 77.3 μ g/g creatinine. The maximum individual values were 313.8 μ g/L urine and 287.9 μ g/g creatinine.		
ventilation system at the working site, as opposed to group C. The workers did not use Ba-containing consumables minimum 10	Group C: slightly increased renal excretion of Ba, with median concentrations of 44.3 μ g/L urine and 49.2 μ g/g creatinine. The highest individual concentrations were 4.1 μ g/L urine and 3.1 μ g/g creatinine.		
days before the study was performed. On average, the	<u>Plasma levels</u> :		
welders worked for about 4 h per day with a mean arc time of about 80 %.	Group A: marked increase in Ba plasma levels, with a median concentration of 24.7 µg/L. The individual post shift		
The investigation included measurements of the external exposure to total	concentrations were in the range of $4.1 - 63.4 \ \mu g/L$.		
welding fumes and soluble Ba in the breathing zone behind the welding shields and helmets, assessment of internal exposure to Ba by	Group B: marked increase in Ba plasma levels, with a median concentration of 16.6 μ g/L. The individual postshift concentrations were in the range of 4.5 – 74.0 μ g/L.		
biological monitoring of plasma and urine spot samples, medical history taking, thorough clinical and neurological	Group C: slightly increased Ba plasma levels, with a median concentration of 4.4 μ g/L. The individual postshift concentrations were in the range of 1.2 – 7.9 μ g/L.		
investigations, ECG (limb and precordial leads), continuous 24h ECG (two channels), and measurement of plasma electrolytes (sodium,	The results show that airborne barium was absorbed either after mucociliary clearance from the gastrointestinal tract or through the respiratory system.		
potassium, magnesium, and total and ionized calcium). Whole blood was checked for pH, standard	The biological half-life time of Ba was calculated based on both urine and plasma and found to be $10 - 18$ h.		
bicarbonate, and base excess The activities of tubular renal enzymes [N- acetyl P-D-glucosaminidase			
(NAG) and alanine aminopeptidase (AAP)]			

Method	Results	Remarks ³	Reference
were measured in urine spot			
samples.			
Emission spectrography was used to assess the levels of barium in human tissues A number of approx. 400 subjects (between 0 – 80 years of age) from the United States, Africa, Switzerland, Near Est and Far East were investigated.	 Mean plasma concentration of Ba: 79 μg/L Calculated renal plasma clearance of Ba: 330 mL/day Urinary excretion of Ba: 3% of the total ingested amount Ba was also found in the testis in 75% of the collected samples, and in the ovaries in 87% of the collected samples. The authors also conclude that Ba crosses the placental barrier based upon the fact that Ba is found in infants and children in the first decade of life and even in the stillborn. 	The source of Ba used for the measurements performed by this study is represented by dietary Ba normally present in food and water	Schroeder et al. 1972
Literature review of published and proprietary data	Absorption: gastrointestinal absorption was 20% in adults, 30% for 1-15 year old children, 60% for infants. Airborne Ba can either be absorbed by the respiratory system or from the gastrointestinal tract (after mucociliary clearence). Distribution: 90% was detected in the bone where Ba was primarily deposited in active bone growth areas; 1-2% of the total body burden was found in muscle, adipose, skin and connective tissue. <u>Metabolism</u> : barium is not metabolised in the body, but it can be transported or incorporated into complexes or tissues. <u>Elimination and excretion</u> : primarily through faecal excretion (approx. 90%) and only 2 – 3% through urine.	The reports considered human exposure to barite and barium salts (e.g. barium chloride, barium nitrate, barium hydroxide, barium sulphate, barium carbonate), which occurred environmentally, occupationally, intentionally or accidentally.	ATSDR report, (2007) CICAD WHO report, (2001) REACH registration (ECHA dissemination, [2019])
Animal data			
Boric acid		[
Rat (Sprague - Dawley), female	- Dawley), <u>Excretion</u> : renal clearance of boron in non- pregnant rats was slightly lower than the renal clearance of boron in pregnant rats (i.e.		Vaziri et al. 2001
n (renal clearance study) = 10 non- pregnant/group and 10 pregnant/group n (half-life study) = 6 non- pregnant/group and 6 pregnant/group	3.1 ± 0.8 , 3.0 ± 0.6 and 3.2 ± 0.5 mL/min/kg, respectively; and in pregnant rats was $3.3 \pm$ 0.6 , 3.2 ± 0.5 and 3.4 ± 0.5 mL/min/kg, respectively). This difference in clearance between pregnant and non-pregnant rats was not statistically significant. The clearance was independent of doses up to 30 mg /kg bw (5.24 mg B/kg bw).	Purity: > 99% Reliability ⁴ : 1 (reliable without restriction), key study in REACH registration	REACH registration (ECHA dissemination, [2018])
Exposure: oral (gavage), single administration	Half-life: the plasma half-life of boric acid in non-pregnant and pregnant rats given boric		

⁴ The reliability score for this study is according to the publically disseminated REACH Registration dossier for boric acid, available at <u>https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered-dossier/15472/7/2/2</u>

Method	Results	Remarks ³	Reference
Doses/conc.: - <u>Renal clearance study</u> : 0.3, 3.0 or 30 mg boric acid/kg bw equivalent to 0.05, 0.52 and 5.2 mg boron /kg bw, respectively. - <u>Plasma half-life study</u> : 30 mg boric acid/kg, equivalent to 5.24 mg B/kg bw.	 acid by gavage was 2.93 ± 0.24 and 3.23 ± 0.28 hours, respectively. <u>Identified metabolites</u>: no, boric acid is not metabolised. The authors concluded that pregnancy did not induce a statistically significant alteration of the renal clearance or plasma half-life of boron in rats. 		
Rat (Fischer 344) male oral: feed n = 6/dose group Exposure: oral (feed), for 9 weeks Doses/conc.: 0, 3000, 4500, 6000 and 9000 ppm boric acid, equivalent to 0, 545, 788, 1050 and 1575 ppm boron (< 0, 0.2, 26, 38, 52, 68 mg B/kg bw/day), respectively.	<u>Distribution</u> : mean (\pm SD) testis B levels over the 9-week period were 5.6 \pm 0.8, 8.8 \pm 0.7, 11.9 \pm 1.4 and 15.1 \pm 1.9 µg/g for 3000, 4500, 6000 and 9000 ppm boric acid, respectively. Mean (\pm SD) serum B levels (weeks 1, 4 and 9) were 6.7 \pm 1.0, 10.3 \pm 0.6, 13.3 \pm 0.7 and 17.3 \pm 2.2 µg/g for 3000, 4500, 6000 and 9000 ppm boric acid, respectively. <u>Identified metabolites</u> : no, boric acid is not metabolised.	Test material: boric acid Purity: 99.99% Reliability: 2 (reliable with restrictions)	Ku et al. 1993
Rat (Fischer 344), male n = 30/group Exposure: oral (feed), daily for 7 days Doses/conc: 0 and 9000 ppm (1575 ppm boron), equivalent to 0 and 94 mg B/kg bw/day.	Distribution: Plasma and all soft tissues examined, including the testis, epididymis, prostate, seminal vesicles and secretions, hypothalamus,and rest of brain, appeared to reach steady state boron levels (range 12 – 30 µg/g) by 3 – 4 days, with the exception of bone and adipose tissue. Bone boron levels continued to increase up to the termination at 7 days (40 – 50 µg/g by day 7). Boron levels in examined tissues Control boron levels in plasma and all tissues examined were below 4 µg/g (range 0.66-3.69 µg/g), with the exception of adrenal glands (7.99 µg/g): - Plasma 1.94 ± 0.17; - Liver 0.66 ± 0.10; - Kidney 1.55 ± 0.03; - Adipose tissue 1.71 ± 0.17; - Muscle 3.69 ± 0.54; - Bone 1.17 ± 0.19; - Large intestine 3.08 ± 0.17; - Brain 0.76 ± 0.02; - Hypothalamus 0.91; - Testis 0.97 ± 0.10; - Epididymis 0.81 ± 0.15; - Seminal vesicles 1.64 ± 0.23; - Seminal vesicle fluid 2.05; - Adrenals 7.99; - Prostate 1.20.	Test material : boric acid Purity: unknown Reliability: 2 (reliable with restrictions)	Ku et al. 1991

Method	Results	Remarks ³	Reference
	Results Day 1 (μ g B/g tissue, compared to controls): - bone showed a 20-fold increase (i.e. 23.57 \pm 1.19); - hypothalamus, rest of brain, liver and kidney showed 12- to 15-fold increases (i.e. 10.90, 11.20 \pm 0.47, 10.09 \pm 0.60 and 19.53 \pm 1.62, respectively); - testis, epididymis, seminal vesicles, seminal vesicle secretions, and prostate showed 7- to 11-fold increases (i.e. 10.41 \pm 0.78, 8.89 \pm 1.10, 14.40 \pm 3.87, 14.90 and 13.90, respectively); - plasma, adrenal glands, large intestine and muscle showed only a 2- to 6-fold increase (i.e. 10.82 \pm 0.50, 17.40, 10.87 \pm 0.72 and 13.73 \pm 0.97, respectively). All of the soft tissues examined, including the epididymis and accessory sex organs, as well as the testis, hypothalamus, and rest of brain did not show boron accumulation over plasma levels, with a mean tissue/plasma ratio of 1.11 \pm 0.05 (mean \pm SE) at both days 4 and 7, excluding bone and adipose tissue. Days 4 - 7 (compared to controls): - bone showed a 37-fold increase (i.e. 16.37 \pm 1.42 - 16.00 \pm 0.71); - epididymis, liver, hypothalamus, testis, seminal vesicles and prostate showed 15- to 22-fold increases (19.40 \pm 1.46 - 16.81 \pm 3.7, 12.33 \pm 0.37 - 13.13 \pm 0.54, 14.80 – 14.30, 14.50 \pm 1.71 - 16.00 \pm 1.19, 27.87 \pm 9.80 - 23.70 \pm 6.56 and 19.10 – 14.8, respectively); - plasma, kidney and seminal vesicle secretions showed 8- to 13-fold increases (i.e. 16.37 \pm 1.42 - 16.00 \pm 0.71, 19.77 \pm 1.60 - 19.80 \pm 1.65 and 24.70 – 19.20, respectively); - adrenals, muscle and large intestine, all showed boron concentrations >3 μ g/g, (3- to 5-fold increases, i.e. 22.30 - 21.90, 13.20 \pm 0.99 - 14.23 \pm 0.19 and 16.43 \pm 0.94 - 14.90 \pm 0.7);	Remarks ³	Kererence
	 - adipose tissue showed a 2-fold increase, i.e. 3.45 ± 0.22 - 3.78 + 0.13. <u>Identified metabolites</u>: no, boric acid is not metabolised. 		
Literature review of published and proprietary data	<u>Absorption</u> : oral absorption fraction in rats was found at 95%. Boron is readily absorbed through damaged skin in rabbits.	The report considered experimental animal exposure	ATSDR report, (2010)
	<u>Distribution</u> : in male rats, boron is evenly distributed to liver, kidney, brain, muscle, adrenals, epididymis, testes, seminal vesicles, and blood, but not fat, following 61	to equivalent boron doses calculated from compounds such	

Method	Results	Remarks ³	Reference
	mg boron/kg/day as boric acid for 28 days. In rats, boron accumulates in the bone, reaching 3-fold higher levels than in the soft tissue. <u>Metabolism</u> : being an inorganic element, boron is not metabolised by animals, but the parent borate is recovered in the blood, tissues and urine. <u>Elimination and excretion</u> : excretion primarily through renal elimination, with a renal clearance value of 163 mg/kg/ hour in rats.	as boric acid, boron oxide, borate salts (e.g. calcium borate) and various hydration states of sodium borate salts (anhydrous, pentahydrate, decahydrate), which occurred through various routes of exposure (i.e. inhalation, oral, dermal, intravenous and intra-tympanic).	
Barium salts		/	
Rat (brown-hooded August), female n = 10/group for age groups 14-18 days and $60 - 70$ weeks, and 5/group for age group $6 - 8$ weeks of age Exposure: oral (gavage), single administration Doses/conc.: the activity administered as a single dose to each animal was approx. 10 μ C of ¹⁴⁰ Ba, 1 μ C of ⁸⁵ Sr, 1 μ C of ⁴⁵ SCa, 0.01 μ C of ²²⁶ Ra. Three administration groups were used: fed rats, starved rats and fed rats which also received cow milk administration. Three age groups were used: 14 – 18 days old, 6 - 8 and 60 – 70 weeks old female rats. The animals were sacrificed 7h after administration.	 <u>Absorption:</u> At 14 – 18 days of age, approx. 80% of Ba was absorbed; For 6 – 8 weeks of age, the absorption of Ba decreased to approx. 7%; For 60 – 70 weeks of age, the absorption of Ba was approx. 7.5%. The absorption of Ba was markedly increased by food deprivation before exposure: At 6 – 8 weeks of age, approx. 20% of Ba was absorbed; At 60 – 70 weeks of age, approx. 19% of Ba was absorbed. The administration of Cow milk had no effect on the absorption of Ba. 	Test material: Barium chloride, strontium chloride, radium chloride, calcium chloride Purity: unknown	Taylor et al. 1962
Literature review of published and proprietary data	<u>Absorption</u> : rapid absorption following inhalation or nasal deposition with more efficient clearance in the upper respiratory tract than in the trachea (0.41, 0.145, 0.044, and 0.043% retained ¹³³ Ba in the trachea one week after administration for rats, rabbits, dogs, and monkeys, respectively). Gastrointestinal absorption was approx. 50% in dogs, compared to 30% in rats and mice.	The reports considered experimental animal exposure to barium salts (e.g. barium chloride, barium barium sulphate, barium carbonate),	REACH registration (ECHA dissemination, [2019]) ATSDR report, (2007)

Method	Results	Remarks ³	Reference
	 Younger rats absorbed approx. 10 times more (i.e. 63-84%) barium from the gastrointestinal tract than older rats (approx. 7%). <u>Distribution</u>: predominantly in the bone, with the following non-skeletal distribution 24h after ingestion in rats: heart > eye > skeletal muscle > kidney > blood > liver. <u>Metabolism</u>: Ba is not metabolised in the body, but it can be transported or incorporated into complexes or tissues. <u>Elimination and excretion</u>: faecal excretion exceeds urinary excretion in the case of rats, dogs and rabbits. A biological half-life time of 12.8 days following inhalation exposure, was estimated in dogs. 	which occurred through various routes of exposure (i.e. inhalation, oral, dermal and intravenous).	CICAD WHO report, (2001)
Comparative review of the	toxicokinetics of boric acid in humans and ani	imals	
Literature review of published data	 <u>Absorption:</u> Oral absorption: humans and animals (rats, rabbits, sheep and cattle) absorb boric acid similarly, i.e. readily and completely from the gastrointestinal tract. Dermal absorption: negligible absorption across intact skin for both animals and humans; for non-intact skin, the absorption varies with the used vehicle. <u>Distribution</u>: similar distribution of boric acid in both animals and humans, i.e. through the body fluids, with boron not accumulating in the soft tissue: For humans, boron levels found in soft tissues were equivalent to those found in plasma, while boron levels found in bone were higher than those in soft tissues or plasma. High levels of boron were also found in hair and teeth. Similar to humans, the highest levels of boron for rats and mice was found in the bone, reaching 2-3 times those observed in plasma, and continued to increase throughout 7 days of exposure. However, the boron levels found in adipose tissue represented only 20% of the plasma ones. The levels of boron measured in the testis of male rats were almost equivalent to those measured in plasma. <u>Metabolism</u>: boric acid is not metabolised in either humans or animals. Other borate salts convert to boric acid at physiological pH in the aqueous layers of the mucosal surfaces. 	The review considered both human and experimental animal exposure to boric acid, which occurred through various routes of exposure (i.e. oral, dermal, intravenous).	Murray 1998

Method	Results	Remarks ³	Reference
	Excretion and elimination: irrespective of the route of exposure, boric acid is excreted unchanged through the urine, in both humans and animals, with a half-life of < 24h, and it can be slowly eliminated from bone.		
	Blood levels: in male rats, a close degree of correlation between plasma levels and testicular levels was found, and thus a testes level of 5.6 μ g B/g (corresponding to 26 mg B/kg bw/day) was associated with mildly inhibited spermiation while testicular atrophy was observed at a concentration of 11.9 μ g B/g (equivalent to 52 mg B/kg bw/day).		

9.1 Short summary and overall relevance of the provided toxicokinetic information on the proposed classification(s)

There is no available *in vivo* information on the toxicokinetic properties of barium diboron tetraoxide and there is limited toxicity data available for the hazard class (reproductive toxicity) considered in this CLH proposal. Classification for reproductive toxicity following oral exposure is therefore supported using a read-across approach from tested borates (borax or disodium tetraborate decahydrate) and boric acid, justified on the basis of hydrolytic and toxicokinetic behaviour, and toxicological data (see section 9.1.1 below for read-across justification). Moreover, data on barium, as the counter ion, are also considered in the hazard assessment of barium diboron tetraoxide since its contribution to potential adverse effects cannot be dismissed.

9.1.1 Justification for read-across from boric acid and borate salts

Barium diboron tetraoxide is the inorganic ionic salt of boric acid. Barium diboron tetraoxide is described as slightly to moderately soluble in water, and soluble in hydrochloric acid. The solubility of barium diboron tetraoxide in water is 822 mg/L at 25°C, which is expected to increase at gastric pH and physiological temperature. Based on the chemical nature of the substance, it is predicted to dissociate into its constituent ions, Ba^{2+} ion and the metaborate ion (BO_2^{-}), under physiological conditions and prior to absorption.

Following administration and prior to absorption into the systemic circulation, barium diboron tetraoxide will dissociate in body fluids, as for example saliva, the aqueous layer overlaying the mucosal surfaces and gastric fluid during oral administration. Therefore, aqueous solutions of this borate contain only boric acid H₃BO₃, its conjugate base $B(OH)_4^-$ and the counter ion (Ba²⁺). The relative concentrations of the boron species is a function of pH. Boric acid is the main species at acidic and neutral pH. At an alkaline pH (above pH 10) the metaborate anion $B(OH)_4^-$ becomes the main species in solution. More concentrated borate solutions also contain at the intermediate pH range polyborate anions (B₅O₆(OH)₄⁻, B₃O₃(OH)₄⁻, B₄O₅(OH)₄²⁻ and B₃O₃(OH)₅²⁻). The distribution of species is largely independent of the cation.

From the species distribution of borates, it can be concluded that the main borate species at physiologically relevant conditions (large volume of distribution, aqueous solution, acidic or neutral pH) is boric acid. In addition, as stated in the report on boron performed in 1998 by the International Programme on Chemical Safety (IPCS)⁵, studies performed with rats, rabbits, sheep and cattle

⁵ <u>http://www.inchem.org/documents/ehc/ehc/ehc204.htm#PartNumber:6</u>

indicated that more than 90% of administered doses of inorganic borates were excreted in the urine as boric acid. The systemic effects of borates are therefore considered to be related to the concentration of boric acid systematically available. Since the oral bioavailability of boric acid is nearly 100 %, it is assumed that the transport of boric acid across the intestinal wall only depends on the concentration of boric acid in the intestine. The intestinal concentration depends on the administered dose and the solubility and dissolution rate of the specific borate in gastric fluid.

Additionally, as also stated in the IPCS report on boron, the chemical and toxicological effects of boric acid and other borates are similar on a mol boron/liter equivalent basis when dissolved in water or biological fluids at the same pH and low concentration. Therefore, read-across to boric acid and borate salts for both toxicokinetic properties and systemic effects, based on boron (B) equivalents is justified.

These equivalents were obtained through using the following values (derived based on the molar masses of barium diboron tetraoxide, boric acid, borax and boron) and conversion factors for administration of the test substances in drinking water or feed (EFSA, 2012):

Equivalent boron weight = weight of barium diboron tetraoxide x 0.0897Equivalent boron weight = weight of boric acid x 0.1750Equivalent boron weight = weight of disodium tetraborate decahydrate (borax) x 0.1133

As stated in the CLH-reports of disodium octaborate, anhydrate and disodium octaborate tetrahydrate (2013) read-across from boric acid to other borates and between borates has long been accepted in a regulatory context. Experts from the CL Working Group, the TC-C&L and the ATP Committee agreed that borates have similar properties and therefore that read-across between substances can be applied.

9.1.1.1 Consideration of barium as the counter ion

As stated above, under physiologically relevant conditions and prior to absorption, barium diboron tetraoxide is expected to dissociate into the metaborate and barium ions. Since barium can be distributed to both the testes and ovaries and can cross the placental barrier (Schroeder et al. 1972), its potential contribution to the overall reproductive toxicity of barium diboron tetraoxide is also assessed in the current CLH proposal.

As shown by the IPCS 1991 report⁶, 20% of an ingested dose of a barium compound of an unspecified solubility was found after 24h primarily in the faeces (20%), but also in urine (5 - 7%). Furthermore, the rate of absorption for barium is dependent on the route of exposure and age. The human data show that the gastrointestinal absorption for barium was approx. 60% in infants as opposed to 20% in adults, while the animal data show that younger rats absorbed approx. 10 times more (i.e. 63 - 84%) barium than older ones (i.e. 7%).

Therefore, it appears that barium has a lower absorption rate than boric acid and borate salts, and a different elimination route (90% through faeces for barium vs. 90% through renal elimination for boric acid).

9.1.2 Toxicokinetic data on boric acid and borate salts

No studies according to validated test guidelines on the toxicokinetics of boric acid or borate salts are available. The data described above in Table 7 are mainly represented by what is available in the open scientific literature as experimental (animal data) and occupational studies, and literature reviews.

Absorption

Oral

⁶ <u>http://www.inchem.org/documents/ehc/ehc/ehc107.htm#SectionNumber:6.3</u>

Humans and animals (rats, rabbits, sheep and cattle) absorb orally administered boric acid in a similar way, readily and completely from the gastrointestinal tract, with 92 - 95% of the dose being recovered in the urine.

Inhalation

After boric acid exposure via inhalation, boron is systemically distributed through absorption across pulmonary tissues and into the bloodstream.

<u>Dermal</u>

The available studies show that there is minimal dermal absorption (i.e. 0.5%) of boric acid through intact skin for both animals and humans. Absorption through non-intact skin varies with the used vehicle: as opposed to oil-based vehicle, aqueous-based ones lead to a greater dermal absorption of boric acid.

Distribution

After administration of boric acid, boron has a similar distribution for both humans and animals with the following common aspects:

- Boron is rapidly distributed throughout body fluids;
- Boron does not accumulate in soft tissue;
- Boron accumulates in the bone, reaching 2 3 times higher levels than in plasma.

The plasma and soft tissue concentrations of boron are equivalent for humans, while the adipose tissue levels of boron represented only 20% of the plasma ones in rats. The testis levels of boron in male rats were almost equal to the ones measured in plasma. Moreover, in male rats, a close correlation between testicular and blood levels of boron was found, with testicular concentrations of 5.6 μ g B/g (equivalent to 26 mg B/kg bw/ day) and 11.9 μ g B/g (equivalent to 52 mg B/kg bw/ day) being associated with inhibited spermiation and testicular atrophy, respectively (Murray et al. 1998).

Metabolism

Boric acid is not metabolised in either humans or animals, boron being a trace element which exists in the body as boric acid (the only form of boron recovered in the urine).

Excretion and elimination

Independently of the route of exposure, boric acid is primarily excreted through renal elimination and has a half-life less than 24h for both humans and animals. It can also be slowly eliminated from the bone. Based on literature data, eliminated fractions of absorbed boron were estimated to be 67 - 98% for humans and 99% for rats (ATSDR 2010), and the calculated clearance values were 40 mg/kg/hour in humans and 163 mg/kg/hour in rats, respectively. In addition, the glomerular filtration rate appears to be the determining factor in the renal elimination of boron.

9.1.3 Toxicokinetic data on barium salts

Absorption

Oral

Oral absorption of barium decreases with age for humans (20% for adults vs. 60% for infants) and animals (80% for rats at 2-3 weeks of age vs. 7.5% for rats at 60-70 weeks of age) (ATSDR 2007). Moreover, the oral absorption of barium appears to be facilitated by food deprivation before exposure (approx. 20% for starved rats of 6-8 weeks of age vs. approx. 7% for fed rats of 14-18 days of age), as shown by Taylor et al. 1962.

Inhalation

Barium is rapidly absorbed following inhalation exposure, with intratracheal retention.

Dermal

Due to the high polarity of forms in which barium is usually available, it is not expected to cross the intact skin.

Distribution

Similarly, to boron, approx. 90% of the absorbed barium accumulates in the bone where it is primarily deposited in active growth areas, in both humans and animals. Following 24h after ingestion, the following non-skeletal distribution in rats was observed: heart > eye > skeletal muscle > kidney > blood > liver, while in humans 1-2% of the total body burden was found in the muscle, adipose, skin and connective tissue. Additionally, human data show that Ba can also be distributed to the testis and ovaries. It also has the ability to cross the placental barrier as demonstrated by the fact that barium was found in infants and children in the first decade of life and even in the stillborn (Schroeder et al. 1972).

Metabolism

Barium is not metabolised in the body but it can be transported or incorporated into complexes or tissues.

Excretion and elimination

For both humans and animals (i.e. rats, rabbits and dogs), barium is primarily excreted through faeces (approx. 90%), while only approx. 3% accounts for urinary excretion.

10 EVALUATION OF HEALTH HAZARDS

Acute toxicity

10.1 Acute toxicity - oral route

Method, guideline, deviations if any ⁷	Species, strain, sex, no/group	Test substance	Dose levels, duration of exposure	Value LD50	Reference
Barium diboron	tetraoxide				
Non-guideline acute oral toxicity study Similar to OECD 401. Conducted prior to GLP, and the availability of OECD guidelines. No information on the purity of the test sample, limited information on the animals and the testing	Rat (Sprague- Dawley) male/female n = 8/sex/group	Busan 11-M1 (barium metaborate monohydrate) Purity: unknown Vehicle: unknown Oral gavage	340, 500, 730, 1070, 2310 and 5000 mg/kg bw Single oral dose 14 days post- exposure observation period	Males: 850 mg/kg bw Females: 530 mg/kg bw	REACH registration (ECHA dissemination, [2019]) Study report 1979a

Table 8: Summary table of animal studies on acute oral toxicity

⁷ The reliability score for this study is according to the publically disseminated REACH Registration dossier for barium diboron tetraoxide, available at <u>https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered-dossier/15812/7/3/2</u>

Method, guideline, deviations if any ⁷	Species, strain, sex, no/group	Test substance	Dose levels, duration of exposure	Value LD50	Reference
conditions (such as on temperature and humidity).					
Reliability: 2 (reliable with restrictions)					

Table 9: Summary table of human data on acute oral toxicity

Type of study/data	Test substance	Relevant information study (as applicable)	about t	he	Observations	Reference
No human data v	vere available on	the acute oral toxicity of ba	arium dibo	oron	tetraoxide	

Table 10: Summary table of other studies relevant for acute oral toxicity

Type of study/data	Test substance	Relevant information about the study (as applicable)	Observations	Reference			
No other relevant studies on the acute oral toxicity of barium diboron tetraoxide were available							

10.1.1 Short summary and overall relevance of the provided information on acute oral toxicity

Animal studies

Barium diboron tetraoxide

One non-guideline study (preceding OECD test guidelines and GLP) of acceptable quality and reliability investigating the acute oral toxicity of barium diboron tetraoxide in rats was available. An LD_{50} of 850 mg/kg bw was established for males and 530 mg/kg bw for females.

Since this study provides sufficient substance-specific information on barium diboron tetraoxide for classification, no read-across from data on boric acid and borate salts or barium salts is performed. The below data on boric acid, borate salts and barium salts are presented only for comparison.

Boric acid and borate salts

According to the disseminated REACH registration dossier⁸, based on a non-guideline study performed in rats, an LD₅₀ of 3450 mg/kg bw was established for boric acid. Other non-guideline acute oral toxicity studies in rats also reported LD₅₀ > 2000 mg/kg bw.

Moreover, acute oral toxicity studies performed in rats for disodium octaborate anhydrate, disodium tetraborate anhydrous, disodium tetraborate pentahydrate and diboron trioxide revealed LD_{50} levels of > 2000 mg/kg bw, for each substance.

Barium chloride

According to the disseminated REACH registration dossier of barium chloride⁹, the acute oral toxicity study performed in rats according to OECD TG 401 established an LD_{50} of 645 mg/kg bw (equivalent to an LD_{50} level of 426 mg Ba/kg bw). However, two additional non-guideline studies revealed lower

⁸ <u>https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered-dossier/15472/7/3/1</u>

⁹ https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered-dossier/15037/7/3/2

 LD_{50} levels for barium chloride (i.e. $LD_{50} \le 300$ mg/kg bw). The reported acute oral toxic effects in rats mainly consist of increased or decreased respiratory rate and irregular respiration, increased or decreased motility, loss of coordination, paralysis of the hind legs, tremors and coarse body tremors.

Human data

Barium diboron tetraoxide

No human data on the acute toxicity of barium diboron tetraoxide were available.

Boric acid and borate salts

As detailed in the disseminated REACH registration dossier of boric $acid^{10}$, intentional or accidental poisoning incidents with boric acid or borate salts have been reported. Based on an old case review study, the human oral lethal dose was reported as 2-3 g boric acid for infants, 5-6 g boric acid for children and 15-30 g boric acid for adults. None of the more recent poisoning cases with an estimated dose range of 0.01 - 88.8 g boric acid were reported to be fatal. The reported acute effects are mainly represented by nausea, vomiting, gastric effects, skin flushing, convulsions, depression and vascular collapse.

Barium salts

Death has been reported in several cases of accidental or intentional ingestion of barium salts, primarily caused by cardiac arrest and severe gastrointestinal haemorrhage (Deng et al. 1991; Diengott et al. 1964; Downs et al. 1995; Jourdan et al. 2001). However, the doses in these cases were not known.

Conclusion

The available acute oral toxicity study of barium diboron tetraoxide meets the criteria for classification in Acute Tox. 4, and the lowest LD_{50} is 530 mg/kg bw in the rat (females). In comparison, the LD_{50} values for boric acid and borate salts (i.e. disodium octaborate anhydrate, disodium tetraborate anhydrous, disodium tetraborate pentahydrate and diboron trioxide) were reported to be > 2000 mg/kg bw, and thus, not requiring classification. However, the higher acute oral toxicity of barium diboron tetraoxide could be due to the barium counter ion, for which an LD_{50} value of 426 mg/kg bw (corresponding to Category 4) can be derived from the LD_{50} of 645 mg/kg bw for barium chloride (also corresponding to Category 4). Thus, correcting for the percentage of barium, the LD_{50} established for barium diboron tetraoxide (i.e. 530 mg/kg bw) would correspond to 302 mg Ba/kg bw (Category 4).

10.1.2 Comparison with the CLP criteria

According to the CLP Regulation (EC) No 1272/2008, classification for acute oral toxicity is required for substances with acute toxicity estimate values (based on LD₅₀) below 2000 mg/kg bw. Category 3 is assigned for ATE values > 50 and \leq 300 mg/kg bw, while Category 4 is assigned for substances with ATE values > 300 and \leq 2000 mg/kg bw.

The acute oral toxicity study performed in rats with barium diboron tetraoxide established LD_{50} values > 300 and < 2000 mg/kg bw (Category 4), where the lowest LD_{50} was 530 mg/kg bw.

10.1.3 Conclusion on classification and labelling for acute oral toxicity

Classification in Acute Tox. **4**, **H302**, with an ATE of 530 mg/kg bw, is proposed for barium diboron tetraoxide.

Currently, barium diboron tetraoxide has a harmonised classification as Acute Tox. 4* (H302) for the oral route of exposure, as part of a group entry in Annex VI of CLP. A removal of the asterisk (*) indicating minimum classification is thus proposed.

¹⁰ <u>https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered-dossier/15472/7/11/1</u>

10.2 Acute toxicity - dermal route

Method,	Species, strain,	Test substance,	Dose levels	Value	Reference				
guideline,	sex, no/group	rest substance,	duration of	LD50	Kelerence				
deviations if	sex, no/group		exposure	110 30					
any ¹¹			-						
Barium diboron traoxide									
Non-guideline	Rabbit (New	Busan 11-M1	2000 mg/kg bw	Male/female:	REACH				
acute dermal	Zealand White)	(barium		> 2000 mg/kg	registration				
toxicity study		metaborate		bw	(ECHA				
	male/female	monohydrate)	Single dermal		dissemination, [2019])				
Similar to OECD 402. No	male/remale		dose		[2019])				
			uose						
information on	n = 5/sex/group	Purity: unknown	14 days post-		Study report				
the purity of the test substance,	II = 3/3CX/group	i unity. unknown	exposure		1979b				
limited			observation		17770				
information on			period						
the animals and			period						
the testing									
conditions (such									
as on									
temperature and									
humidity), no									
information on									
the size of test									
site. The study									
was conducted									
on abraded skin									
and the animals									
were									
immobilised.									
Reliability: 2									
(reliable with									
restrictions)									

Table 11: Summary table of animal studies on acute dermal toxicity

Table 12: Summary table of human data on acute dermal toxicity

Type of data/report		Relevant information about the study (as applicable)	Observations	Reference			
No human data were available on the acute dermal toxicity of barium diboron tetraoxide							

Table 13: Summary table of other studies relevant for acute dermal toxicity

Type of study/data	Test substance	Relevant information about the study (as applicable)	Observations	Reference				
No other relevant studies on the acute dermal toxicity of barium diboron tetraoxide								

¹¹ The reliability score for this study is according to the publically disseminated REACH Registration dossier for barium diboron tetraoxide, available at <u>https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered-dossier/15812/7/3/4</u>

10.2.1 Short summary and overall relevance of the provided information on acute dermal toxicity

Animal studies

Barium diboron tetraoxide

One non-guideline study (preceding OECD test guidelines and GLP) of acceptable quality and reliability investigating the acute dermal toxicity of barium diboron tetraoxide in rabbits was available. An LD_{50} of > 2000 mg/kg bw was established.

Since this study provides sufficient substance-specific information on barium diboron tetraoxide for classification, no read-across from data on boric acid and borate salts or barium salts is performed. The below data on boric acid, borate salts and barium salts are presented only for comparison.

Boric acid and borate salts

According to the disseminated REACH registration dossier¹² of boric acid, an $LD_{50} > 2000 \text{ mg/kg}$ bw was established based on a non-guideline study performed in rabbits. Moreover, acute dermal toxicity studies performed in rats or rabbits for disodium octaboarte anhydrate, disodium tetraborate decahydrate and disodium tetraborate pentahydrate revealed LD_{50} levels of > 2000 mg/kg bw, for each substance.

Barium chloride

The acute dermal toxicity study performed in rats according to OECD TG 402 established an LD_{50} > 2000 mg/kg bw. However, it should be noted that the study report was not available for assessment.

Human data

Barium diboron tetraoxide

No human data on the acute dermal of barium diboron tetraoxide were available.

Boric acid and borate salts

As detailed in the disseminated REACH registration dossier of boric acid, several poisoning cases were reported in humans due to the use of skin and mucosa antiseptic pharmaceutical preparations containing boric acid. Moreover, case reports of accidental exposure of the head were also reported, with effects such as general or focal alopecia of the scalp (ATSDR Report, 2010).

Barium salts

Limited data are available describing the acute dermal toxicity of barium salts in humans. Due to the high polarity of the forms in which barium is mostly encountered, it is not expected to cross the intact skin. A case report of dermal burns of a worker exposed to molten barium chloride was available (ATSDR Report, 2007). These effects could have however been due to the molten nature of the material and not necessarily due to barium chloride.

Conclusion

The available data indicate that barium diboron tetraoxide displays low acute dermal toxicity ($LD_{50} > 2000 \text{ mg/kg bw}$). The reported information is comparable for boric acid, borate and barium salts, where the established LD_{50} values were > 2000 mg/kg bw, and thus do not require classification.

10.2.2 Comparison with the CLP criteria

According to the CLP Regulation (EC) No 1272/2008, classification for acute dermal toxicity is required for substances with acute toxicity estimate values (based on LD_{50}) below 2000 mg/kg bw. The reported LD_{50} value of barium diboron tetraoxide indicates no requirement for classification for acute dermal toxicity.

¹² https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered-dossier/15472/7/3/4

10.2.3 Conclusion on classification and labelling for acute dermal toxicity

Based on the experimental animal data revealing an LD_{50} value over 2000 mg/kg bw, classification of barium diboron tetraoxide for acute dermal effects is not warranted.

10.3 Acute toxicity - inhalation route

Table 14: Summary table of animal studies on acute inhalation toxicity

Method, guideline, deviations if any ¹³	sex, no/group	Testsubstance,formandparticlesize(MMAD)	duration of	Value LC50	Reference
Barium diboron te	etraoxide			1	
Non-guideline acute inhalation toxicity study Similar to OECD 403. Conducted prior to GLP, no information on the purity of the test sample, or on the conditions of exposure. The study was carried out at the maximum attainable concentration. Reliability: 2 (reliable with restrictions)	Rat (Sprague- Dawley) male/female n = 5/sex/group	Busan 11-M1 (barium metaborate monohydrate) Purity: unknown Vehicle: unknown Inhalation (whole body): dust MMAD (µm): 3.4±0.28 and 2.8±0.14 for 2.98 mg/L and 3.54 mg/L, respectively	Nominal concentration: 14.52 mg/L and 21.70 mg/L Mean gravimetric concentration: 2.98 mg/L and 3.54 mg/L Exposure duration: 4 h 14 days post- exposure observation period	Male/female: > 3.5 mg/L	REACH registration (ECHA dissemination, [2019]) Study report 1983

Table 15: Summary table of human data on acute inhalation toxicity

Type of data/report		Relevant information about the study (as applicable)	Observations	Reference		
No human data were available on the acute inhalation toxicity of barium diboron tetraoxide						

Table 16: Summary table of other studies relevant for acute inhalation toxicity

Type of study/data	Test substance,	Relevant information about the study (as applicable)	Observations	Reference			
No other relevant studies on the acute inhalation toxicity of barium diboron tetraoxide were available							

¹³ The reliability score for this study is according to the publically disseminated REACH Registration dossier for barium diboron tetraoxide, available at <u>https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered-dossier/15812/7/3/3</u>

10.3.1 Short summary and overall relevance of the provided information on acute inhalation toxicity

Animal studies

Barium diboron tetraoxide

One non-guideline study (preceding OECD test guidelines and GLP) of acceptable quality and reliability investigating the acute oral inhalation toxicity of barium diboron tetraoxide in rats was available. The test animals were exposed to nominal concentrations of 14.52 mg/L and 21.70 mg/L, corresponding to gravimetric concentrations of 2.98 mg/L and 3.54 mg/L, for 4 hours via whole-body exposure of diboron tetraoxide dust with MMAD within the respirable range (1-4 μ m). The highest dose tested was the maximum attainable concentration of barium diboron tetraoxide. After exposure, all animals in the two treated groups appeared languid from 30 min through 4 hours. Some animals at the lower dose levels also showed slight dyspnoea from hour 2 through and rhinorrhoea from hour 1 through hour 4. One male was found dead at 2.98 mg/L at day 2 after exposure and one female rat died at 3.5 mg/L at day 1 after exposure. On day 1 post exposure individuals of the high dose group showed clinical signs including lethargy, blood crusts around the nose, polypnoea and wheezing. All remaining animals in this group appeared normal from day 2 through termination. No LC₅₀ could be set (> 3.5 mg/L) based on the findings in the study.

Since this study provides sufficient substance-specific information on barium diboron tetraoxide for classification, no read-across from data on boric acid and borate salts or barium salts is performed. The below data on boric acid, borate salts and barium salts are presented only for comparison.

Boric acid and borate salts

According to the disseminated REACH registration dossier¹⁴, based on an OECD 403 study performed in rats, an $LC_{50} > 2.03$ mg/L was established. In addition, an US EPA FIFRA study performed in rats, reported an LC_{50} of > 2.12 mg/L.

Moreover, acute inhalation toxicity studies performed in rats for disodium octaborate tetrahydrate and disodium tetraborate pentahydrate revealed LC_{50} levels > 2 mg/L, for each substance.

Barium chloride

As reported in the REACH registration dossier of barium chloride¹⁵, an acute inhalation toxicity study performed in rats according to OECD TG 403 established an $LC_{50} > 1.1 \text{ mg/L}$ (1/5 male rats was found dead 3h after exposure and no other mortalities occurred).

Human data

Barium diboron tetraoxide

No human data on the acute toxicity of barium diboron tetraoxide were available.

Boric acid and borate salts

Healthy volunteers were exposed to 0, 5, 10, 20, 30 and 40 mg/m³ sodium tetraborate pentahydrate as dust for 20 min, while cycling (Cain et al. 2004). Effects such as nasal and throat irritation were seen \geq 30 mg/m³, the subjects reporting time-dependent feel due to sodium tetraborate pentahydrate exposure primarily in the nose and hardly in the eyes. Similarly, healthy volunteers were exposed to 0, 10 mg/m³ sodium borate, and to 0, 2.5, 5 and 10 mg boric acid/m³ for 47 minutes while exercising (Cain et al. 2008). Increased nasal secretions and decreased nasal airway resistance was observed at 10 mg/m³ sodium borate.

Barium salts

¹⁴<u>https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered</u> dossier/15472/7/3/3/?documentUUID=371b867a-f26c-412a-996f-007ef1835888

¹⁵ <u>https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered-dossier/15037/7/3/3</u>

A case report of an accidental exposure to a large but unknown amount of barium carbonate powder of a 22-year old worker was available (Shankle and Keane 1988). Effects such as progressive muscle weakness, paralysis of the extremities and neck, renal failure, abdominal cramps, nausea and vomiting were reported.

Conclusion

While the acute inhalation study performed in rats could not establish an LC₅₀, the available data indicate that barium diboron tetraoxide displays low acute inhalation toxicity since only 1/5 male rats was found dead at the maximum attainable concentration (i.e. 3.5 mg/L) after 4 hours of exposure. Furthermore, the reported information indicates that boric acid, disodium octaborate tetrahydrate, disodium tetraborate pentahydrate also have low acute inhalation toxicity since no deaths were observed at concentrations > 2 mg/L. In contrast, the data show that barium chloride has a higher acute inhalation toxicity than the borate salts, since one death occurred at 1.1 mg/L.

Based upon the presented data, it is assumed that the LC_{50}/ATE is greater than the maximum attainable concentration, and thus, barium diboron tetraoxide does not require classification for acute inhalation toxicity.

10.3.2 Comparison with the CLP criteria

According to the CLP Regulation (EC) No 1272/2008, classification for acute inhalation toxicity is required for substances with acute toxicity estimate values (based on LC_{50}) below 5 mg/L (dusts and mists). Since the LC_{50} value for barium diboron tetraoxide is greater than the maximum attainable concentration (3.5 mg/L), classification for acute inhalation toxicity is not required.

10.3.3 Conclusion on classification and labelling for acute inhalation toxicity

Based on the experimental animal data revealing an LC_{50} value over the maximum attainable concentration, classification of barium diboron tetraoxide for acute inhalation toxicity is not warranted.

Currently, barium diboron tetraoxide has a harmonised classification as Acute Tox. 4* (H332) for the inhalation route of exposure, under the group entry entitled "barium salts, with the exception of barium sulphate, salts of 1-azo-2-hydroxynaphthalenyl aryl sulphonic acid, and of salts specified elsewhere in Annex VI of EC No 1272/2008".

Based upon the available data on the acute inhalation toxicity of barium diboron tetraoxide, a removal of the classification as Acute Tox. 4* (H332) is proposed.

10.4 Skin corrosion/irritation

Hazard class not assessed in this dossier.

10.5 Serious eye damage/eye irritation

Hazard class not assessed in this dossier.

10.6 Respiratory sensitisation

Hazard class not assessed in this dossier.

10.7 Skin sensitisation

Hazard class not assessed in this dossier.

10.8 Germ cell mutagenicity

Hazard class not assessed in this dossier.

10.9 Carcinogenicity

Hazard class not assessed in this dossier.

10.10 Reproductive toxicity

10.10.1 Adverse effects on sexual function and fertility

Since only one study with barium diboron tetraoxide was available for assessment of adverse effects on sexual function and fertility, read-across from repeated dose and reproductive toxicity data on boric acid and borate salts were included in order to support the conclusion on classification.

With the exception of a recent study investigating the effects of boron on rat fertility (Marat et al. 2018) and the study on barium chloride, the studies given in Table 17 below were appointed key studies by the RAC in its 2014 opinions on boric acid, disodium octaborate anhydrate and disodium octaborate tetrahydrate. One human study on the effects of boron on male fertility has been published since March 2014, and is presented in Table 18.

In addition, data on the counter ion from a sub-chronic oral toxicity study on barium chloride in rats were included in Table 17 in order to provide a complete picture of the toxicological profile of barium diboron tetraoxide.

Method, guideline, deviations if any, species, strain, sex, no/group ¹⁶ Barium diboron tet	Test substance, dose levels duration, of exposure	Results	Reference
barium alboron iei	raoxiae		
EPA OPP 82-1 (90-Day Oral Toxicity) and EPA OPP 82-7 (Neurotoxicity)	Test material: Busan 11-M1 (barium metaborate monohydrate)	 LOAEL for male fertility: 10 000 ppm (707 mg/kg equivalent to 63.6 mg B/kg bw), based on decreased testes weight and severe aspermatogenesis. 1000 ppm (70 mg/kg bw for males and 80 mg/kg bw for 	Study report 1993a
Carried out under GLP and conducted according to US EPA guideline 82- 1 and 82-7 but follows OECD TG 408 with the exception of the following organ weights: epididymides, uterus, thymus, spleen.	Purity: 94.3% Form: powder <u>Doses/conc.:</u> 0, 1000, 5000, 10000 ppm, equivalent to 0, 70, 349 and 707 mg/kg bw in males and 0, 80, 406, and 794 mg/kg bw in females, equivalent to 0, 6.3, 31.4 and	 females, equivalent to 6.3 mg B/kg bw for males and 7.2 mg B/kg bw for females, respectively): <u>Males:</u> two males were euthanized <i>in extremis</i> (one was hypoactive, unkempt and sacrificed on week 7, and the other one was sacrificed due to a mechanical trauma) and the causes were not attributed to the treatment. No signs of general toxicity were reported for either males or females. 5000 ppm (349 mg/kg bw for males and 406 mg/kg bw for females, equivalent to 31.4 mg B/kg bw for males and 36.5 mg B/kg bw for females, respectively): <u>Males:</u> Statistically significant (p<0.01) increased absolute brain weight (by approx. 6%). No statistically significant effects on body weight or body weight gain. No effects on 	

Table 17: Summary table of animal studies on adverse effects on sexual function and fertility

¹⁶ Where applicable and unless stated otherwise, the reliability scores of the studies presented in Table 17 are according to the CLH dossier of boric acid, assessed by RAC in 2013.

			D 0
Method, guideline,	Test substance, dose levels	Results	Reference
deviations if any,	duration, of		
species, strain,	exposure		
sex, no/group ¹⁶	•		
	0, 63.6 mg B/kg	testes weight.	
D	bw in males and 0,	<u>Females</u> : statistically significant decrease ($p<0.05$) in body	
Rat (Sprague-	7.2, 36.5 and 71.4	weight during weeks 0-8 and 0-12, compared to controls.	
Dawley) male/female	mg B/kg bw in females,	The females displayed decreased body weight gain that reached statistical significance (p <0.05) only for the 0-8	
maie/ iemaie	respectively.	and 0-12 weeks intervals (by 14% for both time-periods).	
n = 10/sex/group		No statistically significant differences as compared to	
	<u>Exposure:</u> 91, 92,	controls were observed in haematology or clinical	
	93 or 94	observations for both males and females.	
	consecutive days prior to necropsy	10000 ppm (707 mg/kg bw for males and 794 mg/kg/bw	
	(daily in feed).	for females, equivalent to 63.6 mg B/kg bw for males	
	(ually in reed).	and 71.4 mg B/kg bw for females, respectively):	
		<u>Males</u> : Statistically significant (p<0.01) decreased absolute	
		(61%), and relative (57%) weight of testes compared to	
		control. Nine out of 10 males displayed small testes and	
		7/10 displayed soft testes. Increase (100%) in the	
		incidence of aspermatogenesis (10/10 where 1 was mild and 9 were severe). No spermatocytes present in tubules of	
		the epididymis in 9/10 males. Final body weight decreased	
		with 10% compared to controls ($p<0.05$).	
		Females: Organ weights for either ovaries or uteri were not	
		reported. Histopathological examination of the female	
		organs was not performed. The body weight gain was	
		significantly decreased throughout the whole treatment. $(65 - 78\%)$	
		(65 - 78 % of that of controls; p < 0.05).	
		Significantly decreased haematology parameters were	
		observed in both males and females: RBC count (only in	
		males, by 9%; p<0.05), haemoglobin (by 7% in males and	
		9% in females; p<0.05) and haematocrit (by 7% in males	
		and 10% in females; p<0.05) levels that were considered	
Boric acid		treatment-related.	
	1		
Sub-chronic oral	For studies 1 and	Study 1 sub-chronic oral toxicity (rats):	Weir and
toxicity (90-day	2:	<u>Study I sub-chrome or ar toxicity (1413).</u>	Fisher
study) (<u>Study 1</u>		52.5 ppm boron (equivalent to 4.7 mg B/kg bw/day):	1972
and 2)	Test material:	One male and one female died during the study.	
	boric acid or borax	Males: no changes in organ weights	Weir 1966
<u>Study 1:</u> No		<u>Females</u> : non-statistically significant increased ovary	
guideline	Purity: unknown	weight (data not shown).	
specified	Deses/20002	175 ppm boron (equivalent to 15.7 mg B/kg bw/day):	
Rat (Sprague-	<u>Doses/conc.:</u> -Study 1: 0, 52.5,	No statistically significant changes in growth, body	
Dawley)	175, 525, 1750 and	weight, food consumption and organ weights for both	
male/female	5250 ppm boron,	males and females.	
	equivalent to 0,		
n = 10/sex/dose	4.7, 15.7, 47.2,	525 ppm boron (equivalent to 47.2 mg B/kg bw/day):	
group	157.5 and 472.5	<u>Males</u> : partial testes atrophy (5 rats) and spermatogenic	
Study 2. No	mg B/kg bw/day,	arrest (1 rat).	
<u>Study 2</u> : No guideline	respectively	<u>Females</u> : organ weights comparable to those of control (data not shown).	
specified	-Study 2: 0, 17.5,		
reenieu	5100 2.0, 17.3,		

Method,	Test substance,	Results	Reference
Method, Test substance, guideline, dose levels		Kesuits	Reference
deviations if any,	duration, of		
species, strain,	exposure		
sex, no/group ¹⁶			
, F	175, and 1750 ppm	1750 ppm boron (equivalent to 157.5 mg B/kg bw/day):	
Dogs (Beagle)	boron, equivalent	One male and one female died during the study.	
male/female	to 0, 0.4, 4.3 and	Males: significantly reduced growth and food utilization	
	43.7 mg B/kg	efficiency (data not shown, not clear if statistically	
n = 5/sex/dose	bw/day,	significant) and a statistically significant (p<0.05) decrease	
group	respectively	in testes absolute weight (i.e. by approx. 77% for both	
E a la di se d'as	E	treatments), accompanied by complete testes atrophy.	
For both studies, survivors were	Exposure: 90 consecutive days	<u>Females</u> : statistically significant ($p<0.05$) decreased absolute body weight (i.e. $10 - 12$ % for both treatments)	
sacrificed after 90	prior to necropsy	and absolute ovary weight (p< 0.05 ; by approx. 27% for	
days on the diet.	(daily in feed).	boric acid treatment, and 42% for borax treatment).	
At necropsy the	(cally in reca).		
weights of brain,		5250 ppm boron (equivalent to 472.5 mg B/kg bw/day):	
thyroid, liver,	For study 3:	All rats died within 3 to 6 weeks of treatment. For both	
spleen, kidney,		male and female rats, the necropsy examination showed	
adrenals and	Test material:	swollen brain appearance and small gonads for both borax	
testes were	boric acid or borax	and boric acid treatment (incidence not reported).	
recorded. The tissues	Dunitru1	Study 2 mb abrania and tanisity (3)	
preserved in	Purity: unknown	Study 2 sub-chronic oral toxicity (dogs):	
buffered formalin	Doses/conc.: 0,	17.5 ppm boron (equivalent to 0.4 mg B/kg bw/day):	
and studied	117, 350 and 1170	<u>Males</u> : decreased spleen/body weight ratio (not specified if	
histopathologicall	ppm boron,	statistically significant, data not shown)	
y were brain,	equivalent to 0,	Females: no reported changes in organ weights or	
pituitary, thyroids,	5.9, 17.5 and 58.5	organ/body weight ratios.	
lung, heart, liver,	mg B/kg bw/day.		
spleen, kidneys, adrenals,		175 ppm boron (equivalent to 4.3 mg B/kg bw/day):	
pancreas, small	Exposure: from the	<u>Males</u> : decrease in testes/body weight ratio (not specified if statistically significant, data not shown)	
and large	beginning of the	<u>Females</u> : no decrease in organ weight or organ/body	
intestines, urinary	study (14 weeks	weight ratios.	
bladder, testes,	pre-mating		
ovary (for rat	exposure) until	1750 ppm boron (equivalent to 43.7 mg B/kg bw/day):	
only), bone and	sacrifice of parents	One male dog died at day 68 of the study.	
bone marrow.	P1, and from	<u>Males</u> : statistically significant decrease ($p<0.05$) in thyroid	
Donnaduration	weaning until	and testes/body weight ratios (the latter by $40 - 50$ % for both treatments), source testionlar atrophy and complete	
Reproduction study (<u>Study 3)</u>	sacrifice of the F1- and F2-generations	both treatments), severe testicular atrophy and complete degeneration of the spermatogenic epithelium (4/4 male	
Study (<u>Study 5)</u>	(daily, in feed).	dogs).	
No guideline	(<u>Females</u> : increased width of the zona glomerulosa of the	
specified, but	For study 4:	adrenal glands; markedly atrophied thyroid glands with	
conforms to the	-	lymphoid tissue infiltrations for 2 females.	
standard three-	Test material:		
generation, 2	boric acid	Study 3 reproductive toxicity (rats):	
litters per generation multi-	Dunitur un lan aum	For both low and mid-dose groups, no gross abnormalities	
generation studies	Purity: unknown	for parents or offspring were reported.	
normally used at	Doses/conc.: 0,	Significantly (p<0.05) higher fertility indices (by approx.	
the time.	117, 350 and 1170	45%, as compared to controls) were reported for F3	
	ppm boron,	generation, for both borax and boric acid treatment.	
The high dose group P1 animals	equivalent to 0,		
were sterile so	5.9, 17.5 and 58.5	The fertility indices for all filial generations (F1, F2 and	
only controls, low	mg B/kg bw/day.	F3) for both borax and boric acid treatment at 5.9 and 17.5 mg P/rg bu/day are presented below.	
and mid-dose		mg B/kg bw/day are presented below.	
groups were taken			

Method,	Test substance,				Results				Reference
guideline,	dose levels								
deviations if any, species, strain,	duration, of exposure								
sex, no/group ¹⁶	exposure								
to the F2 and F3	Exposure: 24	Index	Cont	5.9 mg	17.5 mg	Cont	5.9 mg	17.5 mg	
generations.	months, daily in feed.		rol	B/kg bw/day	B/kg bw/day	rol	B/kg bw/day	B/kg bw/day	
Rat (Sprague-			1	1	Bora	ĸ			
Dawley) male/female				P1-F1A			P1-F1B		
n = 8 males/dose			62.5	68.8	75	60	62.5	75	
group and 16				P2-F2A	1		P2-F2B		
females/dose group			81.3	81.3	100	80	75	93.8	
Stoup				P3-F3A			P3-F3B		
		Fertility	68.8	87.5	100 ^b	68.8	87.5	100 ^b	
Reliability: 2 (reliable with		index ^a		DITI		ic acid	D1 717		
restrictions)				P1-F1A			P1-F1B		
Two-year			62.5	87.5	81.3	60	87.5	75	
feeding study				P2-F2A	02.8	80	P2-F2B	93.8	
(<u>Study 4)</u>			81.3	93.8 P3-F3A	93.8	80	93.8 P3-F3B		
No guideline specified			68.8	100 ^b	87.5	68.8	93.8	93.8	
specified		^a Fertility in							
Rat (Sprague-		 ^a Fertility index: number of pregnancies/number of matings x 100. ^b Significantly higher than controls. 							
Dawley) male/female		1170 ppm boron (equivalent to 58.5 mg B/kg bw/day):							
		All paren female (1							
n = 35/sex/dose group with		males.							
70/sex/dose group		P0 males: males (8/							
as controls		on food in	ntake (d						
		significar P0 female		eased ov	ulation in	appro	x. half of	f the	
		examined	lovarie	s (data n	ot shown)). Redu	ced body	y weight	
		with no e statistical			ake (data	not sh	own, not	clear if	
		Study 4 t		r foodin	a study (rate).			
		Testes at					s, as sho	wn	
		below: Dose leve	1	0	5.9		17.5	58.5	
		(mg B/kg bw/day)	;						
		No. of animals		3/10	1/10		4/10	10/10	
		At 58.5 n	ng B/kg						
		degenerat and 24 m							
		findings,	the LO.	AEL for	fertility in	n rats v	vas set at	58.5 mg	
B/kg bw/ day and the NOAEL for fertility in rats was 17.5 mg B/kg bw/day.									
Standar	Test material					to 20	та D /I_		Vn -t -1
Study	Test material:	3000 ppn	n boric	acid (eq	uivalent	to 26 1	ng B/kg		Ku et al.

N/ - 41	Test such starses	Descrite	D. C
Method,	Test substance,	Results	Reference
guideline,	dose levels		
deviations if any,	duration, of exposure		
species, strain, sex, no/group ¹⁶	exposure		
	boric acid	hru(dou)t	1993
investigating the testicular toxicity	boric acid	bw/day): Mildly inhibited spormiotion (Grade 1 i.e. 25 50 %	1995
of boric acid		Mildly inhibited spermiation (Grade 1, i.e. $25 - 50$ % tubules at stages below the inhibited spermiation and stage	
(BA)	Purity: 99.99%	IX with retained spermatids, 0% tubules with germ cell	
(DA)		exfoliation and 0% atrophic tubules) by week 5 that	
No guideline		continued variably to week 9 (number of males affected	
specified	0, 3000, 4500,	not reported). This adverse effect was associated with a	
speemed	6000 and 9000	testis B level of $5 - 6 \mu g/g$.	
	ppm boric acid,	$\mu_{g/g}$.	
Rat (Fischer 344)	equivalent to 0,	4500 ppm boric acid (equivalent to 38 mg B/kg	
male	525, 788, 1050 and	bw/day):	
	1575 ppm boron	Severe and widespread inhibition of spermiation (Grade 2,	
	(0, 26, 38, 52 and	i.e. $>50\%$ tubules at stages below the inhibited	
n = 6/dose group	68 mg B/kg	spermiation, stage X and XI with retained spermatids,	
	bw/day),	<5% tubules with germ cell exfoliation and 0% atrophic	
Rats in control	respectively.	tubules) by week 2 which was maintained up to week 9,	
and 4500, 6000,		when germ cell exfoliation was also observed in <5% of	
and 9000 ppm BA	E	the tubules (number of males affected not reported). This	
dose groups (n =	Exposure: 9 weeks	adverse effect was associated with:	
96, above) were	(daily in feed)		
placed on control		- a testis B level of $8 - 9 \mu g/g$;	
NIH-31 pelleted		- a variable increase in testicular spermatid head count	
feed after 9 weeks		(TSHC) $(24\% - 62\%$ at week 2) and no statistically	
of exposure, and		significant changes in testis weight;	
recovery was		- a decrease in absolute epididymis weight $(10\% - 29\%)$	
assessed at 8-		and profound decrease in epididymal sperm count (ESC)	
week intervals for		(72% - 97%) during weeks $4 - 9$.	
up to 32 weeks		The severely inhibited spermiation at 4500 ppm was	
post treatment. Rats were given		resolved by 16 weeks post-treatment but areas of focal	
NIH-31 pelleted		atrophy that did not recover post treatment were detected.	
feed during the		anophy that did not recover post treatment were detected.	
post-treatment		6000 ppm boric acid (equivalent to 52 mg B/kg	
period to avoid		bw/day):	
dental		Initially, severe inhibition of spermiation (not specified if	
malocclusion		statistically significant, number of males affected not	
problems.		reported) appeared by week 2 which later progressed to	
-		severe atrophy (Grade 6, i.e. >95% atrophic tubules). The	
To assess testis		progression to testicular atrophy was dose-dependent, the	
lesion		rats reached atrophy by week 9. This adverse effect was	
development over		associated with:	
time (week $0-9$)		a tastis D lovel of 11 12 us (s)	
for each dose		- a testis B level of $11 - 12 \mu g/g$;	
group, lesions		- initially increased TSHC $(31\% - 51\%)$ reflecting the inhibited sparminition at weak 2:	
were assigned a		inhibited spermiation at week 2; - progressive and profound decreases in absolute testis	
numeric score between 0 and 6		weight $(12\% - 68\%)$ and TSHC $(16\% - 99\%)$;	
(histologic		- decreased absolute epididymis weight $(12\% - 57\%)$, and	
grading scheme),		decreased ESC (78% - 99%), reflecting the progression to	
depending on both		testicular atrophy during weeks $3 - 9$.	
the lesion		······································	
characteristics		No signs of post-treatment recovery from atrophy were	
(i.e. atrophic		observed.	
tubules, tubules			
with germ cell		9000 ppm boric acid (equivalent to 68 mg B/kg	
	1		L

Method,	Test substance,	Results	Reference
guideline,	dose levels	Kesuits	Kelerence
deviations if any,	duration, of		
species, strain,	exposure		
sex, no/group ¹⁶			
exfoliation, stages		bw/day):	
with retained		The adverse effects on male fertility at the highest dose	
spermatids,		level progressed similarly to the 6000 ppm dose level:	
tubules at stages		initially, severe inhibition of spermiation appeared by	
below the		week 2 (not specified if statistically significant, number of	
inhibited		males affected not reported) which later progressed to	
spermiation) and		severe atrophy (Grade 6, i.e. $> 95\%$ atrophic tubules). The	
percentage of		progression to testicular atrophy was dose- and time-	
tubules affected.		dependent, the rats reached atrophy by week 6. This	
		adverse effect was associated with:	
Daliah:11:4-11 2		a testia D level of 15 16 up/a	
Reliability: 2 (reliable with		 - a testis B level of 15 – 16 μg/g; - initially increased TSHC (31% – 51%) reflecting the 	
(reliable with restrictions)		inhibited spermiation at week 2;	
1050100005)		- progressive and profound decreases in absolute testis	
		weight $(12\% - 68\%)$ and TSHC $(16\% - 99\%)$;	
		- decreased absolute epididymis weight (12% - 57%) and	
		decreased ESC (78% - 99%), reflecting the progression to	
		testicular atrophy by week 6.	
		No signs of post-treatment recovery from atrophy were	
		observed.	
		Feed consumption and body weight gain	
		Mean (\pm SD) estimated feed consumptions	
		during weeks 6 and 7: 49.3 - 1.0,	
		$50.2 \pm 0.3, 49.2 \pm 2.6, 49.2 + 1.6, \text{ and } 44.0 \pm 2.1$ g/kg body weight/day for 0, 26, 38, 52 and 68 mg B/kg	
		bw/day, respectively. At 68 mg B/kg bw/day, a decrease	
		of 11% in feed consumption and a 16% reduced absolute	
		body weight (controls = 323 ± 6 [SD] g; 9000 ppm = 270	
		± 5 g) were observed.	
		No changes in body weight gain were observed for the	
		other dose groups, and no other signs of general toxicity	
		were reported.	
Assessing the	Test material:	After 4 days of exposure:	Treinen
development of	boric acid	The basal testosterone level was statistically significantly	and
the boric acid-	Durit and	(p<0.05) lower than controls (by 65%), and treated and	Chapin
induced	Purity: unknown	control animals after the hCG- or LHRH challenge. Boron	1991
testicular lesions	Deces/come + 0 1	levels had effectively reached steady state levels by day 4 and were not concentrated in the examined tissues.	
by light and electron	Doses/conc.: 0 and		
microscopy	9000 ppm w/w boric acid,	1/6 male rat that presented severely disrupted spermatogenesis and no epididymal sperm, was not	
meroscopy	equivalent to 0 and	included in the analyses.	
	1575 ppm B (0	increaced in the unury boo.	
No guideline	and 189 mg B/kg	Up to 7 days of exposure:	
specified	bw/day),	Inhibition of spermiation and cell sloughing/epithelial	
1	respectively.	disorganisation in approx. $5 - 30\%$ of stage IX tubules	
To determine if		appeared in 3/6 male rats. Widespread exfoliation of	
there was a		apparently viable germ cells and pachytene cell death in	
hormonal	Exposure: up to 4	stages VII and XIV appeared as exposure continued.	
component to the	weeks (in feed)	Statistically significant (p<0.05) decreased basal	
boric acid-		testosterone level (by 85%).	

Method,	Test substance,	Results	Reference
guideline,	dose levels	Kesuits	Reference
deviations if any,	duration, of		
species, strain,	exposure		
sex, no/group ¹⁶	•		
induced testicular	For the histology		
lesions, serum	study and serum	Up to 10 days of exposure:	
levels of basal	testosterone	Inhibited spermiation (>60% of tubules) in all stage IX and	
hCG- and LHRH-	analysis, the	X tubules was observed in all 6 males. Tubules of stage X,	
stimulated	animals were	XI and XII (100, 83, and 31%, respectively) contained ≥ 4	
testosterone levels	euthanised after 4,	condensed spermatid nuclei near the Sertoli cell basement	
were measured.	7, 10, 14, 21 and	membranes. Spermatocytes and round spermatids were	
For the tissue	28 days of dosing.	also seen in the lumina of approximately 10% of all the	
boron		tubules in 4/6 male rats. Statistically significant ($p<0.05$)	
concentrations,		decreased basal testosterone level (by 89%).	
the blood, liver, kidney,		Up to 14 days of exposure:	
epididymis and		Inhibited spermiation and peripheral spermatid nuclei	
testis were		(>60% of all tubules) were observed for all rats $(6/6)$.	
investigated.		Large, abnormal residual bodies were observed in several	
in estigate a		stage IX and X tubules. Decreased basal testosterone level	
Rat (Fischer 344),		(data not reported).	
male			
		Up to 21 days of exposure:	
		Inhibited spermiation and peripheral spermatid nuclei	
n = 6/time-point		(>60% of all tubules) were observed for all rats (6/6).	
(36 male rats in		Sloughed germ cells occluded the lumina in approx. 30-	
total) for administration of		50% of all tubules in all 6 rats. The number of stage IX –	
boric acid, and		XII tubules displaying abnormal residual bodies $(30 - 60)$ % of all tubules) was increased for all rats (6/6). Spermatid	
5/time-point (30		and spermatocyte cell death was also present in	
male rats in total)		approximately $5 - 30$ % of stage VII and XIV tubules.	
as controls		Decreased basal testosterone level (data not reported).	
		At 28 days of exposure:	
Reliability: 2		Inhibited spermiation and peripheral spermatid nuclei	
(reliable with		(>60% of all tubules) were observed for all rats (6/6).	
restrictions)		Advanced epithelial disorganization, cell exfoliation (in 70	
,		-90% of the tubules), luminal occlusion (60 $-80%$ of the	
		tubules), cell death $(30 - 50 \% \text{ of the tubules})$ which led to a significant loss of spermatocytes and spermatids from all	
		stage tubules, were observed for 6/6 rats. Statistically	
		significant ($p < 0.05$) decreased basal testosterone level (by	
		69%).	
		Body weights	
		Over the 28-day study period, the rats consumed approx.	
		$348.3 \pm 66.8 \text{ mg/kg/day}$ boric acid (mean \pm SD). At this	
		concentration, the treated animals gained less weight, at	
		day 28 the treated animals weighed 8% less (statistically	
		significant, p<0.05) than the controls (controls = 288 ± 4	
		g; boric acid = 265 ± 14 g). No other signs of systemic toxicity were reported.	
Reproductive	Test material:	LOAEL (F0) for fertility in mice: 1000 ppm boric acid	Fail et al.
assessment by	boric acid	(equivalent to 26.6 mg B/kg bw), based on statistically	1991
continuous	D is coord	significantly lower sperm motility	
breeding	Purity: >99%		
	Deses/cons.0	1000 ppm (equivalent to 26.6 mg B/kg):	
	Doses/conc.: 0,	<u>F0:</u> The fertility index for $1 - 4$ litters was 100%, and 84%	

Mathad	Test substance	Results	Reference
Method, guideline,	Test substance, dose levels	Kesuits	Kelerence
deviations if any,	duration, of		
species, strain,	exposure		
sex, no/group ¹⁶	chposure		
Performed	1000 ppm, 4500	for the fifth litter. The F0 males showed statistically	
according to the	ppm or 9000 ppm	significantly lower sperm motility than controls (i.e. $69 \pm$	
NTP's	equivalent to 0,	5% for treated mice vs. $78 \pm 3\%$ for the controls), in 19/19	
Reproductive	152, 636 and 1262	males.	
Assessment by	mg boric acid/kg	The histopathological exam did not reveal any significant	
Continuous	bw, equivalent to	changes for male mice; no histopathological results	
Breeding Protocol	0, 26.6, 111.3 and	reported for F0 female mice.	
	221 mg B/kg bw,		
Mouse (Swiss)	respectively.	4500 ppm (equivalent to 111.3 mg B/kg):	
male/female	F 07	<u>F0:</u> The number of females producing litters decreased	
n = 19/sex/dose	Exposure: 27	from 95% for the production of the first litter, to 85% for the second litter to 20% for the third litter to 5% for the	
groups	weeks (daily in feed)	the second litter, to 30% for the third litter, to 5% for the fourth and fifth litter. In the female mice, there were no	
groups	ieeu)	statistically significant changes on body weight, absolute	
Sperm		or relative uterus weight; and vaginal cytology revealed	
concentration was		normal cyclicity.	
calculated as		In the male mice, the following statistically significant	
sperm per mg		(p<0.05%) effects were reported, as compared to controls:	
caudal tissue x		- decreased mean sperm concentration (by approx. 72%);	
10^{3} , the		- decreased mean percentage of motile sperm (by approx.	
spermatogenic		32%);	
index was used as		- increased mean percentage of abnormal sperm (by	
a semiquantitative		approx. 439%);	
rating of cell		- decreased seminiferous tubular diameter (by approx. 32%);	
types present, and a quantitative		- decreased number of spermatids in stages VII and	
assessment of the		VIII/tubule (by approx. 50%);	
number of late		- decreased spermatogenic index (by approx. 28%);	
spermatids per		- decreased absolute testis weight (by approx. 51%);	
testis was		- decreased absolute epididymis weight (by approx. 21%);	
calculated as		- decreased prostate absolute weight (by approx. 20%).	
number of			
spermatids per		No statistically significant changes on body weight were	
gram of testis x		observed.	
10^4 .		The histopathological exam performed in F0 male mice	
Reliability: 2		revealed degenerative changes in the majority of the tubules, fewer germ cells that were not organised into the	
(reliable with		layered epithelium and few mature spermatozoa were	
restrictions)		observed (incidence not reported).	
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
		9000 ppm (equivalent to 221 mg B/kg):	
		F0: None of the F0 pairs was fertile.	
		In the male mice, the following statistically significant	
		(p<0.05%) effects were reported, as compared to controls:	
		- decreased mean sperm concentration (by approx. 95%),	
		12/15 males had no sperm;	
		- decreased seminiferous tubular diameter (by approx. 63%);	
		- no stage VII and VII spermatids/tubule (incidence not	
		reported);	
		- decreased number of spermatids/testis (x 10 ⁴) by approx.	
		65%;	
		- decreased absolute testis (by approx. 86%);	
		- decreased absolute epididymis weights (by approx. 34%).	

Method,	Test substance,	Results	Reference
guideline,	dose levels	Kesuits	Reference
deviations if any,	duration, of		
species, strain,	exposure		
sex, no/group ¹⁶			
		Histologic examination revealed marked seminiferous	
		tubular atrophy with many tubules per testis characterised	
		by an end-stage, Sertoli cell-only appearance in male rats	
		(100% incidence). No histopathological results reported for F0 female mice.	
		no instopatiological results reported for 10 remaie nice.	
		The absolute body weight in males was significantly	
		decreased (by approx. 16%; p<0.05). The average body	
		weight gain was significantly decreased as compared to	
		controls for both males and females (data not shown).	
According	Test material:	No information on general toxicity was available for any	Marat et
Assessment of the fertility of	boric acid	of the dose groups.	al. 2018
rats exposed to		or the dose groups.	al. 2010
boric acid during	Purity: unknown	1 mg B/kg bw /day	
spermatogenesis		The fertility index was not different from control (86%	
	0, 1 and 10 mg	versus 89% in controls).	
No guideline	B/kg bw/day	10 D/l L/l	
specified (conforms to	E cont	10 mg B/kg bw/day	
Rodent Dominant	Exposure: 60 days, daily oral gavage	Reduced fertility index (62.5% compared to 89% in	
Lethal Test)	Gaily Olai gavage	controls, unclear if statistically significantly different).	
		Increased pre-implantation loss (23.81% compared to	
Rats (white		2.69% in control, p≤0.05).	
outbred),			
n = 6 males/dose			
group			
Stoup			
Males were			
administered test			
substance during			
the entire			
spermatogenesis cycle. At the end			
of the exposure			
period, the males			
were mated with			
untreated females			
at a 1:1 ratio.			
Gestation was terminated at day			
20 and number of			
implantation sites,			
resorptions, and			
embryos on the			
uterine horns and			
the corpus luteum count in the			
ovaries were			
investigated.			
•			
The fertility index			
(FI) was calculated as a			
calculated as a			

Method,	Test substance, Results		Reference
guideline,	dose levels	Kesuits	Kelerence
deviations if any,	duration, of		
species, strain,	exposure		
sex, no/group ¹⁶	1		
ratio of the			
number of			
pregnant females			
to the number of			
mated females.			
In a parallel series			
of experiments,			
the ability of the			
test substance to			
induce mutations			
in germ and somatic cells was			
investigated after			
i.p administration			
of male rats and			
frequencies of			
dominant lethal			
mutations were			
also investigated			
using sequential			
mating intervals.			
Borax (disodium te	traborate decahydrate	e)	
Fertility	Test material:	After 30 days of exposure:	Lee et al.
assessment of	Borax (disodium	500 ppm borax (equivalent to 50 mg B/kg bw/day): No	1978
male rats	tetraborate	statistically significant changes in the body, epididymis or	
	decahydrate)	testis absolute weight, and no morphological changes	
No guideline		observed at the testicular histology examination.	
specified	Purity: unknown		
		<u>1000 ppm borax (equivalent to 100 mg B/kg bw/day)</u> :	
Rat (Sprague	$\frac{\text{Doses/conc.:}}{500} 0,$	Statistically significant (p <0.05) decreased absolute	
Dawley) male	500, 1000 and	epididymis weight (by approx. 19%), marked reduction of	
n = 18 males/dose	2000 ppm borax, equivalent to 0, 50,	spermatocytes, spermatids and mature spermatozoa (incidence not reported).	
group	100 and 200 mg	(incluence not reported).	
Stoup	B/kg bw/day,	2000 ppm borax (equivalent to 200 mg B/kg bw/day):	
At the end of the	respectively.	Statistically significant (p<0.05) decreased absolute	
30 and 60 days	1 7	epididymis weight (by approx. 30%), severe loss of	
exposure periods,	Exposure: 30 and	germinal elements and non-statistically significant loss in	
5 male rats from	60 days (daily in	tubular diameter (by approx. 15%).	
each dose group	diet)		
were serially		Serial mating: no statistically significant changes were	
mated with		observed at 50 mg B/kg bw/day. At 100 mg B/kg bw/day,	
untreated female		the pregnancy rates were significantly reduced during the first 2 much part tractment (by $220(+\pi/0.05)$	
rats, in order to		first 3 weeks post-treatment (by 33%; p< 0.05).	
assess fertility. Pregnancy rates		At 200 mg B/kg bw/day, the pregnancy rate was statistically significantly (p<0.05) reduced (by 100 %) up	
were calculated as		to 8 weeks after the termination of exposure, with a partial	
percentage of		recovery observed up to week 10 post-treatment.	
pregnant		receivery observed up to week to post-treatment.	
females/number		After 60 days of exposure:	
of vaginal plugs.		500 ppm borax (equivalent to 50 mg B/kg bw/day):	
of vaginal plugs.		<u>500 ppm borax (equivalent to 50 mg B/kg bw/day)</u> : No statistically significant changes in the body, epididymis	

Method,	Test substance,	Results	Reference
guideline,	Test substance, dose levels	Kesuits	Kelerence
deviations if any,	duration, of		
species, strain,	exposure		
sex, no/group ¹⁶	•		
(reliable with		(p<0.05) decrease (by approx. 16%) in seminiferous	
restrictions)		tubular diameter was observed, but no morphological	
		changes were observed at the testicular histology	
		examination.	
		1000 ppm horay (aquivalent to 100 mg P/kg hu/day)	
		1000 ppm borax (equivalent to 100 mg B/kg bw/day): Statistically significantly (p<0.05) decreased absolute	
		testis weight (by approx. 62%) and absolute epididymis	
		weight (by approx. 37%); most germinal elements were	
		absent (incidence not reported) and a statistically	
		significant decrease (by approx. 34%) in seminiferous	
		tubular diameter was observed.	
		2000 ppm horay (aquivalent to 200 mg R/kg hw/day);	
		2000 ppm borax (equivalent to 200 mg B/kg bw/day): Statistically significantly (p<0.05) decreased absolute	
		testis (by approx. 65%) and absolute epididymis weight	
		(by approx. 34%), a statistically significant decrease (by	
		approx. 38%) in seminiferous tubular diameter, and	
		complete germinal aplasia (incidence not reported) were	
		observed.	
		Testicular histology examination 32 weeks post-treatment showed persistent germinal aplasia (incidence not	
		reported).	
		A significant decrease in absolute liver weight at 100 and	
		200 mg B/kg bw/day as compared to controls, with no	
		liver histological changes was observed (by approx. 19%	
		and 25%, respectively; p<0.05).	
		A statistically significant ($p < 0.05$) dose-dependent increase in the mean plasma FSH concentration by 139%,	
		175% and 236% for the 500 ppm, 1000 ppm and 2000	
		ppm dose groups, respectively, was observed after 60 days	
		exposure.	
		<u>Serial mating</u> : the pregnancy rates at the mid-dose level	
		were significantly low during weeks $2 - 4$ post-treatment	
		(by approx. $80 - 100\%$), and the males from the highest dose groups were infertile throughout 12 weeks post-	
		treatment (and additional 20 weeks) of serial mating. No	
		statistically significant changes were observed at 50 mg/kg	
		bw/day.	
Barium chloride			
Sub-chronic oral	Test material:	Sub-chronic exposure results for rats:	Dietz et
toxicity study	barium chloride		al. 1992
and reproductive toxicity screen	Purity: 99.5%	No statistically significant changes in absolute body weight were reported for the 11.25, 45, 90 and 180 mg/kg	
study	2	bw/day, for either male or female rats.	
-	Sub-chronic oral		
No guideline	toxicity study:	4000 ppm (equivalent to 360 mg/kg bw/day):	
specified		Three of 10 males and 1 of 10 female rats died during the	
Dat (Eastar 244)	$\underline{\text{Doses/conc.}}: 0,$	last week of the study. Body weights of both sexes were	
Rat (Fischer 344) male/female	125, 500, 1000, 2000 and 4000	statistically significantly ($p < 0.05$) lower (by approx. 12% for malaes and approx. 9% for families) then controls	
maic/ iciliaic	2000 and 4000	for males, and approx. 9% for females) than controls.	
			l

Method	Test substance,	Results	Reference
Method, guideline,	dose levels	Kesuits	Kelefence
deviations if any,	duration, of		
species, strain,	exposure		
sex, no/group ¹⁶	caposure		
Mice (B6C3F1)	ppm barium	Kidney lesions observed in both males and females	
male/female	chloride dehydrate,	(incidence not reported).	
male/remale	equivalent to:	(incluence not reported).	
n = 10/sex/dose	equivalent to.	Sub-chronic exposure results for mice:	
group/species in	- for rats: 0, 11.25,		
the sub-chronic	45, 90, 180 and	No statistically significant changes in absolute body	
oral toxicity study	360 mg/kg bw/day,	weight were observed for the 18.75, 75, 150 and 300	
orar toxicity study	respectively;	mg/kg bw/day dose groups, for either male or female mice.	
n = 20/sex/dose	-for mice: 0, 18.75,	4000 ppm (equivalent to 600 mg/kg bw/day)	
group/species in	75, 150, 300 and		
the reproductive	600 mg/kg bw/day,	Six males and 7 female mice died on day 13 of the study.	
toxicity screening	respectively	Body weights of both sexes were statistically significantly	
study		(p < 0.05) lower (by approx. 30% for males, and approx.	
2	Exposure: 92 days	44% for females) than controls. Mild to marked toxic	
	(daily in drinking	nephrosis was observed in both males and females	
Differences when	water).	(incidence not reported).	
comparing to	Reproductive	Depundenting and fortility according to populate for rates	
OECD TG 421:	toxicity screening	<u>Reproductive and fertility assessment results for rats</u>:	
dosing only prior	study:	NOAEL for fertility impairment: 4000 ppm, equivalent to	
to mating, no		480 mg/kg bw/day	
individual animal	Doses/conc.: 0,	The pregnancy rate [§] at 4000 ppm was 65% (compared to	
data/tables	1000, 2000, and	40% in control) and the number of implants per pregnant	
provided,	4000 ppm barium	dam was significantly reduced (7.7 \pm 0.52 vs. 9.6 \pm 1.10	
histopathologic	chloride dehydrate	pups in controls, $p<0.05$). One dam from the highest dose	
examination and	for rats, equivalent	group died, the necropsy revealing 7 foetuses and one	
data on food	to 0, 120, 240 and	resorption site.	
consumption only	480 mg/kg bw/day,	[[§] The pregnancy rate was calculated as the number of	
provided for core study animals, no	respectively	pregnant females/number of confirmed matings x 100]	
humidity and no	0 500 1000 and		
data on stability	0, 500, 1000, and 2000 ppm barium	No effects were reported on vaginal cytology, epididymal	
of test substance	chloride for mice,	sperm count, sperm motility, sperm morphology, and testis	
in vehicle were	equivalent to 0, 90,	or epididymal weight up to 480 mg/kg bw/day (data not	
given. Only the	180 and 360 mg/kg	shown).	
average results of	bw/day,		
the controls and	respectively	Reproductive and fertility assessment results for mice:	
the high dose	respectively	The pregnancy rates ranged from $55 - 70\%$ (the pregnancy	
groups of each	Exposure: The	rates for the controls were approx. 55%; data not shown)	
species were	males were	for all dose levels.	
available.	exposed for 60		
	days and the	No effects were reported on vaginal cytology, epididymal	
	females for 30	sperm count, sperm motility, sperm morphology, and testis	
Reliability: 2	days (daily in	or epididymal weight up to 360 mg/kg bw/day (data not	
(reliable with	drinking water).	shown). Maternal weight gain during pregnancy was	
restrictions) ¹⁷	0	comparable to controls for all dose groups (data not	
,		shown).	

Table 18: Summary table of human data on adverse effects on sexual function	and fertility
---	---------------

Туре	of	Test substance	Relevant information about	Observations	Reference
data/report			the study (as applicable)		

 $^{^{17}}$ The reliability score for this study is according to the publically disseminated REACH Registration dossier for barium chloride, available at <u>https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered-dossier/15037/7/9/2</u>

Type of data/report	Test substance	Relevant information about the study (as applicable)	Observations	Reference
Boric acid and bord	ate salts			
Study type: cohort study (retrospective) Type of population: occupational Questionnaire, atmosphere measurement, boron level determination in blood, semen and urine, and determination of semen and sperm parameters.	The study investigated boron- occupational exposure of workers from a borate-processing plant (Bandirma) and a boron- mining plant (Bigadic Boron Works), both located in Turkey.	HYPOTHESIS TESTED: The global hypothesis was that the means of the five groups are equal (Kruskal- Wallis test). METHOD OF DATA COLLECTION Details: A questionnaire survey was carried out to gather information on demographic data and possible confounding variables (age, duration of employment, pesticide application, smoking and alcohol consumption). As lunch was regularly provided for all employees in the central cafeteria, which was located within the boric acid production zone, drinking	Bandirma: Boron concentrations in the drinking water samples taken from the central cafeteria ranged between 16.60 and 45.02 mg B/L. Bigadic: The workers who participated in the study were employed at the Bigadic Boron Works and residing in Iskele or Osmanca. Boron concentrations in the drinking water (environmentally) of Iskele were very high, i.e. around 18 mg B/L. Boron concentrations in environmental air samples from the residential areas of Osmanca and Iskele	Duydu et al. 2018a
addressed: toxicity to reproduction/fertil ity		water and meal samples were taken also from there. <u>- Air sampling:</u> Bandirma: static air sampling was performed at 5 different stations (central cafeteria/garage, mechanical workshop, steam power plant, infirmary and acid production plant), representing the whole sampling area. Static air sampling was also performed at one air sampling station in downtown Bandirma.	were < LOQ (i.e. 0.9 μ g/filter of air samples). <u>DBE levels (mg B/day,</u> <u>Mean ± SD (range)):</u> Low exposure group: 15.07 ± 10.50 (3.61– 35.61); Medium exposure group: 19.85 ± 15.06 (4.10– 47.18); High exposure group: 26.84 ± 15.03 (3.84– 55.10); Extreme exposure group: 47.17 ± 17.47 (7.95– 106.8).	
		Bigadic : personal air sampling was performed in workers ($n = 65$) working in the high exposure (packaging unit) areas. Static air sampling was performed for the rest of the workers ($n = 45$). Static air sampling was also performed in the village centres of Osmanca and Iskele at two locations, representative of both villages. Both, personal air sampling and static air	Blood boron levels (ng B/g blood, Mean \pm SD (range)): Low exposure group: 74.03 \pm 28.16 (23.80– 99.37); Medium exposure group: 126.6 \pm 14.41 (102– 149.8); High exposure group: 269.2 \pm 73.81 (151– 391.9); Extreme exposure group: 570.6 \pm 160.1 (402.5–	

Type data/report	of	Test substance	Relevant information about the study (as applicable)	Observations	Reference
			sampling, were performed	1100).	
			using IOM samplers and		
			personal air sampling pumps	Semen boron levels (ng	
			(SKC, AirCheck 2000). The	$\frac{B/g}{company}$ Macon + SD	
			flow rate was 2 L/min, and the sampling time was 8 h.	$\frac{\text{semen, Mean} \pm \text{SD}}{(\text{range})):}$	
			SKC	Low exposure group:	
			(GLA-5000), 5 µm, 25 mm	$475.9 \pm 639.4 (110.6-$	
			filters were used to sample	2455);	
			boron compounds within	Medium exposure group:	
			inhalable dust.	$1019 \pm 1082 (346.7 - 3863);$	
			- Biological sampling:	High exposure group:	
			performed at the day at which	1158 ± 1449 (179.4–	
			the workers completed their	10543);	
			work shift periods (the working programme of the	Extreme exposure group: 1772 ± 1791 (188.7-	
			enterprise consisted of three work shifts, of 8h each).	1772 ± 1791 (188.7- 18072);	
			Peripheral blood samples	In general, the boron	
			were drawn from veins of the	concentrations in the	
			volunteers into appropriate	biological fluids were	
			vacutainer tubes. The blood	very much paralleled by	
			samples in heparin tubes were	the levels of calculated	
			stored at 4 °C for subsequent	daily boron exposure	
			determination of boron. The	(DBE). The correlations	
			tubes containing clot	between blood boron-	
			activator (BD vacutainer) were used to determine	DBE, blood boron-urine boron and blood boron-	
			follicle-stimulating hormone	semen boron levels were	
			(FSH), luteinizing hormone	all statistically significant	
			(LH) and total testosterone	(p < 0.01). The mean	
			levels, using Immulite 2000	semen boron	
			Immunoassay. The semen	concentrations of the	
			samplings and analysis were	workers were 6.4, 8.0, 4.3	
			in accordance with the	and 3.1 times higher than	
			recommendations of World	the mean blood boron	
			Health Organization (WHO	concentrations of workers	
			2010). Sperm concentration,	classified in low, medium,	
			motility and morphology parameters were determined	high and extreme exposure groups.	
			in fresh semen samples using	exposure groups.	
			SQA-V Gold Sperm Quality	Sperm parameters:	
			Analyzer. Spot urine samples	Sperm quality parameters	
			(post-shift) were collected in	(and reproductive	
			polypropylene containers and	hormone levels) were	
			stored at -20 °C for	compared between the	
			subsequent determination of	differently exposed	
			boron and creatinine	groups of workers to	
			(Cayman chemical).	identify possible	
			Analysis of dust collected in cassettes by gravimetric and	reproductive effects attributable to boron	
			instrumental methods, boron	exposure. No statistically	
			determination in body fluids	significant ($p > 0.05$)	
			was performed with	differences were observed	
			inductively coupled plasma	in pairwise comparisons	
			optical emission spectrometry	of the exposure groups for	
			and inductively coupled	the following parameters:	

Type data/report	of	Test substance	Relevant information about the study (as applicable)	Observations	Reference
			plasma mass spectrometry.	sperm concentration and	
				sperm morphology	
			STUDY PERIOD:	parameters	
			2014 - 2017	(sperm counts, motile	
			STUDY POPULATION	sperm, progressively motile sperm	
			- Total population: 212	concentrations, functional	
			workers from both Bandirma	sperm, total sperm	
			and Bigadic, classified as	number, total motile	
			follows:	sperm, total progressive	
			Low exposure group: blood	motile sperm, total	
			boron concentrations < 100	functional sperm, total number of	
			ng B/g blood were $(n = 12)$;		
			Medium exposure group: with blood boron	morphologically normal sperm, percentage of	
			concentrations between 100 –	morphologically normal	
			150 ng B/g blood (n = 17);	sperm forms).	
			High exposure group: with	Sperm rormo).	
			blood	Sperm motility	
			boron concentrations between	parameters:	
			150 – 400 ng B/g blood	The mean values of total	
			(n = 85);	motility, progressive	
			Extreme exposure group:	motility, non-progressive	
			with blood boron	motility, immotility,	
			concentrations $\geq 400 \text{ ng B/g}$	velocity, and sperm	
			blood ($n = 98$).	motility	
				index were compared	
			- Age and sex of the study	between the low, medium,	
			<u>population (mean \pm SD</u>	high and extreme	
			$(\underline{\text{range}}))$:	exposure groups, and no statistically significant	
			Low exposure group $(n = 12)$: 33.75 ± 7.85 (24–46), males;	difference was observed	
			Medium exposure group (n	(p > 0.05) in pairwise	
			$=17$): 35.71 \pm 6.75 (27–48),	$\phi > 0.05$) in pair wise comparisons of the	
			males; $(27 - 10)$;	exposure groups. The	
			High exposure group $(n =$	mean values of these	
			85): 34.24 ± 6.20 (22–49),	parameters were again	
			males;	well above their reference	
			Extreme exposure group (n	values (i.e. according to	
			=98): 36.69 ± 6.52 (23–50),	WHO, the reference	
			males.	values for "total motility"	
				and "progressive motility"	
			<u>-Duration of employment</u>	are $\geq 40\%$ and $\geq 32\%$,	
			$(years, mean \pm SD (range)):$	respectively).	
			Low exposure group: 4.79 ± 2.37 (2.5–11,0);	Hormone lovale	
			Medium exposure group:	Hormone levels: FSH, LH and total (free	
			$9.06 \pm 7.31 \ (1-22);$	and protein-bound)	
			High exposure group: $6.33 \pm$	testosterone	
			2.98 (1–15);	concentrations were	
			Extreme exposure group:	determined in the blood	
			6.28 ± 4.76 (1–27).	samples: no statistically	
				significant differences	
			- Selection criteria:	(p>0.05) of mean FSH,	
			Bandirma: Part of the	LH and total testosterone	
			workers employed at the	concentrations between	
			Bandirma	the low, medium, high	
			boric acid production zone	and extreme exposure	

Type of data/report	f Test substance	Relevant information about the study (as applicable)	Observations	Reference
		had been enrolled in the previous "Boron Project I" (Duydu et al. 2011), thus, for the current "Boron Project II" only workers who were not involved in the previous project, were selected. In the current (second) project, 102 workers participated from acid production facilities, steam power plant, mechanical workshop, garage, steelyard, demineralized water production unit, construction units and central cafeteria (cooks), but not from the boric acid production facilities. Bigadic : In total, 110 workers participated in the study, employed at the Bigadic Boron Works and residing in Iskele or Osmanca (these villages are located near the boron deposits). MEASURED PARAMETERS: -DBE (daily boron exposure), boron concentrations in biological fluids (i.e. blood, urine, semen), sperm parameters (i.e. concentration, motile sperm concentration, progressively motile sperm concentration, functional sperm number, total motile sperm number, total progressively motile sperm number, total functional sperm, total morphologically normal sperm, morphologically normal forms), sperm motility parameters (i.e. total motility, progressive motility, immotility, velocity, sperm motility index), and FSH, LH and total testosterone levels.	groups, were found. Statistically significant correlations between blood boron-FSH, blood boron-LH and blood boron-total testosterone concentrations were not apparent (p > 0.05). <u>Conclusions:</u> Boron-mediated adverse effects on semen parameters and reproductive hormone levels in males have not been observed under extreme exposure conditions.	
Study type: cohort study (retrospective)	The study investigated boron- environmental and	HYPOTHESIS TESTED: The null hypothesis for each biologic fluid was that the	The high boron contamination (9.47±0.18 mg B/L) of water sources	Duydu et al. 2011

Type data/report	of Test substance	Relevant information about the study (as applicable)	Observations	Reference
	occupational exposure (i.e. boric	means of the respective four groups are equal.	for cafeteria and infirmary was not anticipated in the	Başaran et al. 2012
Type of	acid and borax) of	groups are equal.	planning phase of the	al. 2012
population:	workers from a	METHOD OF DATA	study. This "background"	
occupational.	borate-processing	COLLECTION	exposure lead to relatively	
Questionnaire,	plant (Bandirma),	Details:	high exposure of the	
atmosphere	located in Turkey.	- Personal sampling:	control group.	
measurement,	located in Turkey.	exposed group only, personal	control group.	
boron level		air sampler (SKC, AirCheck	Total average exposure of	
determination in		2000), flow rate 2 L/min,	occupationally exposure	
blood, semen and		sampling time 8 hours; low-	exposed workers: $12.08 \pm$	
urine, and		ash PVC filters (SKC, 5 37	6.18 mg boron/day).	
determination of		mm, preweighed) and		
semen and sperm		SureSeal cassettes (SKC, 37	Total average exposure of	
parameters.		mm).Analysis of dust	control workers: 5.83	
Parametersi		collected in cassettes by	± 1.71 mg boron/day.	
		gravimetric and instrumental		
Endpoints		methods (Selin B (2010)	The average daily boron	
addressed:		Boron Determination in Body	exposure (DBE, in mg	
toxicity to		Fluids by Inductively	B/d) calculated for the	
reproduction/fert	11	Coupled Plasma Optical	reclassified groups are:	
ity.		Emission Spectrometry and		
5		Inductively Coupled Plasma	Control 4.68 ± 1.63	
		Mass Spectrometry.	Low exposure 7.39 ± 3.97	
		-	Medium 11.02 ± 4.61	
		- Area air sampling: control	High 14.45 ± 6.57	
		group only: same devices and	 Mean calculated daily 	
		parameters were used as for	boron exposure levels	
		the personal sampling but the	(DBE): significantly	
		devices were not carried by	higher in exposure groups	
		individuals, but used	than in the new control	
		statically, to determine an	group.	
		average value for the control		
		workers.	Exposure to boron:	
			• Restricted to the tap	
		Biological sampling: taken at	water in the infirmary and	
		the end of a work shift; no	the cafeteria of the	
		samples taken on the first	company (oral) and to the	
		working day of the week or	atmosphere in the boron	
		shift period; workers were informed of the importance to	production sites (inhalation).	
		avoid a possible	• The mean levels of	
		contamination (sampling after	inhaled boron (mg/8 h)	
		showering and changing of	$0.23 \pm 0.79, 1.15 \pm 3.14,$	
		clothes).	1.47 ± 2.69 , and $2.58 \pm$	
			4.96 in control, low,	
		STUDY PERIOD:	medium and high	
		not described in detail,	exposure groups	
		exposure periods (years	respectively. Medium and	
		employed, boron blood level	high exposure group	
		based groups):	significantly higher than in the control group	
		Control 15.30 + 8.63	In the control group	
		Low exposure $16.85 + 7.06$	Boron levels in biological	
		Medium 17.21 + 6.77	fluids:	
		High $13.96 + 8.04$	• Mean urine boron levels:	
			$2.59 \pm 1.32, 5.01 \pm 2.07,$	

Type of data/report	Test substance	Relevant information about the study (as applicable)	Observations	Reference
		 <u>Total population</u> (Total no. of persons in cohort from which the subjects were drawn): exposed: 428 workers, 102 participated: boric acid production workers (n=57), borax (disodium tetraborate decahydrate) production workers (n=31), sodium perborate production unit workers (n=5), boric acid plus borax (disodium tetraborate decahydrate) production workers (n=5), laboratory workers (n=2), a storage worker (n=1), a mechanic technician (n=1) controls: 432 workers, acid production plant workers (n=28), steam power plant workers (n=17), demineralized water production (DWP) unit workers (n=2), energy suppliers (n=11), mechanical workshop workers (n=2), construction service workers (n=3), laboratory technicians (n=3), and office workers (n=3), and office workers (n=3). <u>Selection criteria:</u> original groups: exposed: all married workers of the plants described above, wishing to participate, were enrolled. Controls: probably matched for age and years of employment (and possibly additional parameters), not described in detail boron blood level based groups: Exposure groups n (204) Reclassification (ng boron/g blood) 	 5.13 mg/g creat. In control, low, median and high exposure groups. Significantly higher in exposure groups than in the new control group. Mean blood boron (ng/g) levels: < 48.5, 72.94 ± 15.43, 121.68 ± 15.62, and 223.89 ± 69.49 in control, low, med and high exposure groups, respectively. Calculated DBE levels: positively correlated with the blood boron concentrations of the workers (Pearson corr. Coeff.: 0.635). Urine boron concentrations: positively correlated with the blood boron concentrations of the workers (Pearson corr. Coeff.: 0.635). Urine boron concentrations of the workers (Pearson corr. Coeff.: 0.633). Semen boron concentrations of the workers (Pearson corr. Coeff.: 0.633). Semen boron concentrations (ng/g): 807.92 ± 1625.58, 1422.07 ± 1939.03, 1482.19 ± 1410.71 and 1875.68.2255.07 ± 2255.07 in control, low, med and high exposure groups. Semen boron concentrations in exposure groups vs. new control group significantly different; the dose response trend was not significant, variations within groups were great. Correlation between 	
		New control group 49 <loq (48.5) Low exposure group 72 >LOQ-100 Medium exposure group 44 >100-150</loq 	semen boron concentration and blood boron concentration: very low (Pearson corr. Coeff.: 0.222).	
		High-exposure group 39 >150 Significant background	Hormone levels: • no significant differences between	

Type data/report	of	Test substance	Relevant information about the study (as applicable)	Observations	Reference
			exposure to boron via the diet	groups, except for LH,	
			prepared in the same cafeteria	mid dose vs. high dose.	
			for both groups made a		
			regrouping necessary which	• Very weak correlation	
			was based on the blood boron	between blood boron concentration and	
			levels. All participating workers were re-classified	hormone levels (FSH:	
			both according to their	Pearson corr. Coeff:	
			calculated daily boron	0.143; LH: Pearson corr.	
			exposure levels and to the	Coeff: 0.164; total	
			blood boron levels. For the	testosterone level: -	
			re-classification of dose	0.053).	
			groups blood boron levels		
			published in recent	• No statistical significant	
			epidemiological studies were taken into account. Workers	difference in testosterone levels between new	
			with a blood boron	control group and	
			concentration below the LOQ	exposure groups.	
			were combined to form the		
			new control group.	Semen and sperm	
			- Total number of subjects	parameters (including	
			participating in study: 204	morphology and DNA	
			Say/aga/maga; malag original	integrity testes):	
			<u>- Sex/age/race</u> : males original groups:	• No significant difference in parameter tested	
			Exposed: 42.62 ± 4.76	between the exposure	
			(range: 28-50) years,	groups and the new	
			Caucasian;	control group.	
			Controls: 41.75 ± 6.29	• Correspondingly only a	
			(range: 23-53) years,	weak correlation between	
			Caucasian.	the percentages of the	
			- Smoker/non-smoker: not	normal morphology and	
			reported	blood boron levels.	
			reported		
			- Total number of subjects at	• Only weak correlation	
			end of study: 204	between inhaled boron (mg/8 h) and blood boron	
				(0.279), inhaled boron–	
			- Matching criteria: not	semen boron (0.185) , and	
			reported, probably age and	inhaled boron-urine	
			years of employment (and possibly additional	boron (0.106) levels.	
			parameters)	D	
			P	• Boron effects on semen	
			COMPARISON	parameters, reproductive hormone levels, or DNA	
			POPULATION	integrity in sperm cells is	
			- Type: Control group	absent. No significant	
			- Details: The control group	dose-dependent	
			was defined as the group which had blood boron levels	relationship between	
			below the LOQ (level of	reproductive toxicity	
			quantification).	biomarkers and blood	
			-	boron concentration. The	
			HEALTH EFFECTS	relatively extreme boron	
			STUDIED -DBE and blood boron	exposure conditions did not result in blood boron	
			concentrations effects on:	concentrations above	
			Sperm concentration	considered safe.	

Type of data/report	Test substance	Relevant information about the study (as applicable)	Observations	Reference
		parameters, motility parameters of sperm cells, sperm morphology parameters, DNA integrity with COMET assay, hormone levels (FSH, LH, total testosterone) and total PSA.	The PSA level was not statistically significantly different when groups are compared. Conclusions: - Due to the background exposure via drinking water no clear relation could be found between inhalation exposure and boron levels in biological fluids. - Blood and urine boron levels increased steadily with rising DBE, while semen boron levels failed to follow a steady trend. - Variation in semen boron levels was high. - Boron is accumulated in semen and the concentration factor is the highest at the lowest exposure. - Adverse effects in hormone levels were absent when exposure groups are compared to the new control group. - For any of the semen parameters, a statistically significant difference was not seen between the new control group and exposure groups.	
Study type: cohort study (retrospective) Type of population: general. Interview Endpoints addressed: toxicity to reproduction / fertility.	The study investigated boron- environmental exposure of residents from 5 villages located near the borate- processing plant Bigadic, Balikesir county, Turkey.	HYPOTHESIS TESTED: Relationships between elevated boron intake and fertility were sought by comparing reproduction in the residents of two Turkish villages with high levels of boron in their drinking water (one with 8.5 to 29 mg B/L and the other with 2.05 to 2.5 mg B/L), with three nearby villages with more typical lower boron levels (0.03 to 0.45 mg B/L). The two high boron villages were designated as Region I, and the three villages with lower boron in the drinking water were designated Region II. In	In high boron areas, the average concentrations ranged from 0.7-29.0 mg B/L. In other lower boron areas 0.05- 0.45 mg B/L. Drinking water in 5 supplies from the very low control area of Camlidere had levels <0.1 mg B/L. In the high boron exposure region the infertility rate was 3.17 % in the probands and 3.0 % averaged over 3 generations. In the very low exposure control area	Sayli et al. 1998

Type data/report	of	Test substance	Relevant information about the study (as applicable)	Observations	Reference
			addition to exposure to elevated boron in drinking water, 28.3 % of the probands in Region I were employed in borate mining or processing, whereas in Region II, 11.7 % were so employed. The data on fertility from these two populations was also compared with that from an area with a very low boron concentration in drinking water and no occupational exposure, and also from data for the whole Turkish population.	infertility was 4.48 %, and in the general Turkish population was 3.84 %. No difference in fertility was observed between 399 men with occupational exposure to boron, and 222 men with similar occupations but not exposed to boron. It was concluded that within the limits of the study, there was no evidence that boron interfered with human fertility and reproduction.	
			STUDY POPULATION <u>- Total population</u> : The group with the high boron exposures in Regions I and II comprised 927 probands and by the use of a pedigree technique covering three generations, fertility data on 5934 marriages were investigated. <u>- Selection criteria</u> : Relationships between elevated boron intake and fertility were sought by comparing reproduction in the residents of two Turkish villages with high levels of boron in their drinking water (one with 8.5 to 29 mg B/L and the other with 2.05 to 2.5 mg B/L), with three nearby villages with more typical lower boron levels (0.03 to 0.45 mg B/L). The two high boron villages were designated as Region I, and the three villages with lower boron in the drinking water were designated Region II. In addition to exposure to elevated boron in drinking water, 28.3 % of the probands in Region I were employed in borate mining or processing, whereas in Region II, 11.7 % were so employed. <u>-Sex/age/race</u> : Males and		
			<u>-sex/age/race:</u> Males and females; 40 % of the probands were 30-39 y; 35 % 40-60 y; and 15 % <		

Type of data/report	Test substance	Relevant information about the study (as applicable)	Observations	Reference
		30 y <u>-Smoker/non-smoker:</u> Smokers and non-smokers COMPARISON POPULATION		
		<u>- Type:</u> Other comparison group: The data on fertility from the study populations was also compared with that from an area with a very low boron concentration in drinking water and no occupational exposure, and also from data for the whole Turkish population. National population of Turkey 49,856 randomly chosen families. The regional population of Camlidere (relatively boron free soils) was 625 families, covering three generations.		
Study type: cohort study (retrospective) Type of population: occupational Questionnaire	The study investigated boron- occupational exposure (i.e. boric acid and borax) of workers from a borate-processing plant (Bandirma), located in Turkey.	METHOD OF DATA COLLECTION - Details : First phase: The questionnaire covered marital status and childbearing properties of the proband, and included the age at marriage, its duration, the period of first conception, the number of pregnancies, births, foetal losses and congenital malformations, and the number and sex of children both alive and deceased. No physical examination was conducted but medical records if available were recorded.	At the first phase of the investigation, 191 workers were interviewed. Among these there were six infertiles of the primary type with a rate of 3.1% . Boron-unrelated infertile couples among sibs were found to be $2.6 - 3.6 \%$ and 3.2% for three-generation marriages – none being higher than those revealed in different sets of controls. In the second stage of work, computerised files of all workers of the facility and all employees of the general	Sayli 2003
		Second phase: Computerised individual files of all workers as well as all general management people were checked without interview.	management sharing the same location were checked without an interview. Twenty-four subjects (3.4 %) out of 712 workers were childless versus 2.7	
		SETTING: Borates plant, prior to or immediately after an 8 h shift.	% among 108 employees and 2.2 % among 91 workers of a distantly located acid plant of the same complex. The	
		STUDY POPULATION - Total number of subjects participating in study: Phase 1: 191	differences were not significant. 94.2 % of probands had at least 1 living child at the	

Type of data/report	Test substance	Relevant information about the study (as applicable)	Observations	Reference
		Phase 2: 712	time of inquiry, including one widow and one separated. 307 children were born to proband families of which 50.1 % were males and 49.9 % females, all alive at the time of the investigation, with a sex ratio of 1.0. Nine males and 6 female infants were described as deceased early in life. There were 1.7 alive and 0.1 deceased offspring per family. Of 119 interviewed, 32.5 % had 1 child, 56.6 % had 2 children and 8.8 % had 3 children. The remaining 2.3 % had 4 – 7 children. No discussion of foetal losses or congenital malformations were included.	
Cross-sectional descriptive epidemiology study Endpoints addressed: toxicity to reproduction / fertility The study was based on interviews with participants who had occupational exposure to boron and a comparison group selected from an environment without significant exposure to boron.	The study investigated occupational boron-exposure of workers from boron mines and processing plants located in the city of Kuandian, China.	This article described the lifestyle patterns of boron mining and processing workers (N = 936) and a comparison group (N = 251) in Northeast China, and explores relationships between boron exposure and reproductive health. An English version of an interview guide addressing areas of work and lifestyle relevant to boron exposure and metabolism was developed by an occupational health research team, translated to Chinese, and translated back, for clarity. Modifications incorporated suggestions from local community advisory board and boron industry workers; the translation-back translation process was reapplied and cultural settings and semantic equivalence was attained. The environmental boron exposure for the boron works (mean) and the comparison	34 % of boron workers reported eating in the contaminated work areas. Nearly all boron workers (99 %) showered or bathed after work although approximately 10 % redressed in their contaminated clothes. Reproductive health outcomes were explored, including delayed pregnancy, multiple births, spontaneous miscarriages, induced abortions, stillbirths and unusual male:female offspring. On average, boron workers fathered nearly 2.0 pregnancies compared with 2.1 pregnancies in the control group (P = 0.6). Of the self-reported pregnancies fathered by boron workers, an average of 1.3 resulted in livebirths, compared to an	Chang et al. 2006

Type of data/report	Test substance	Relevant information about the study (as applicable)	Observations	Reference
		group (mean) were 2.6 – 3.8 mg/L for boron workers and 0.005 – 0.67 mg/L for the comparison group in surface water; 1.2 – 25.1 mg/L in boron workers well water and 0.002 – 0.67 mg/L for the comparison group's well water.	average of 1.4 for the comparison group (P = 0.3). A significant difference existed between groups in delay in pregnancy, defined as the inability to conceive within 1 year of desiring a child, with boron workers experiencing greater delays. However in logistic regression models adjusting for age, education, race, tobacco, alcohol and soybean consumption the difference was no longer statistically significant (P = 0.11) with an odds ratio of 1.7 for boron workers compared to the control group (95 % confidence interval, 0.09 to 3.5).	
Cohort study (retrospective) Endpoints addressed: toxicity to reproduction / fertility. Interview / Questionnaire / Record review	The study investigated occupational boron-exposure of workers from a sodium borates mining and production facility located in the Mojave Desert, California.	METHOD OF DATA COLLECTION The fertility data were obtained primarily by self administered questionnaire, and a section of the group by telephone interview. A 10 % sample of questionnaires was checked against the relevant medical insurance records. The work and exposure data were provided from company records. STUDY POPULATION <u>- Selection criteria:</u> All male employees at the U.S. Borax mine and production facility in Southern California with more than 6 months service were invited to participate in the study. <u>- Total number of subjects participating in study</u> : Of the 753 eligible male employees with more than 6 months service, 542 (72 %) participated. The demographic data, length of employment, age and year at hire and medical insurance records of the non-	There was a highly significant excess of offspring fathered by the male employees at the mine and production facility (529 observed births compared with 466.6 expected). A statistically significant excess in the standardised birth ratio (SBR) of 113, significant at p < 0.01. The SBR for the workers with 'low' (< 3 mg/m3) exposures was not different from the SBR of those with 'medium' (3 – 8 mg/m3) and 'high' (> 8 mg/m3) exposures, and both exceeded 100. There was no evidence of a relation between exposure and this excess of offspring, nor were there any temporal differences during the more than 30 year period of observation. The SBR was also evaluated in 5 year periods from 1950- 1990 and in every period	Whorton et al. 1994a Whorton et al. 1994b

Type o data/report	of	Test substance	Relevant information about the study (as applicable)	Observations	Reference
			participants and the participants were compared and no significant differences were found.	the SBR was greater than 100. 9% of workers tried	
			- Sex/age/race: Males; wide range with average duration	unsuccessfully to conceive for more than	
			of employment in the facility of 16 years; race not specified <u>- Smoker/non-smoker:</u> Smokers and non-smokers.	one year, which compares with the national average of 15 % of the adult population.	
			EXPOSURE The range of exposure in one year was 2 to 35.7 mg/m ³ (sodium borates). Based on an average of 23.2 mg/m ³ , the authors calculated the average exposure to borate dusts to be 203 mg/day assuming a 7 hour day and a respiratory volume of 8.75 m ³ (based on 10 m ³ for 8 hours). They assumed an average or usual boron content of 14% of the dust which, for the high exposure group, is equivalent to a mean of 28.4 mg B/d or 0.4 mg B/kg/d for	An excess in the percentage of female offspring (52.7 % compared with 48.8 % expected) were fathered by these male employees, this increase was not statistically significant, and was not due to a deficit of boys since 249 were observed compared with 238 expected. Thus, there was an excess of 11 boys and 51 girls. There was no evidence of an exposure relationship to sodium borate exposures	
			a 70 kg worker. The average exposure for the highest exposure group was 28.4 mg B/day (approximately 0.4 mg B/kg bw/day) for two or more	of the fathers and the excess of female offspring, nor were there any temporal differences. There was an inverse	
			years. The average duration of exposure was 16 years. COMPARISON	relationship between the increase percentage of female offspring and the	
			POPULATION - Type: No specific local control group was studied,	sodium borate exposures of their fathers.	
			but the results expressed as the Standardised Birth Ratio (SBR) were compared with the SBR for the general US		
			population adjusted for maternal age, parity, race and calendar year.		

Table 19: Summary table of other studies relevant for toxicity on sexual function and fertility

J	Test substance,	Relevant about the applicable)	information study (as	Observations	Reference			
No other relevant studies for adverse effects on sexual function and fertility were available								

10.10.2 Short summary and overall relevance of the provided information on adverse effects on sexual function and fertility

10.10.2.1 Animal studies

Data on barium diboron tetraoxide

90-day oral repeated dose toxicity study (Study report, 1993a)

In a repeated dose toxicity study (90-day oral study, EPA guideline) rats (10/sex/dose) were administered 0, 1000, 5000 and 10 000 ppm barium diboron tetraoxide in feed (equivalent to 0, 6.3, 31.4 and 63.6 mg B/kg bw/day in males and 0, 7.2, 36.5 and 71.4 mg B/kg bw/day in females, respectively). The histopathology examination was performed only for the controls and high-dose males and the following effects on the male reproductive system were reported at 63.6 mg B/kg bw/day: absence of spermatocytes in the tubules of the epididymides (90%), increased incidence (100%) of severe aspermatogenesis, increased incidence of small and soft testes (90% and 70%, respectively, as compared to 0% in controls), and significantly decreased absolute and relative weight of testes (by approx. 61% and 57%, respectively; p<0.05). The organ weights of ovaries or uteri for the females in the high dose group were not reported.

In the high dose group (63.6 mg B/kg bw/day in males and 71.4 mg B/kg bw/day in females), the final body weight for both males and females was significantly decreased (by 10% as compared to controls; p<0.05). At the mid-dose level (equivalent to 34.4 mg B/kg bw/day for males and 36.5 mg B/kg bw/day for females), a significant decrease in body weight gain for females (by 14%; p<0.05) during weeks 0-8 and 0-12 of treatment, and a significant increase in absolute brain weight in males (by approx. 6%; p<0.05) were seen. At 63.6 mg B/kg bw/day, significantly decreased haematology parameters were reported for both males and females: haemoglobin (by 7% in males and 9% in females; p<0.05), haematocrit (by 7% in males and 10% in females) and RBC count only in males (by 9%; p<0.05). These observed effects were considered treatment-related. Two male rats were euthanized *in extremis* at the highest dose level. One male was hypoactive and unkempt, displaying lacrimation, soft stool and clear material on mouth and neck at the time of sacrifice (week 7), and the other was sacrificed due to a mechanical trauma. The observed effects were not ascribed to the treatment according to the author of the study.

To conclude, this study presents clear evidence of alterations on the male reproductive system at 63.6 mg B/kg bw/day, manifested as severe aspermatogenesis, absence of spermatocytes in the tubules of the epididymides and significantly increased incidences of small and soft testes, correlated with significantly decreased absolute and relative testes weights. These effects were observed in the absence of marked general toxicity

Data on boric acid and borate salts

The assessment of adverse effects on sexual function and fertility of barium diboron tetraoxide is supported with read-across data from studies of oral exposure to boric acid and borate salts. In aqueous solutions at physiological and acidic pH, low concentrations of barium diboron tetraoxide and simple borates such as boric acid and borate salts will predominantly exist as undissociated boric acid. The toxicokinetic and toxicological properties of barium diboron tetraoxide after oral exposure are therefore expected to be similar to those of boric acid and borate salts.

Continuous breeding reproductive toxicity study (boric acid) (Fail et al. 1991)

In the study performed according to NTP guidelines (Reproductive Assessment by Continuous Breeding Protocol), male and female mice were administered 0, 1000, 4500 and 9000 ppm boric acid (equivalent to 0, 26.6, 111.3 and 221 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively) for 27 weeks.

At 26.6 mg B/kg bw/day, F0 male mice displayed significantly lower sperm motility than controls (by approx. 13%; p<0.05) in all 19/19 male mice, and no significant changes where revealed by the histopathological examination. The fertility index for the F0 generation was 100% for the first 4 litters and 84% for the fifth litter. No histopathological results were reported for female mice. The absolute body weights of males were comparable to controls (42.11 ± 1.16 vs. 42.24 ± 0.80 in controls). At 111.3 mg B/kg bw/day, statistically significant (p<0.05) changes as compared to controls were seen in F0 male mice: decreased mean sperm concentration and mean percentage of motile sperm (by 72% and 32%, respectively), decreased seminiferous tubular diameter (by approx. 32%), increased mean percentage of abnormal sperm (61.17 ± 5.25 vs. 11.34 ± 0.91 in controls, i.e. by approx. 439%), decreased absolute testis, epididymis and prostate weight (by approx. 51%, 21% and 20%, respectively). The histopathology examination revealed degenerative changes in the majority of the tubules, unorganised layered epithelium germ cells and few mature spermatozoa (incidence not reported). The fertility index for the F0 parental generation from the mid-dose group decreased from 95% for the first litter to 85%, 30% and 5% for the second, third, fourth and fifth litter, respectively. There were no significant changes in body weight, body weight gain or other signs of general toxicity observed in F0 male mice in this dose group. In F0 female mice, vaginal cytology revealed normal cyclicity and no changes on body weight or uterus weight were seen.

The male mice in the high-dose group (221 mg B/kg bw/day) were infertile and displayed statistically significantly decreased absolute testis (by 86%) and epididymis (by 34%) weights. A significant decrease in sperm concentration (by approx. 95%; p<0.05) where 12/15 males had no sperm, and severe seminiferous tubular atrophy (100% incidence) that correlated with significantly decreased seminiferous tubular diameter (by approx. 63%; p<0.05) were observed. No histopathology results were reported for F0 female mice.

Based on statistically significantly decreased sperm motility in the F0 parental generation, the LOAEL for fertility was set at 1000 ppm boric acid (equivalent to 26.6 mg B/kg bw/day).

In conclusion, dose-dependent effects on male reproductive organs were observed in F0 mice in absence of general toxicity, mainly expressed as decreased sperm motility starting at 26.6 mg B/kg bw/day, decreased sperm concentration, degenerative changes and atrophy of seminiferous tubules and decreased absolute testis and epididymis weights from 111.3 mg B/kg bw/day. Moreover, none of the F0 pairs was fertile at 221 mg B/kg bw/day in the absence of marked general toxicity.

90-day oral toxicity and three-generation reproduction study (boric acid or borax) (Weir and Fisher 1972; Weir 1966)

The sub-chronic oral toxicity studies of boric acid and borax performed in both rats and dogs (study 1 and 2 below, respectively), showed comparable adverse effects on the male reproductive system for both species. The same authors also performed a three-generation reproductive toxicity study in rats (study 3 below).

In study 1, male and female rats were administered 0, 52.5, 175, 525, 1750 and 5250 ppm boron (equivalent to 0, 4.7, 15.7, 47.2, 157.5 and 472.5 mg B/kg bw/day) as boric acid or borax, in feed, for 90 days. At 47.2 mg B/kg bw/day, the male rats displayed partial testes atrophy and spermatogenic arrest (5/10 and 1/10 rats, respectively), and the organ weights of the females were comparable to those of the controls (data not shown). At 157.5 mg B/kg bw/day, significantly decreased testes absolute weight (by approx. 77%; p<0.05) and complete testes atrophy were seen for both boric acid and borax treatments, and the females displayed significantly decreased absolute ovaries weight (by approx. 27% for boric acid and 42% for borax treatment; p<0.05). At 472.5 mg B/kg bw/day, both male and female rats died within 3 – 6 weeks of treatment. The necropsy revealed effects on the reproductive system of both sexes (i.e. small gonads, incidence not reported). General toxicity was observed as significantly reduced absolute body weights in females (by approx. 10 - 12 %; p<0.05) at 157.5 mg B/kg bw/day and reduced growth and food utilisation efficiency in males (not clear if statistically significant).

In study 2, beagle dogs (males and females) were administered 0, 17.5, 175 and 1750 ppm boron (equivalent to 0, 0.4, 4.3 and 43.7 mg B/kg bw/day) in feed, for 90 days. At 4.3 mg B/kg bw/day, a non-statistically significant decrease in testes weight relative to body weight was seen. The males

administered 43.7 mg B/kg bw/day showed severe testicular atrophy with complete degeneration of the spermatogenic epithelium (in 4/4 males), and a statistically significant decrease in testes relative to body weight (i.e. by 40 - 50%, as compared to controls). One male dog died on day 68 of the treatment with borax. The necropsy examination revealed congested kidneys and severe congestion of the mucosa of small and large intestines.

In study 3 (three-generation reproduction study), male and female rats were administered 0, 117, 350 and 1170 ppm boron (equivalent to 0, 5.9, 17.5 and 58.5 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively). At 58.5 mg B/kg bw/day, both males and females in the P0 parent groups of both borax and boric acid treatments were found to be sterile due to testes atrophy (8/8 male rats), lack of viable sperm (8/8 male rats) and decreased ovulation (incidence not reported). Only 1/16 female from the high dose group produced one litter when mated with control males. No information on the pups was provided. Reduced body weight for both sexes with no effects on food intake were reported (data not shown). No gross abnormalities or body weight changes were seen for the low and mid-dose groups for the filial generations (data not shown). Significantly higher fertility indices were reported for the F3 generation at 5.9 and 17.5 mg B/kg bw/day, for both borax and boric acid treatments (by approx. 45% as compared to controls for both dose levels; p<0.05). Based on the adverse effects in the P0 generation, the LOAEL for fertility in rats was set at 58.5 mg B/kg bw/day.

In study 4 (2-year feeding study-as reported in the publically disseminated REACH Registration dossier for boric acid), male and female rats were administered 0, 117, 350 and 1170 ppm boric acid (equivalent to 0, 5.9, 17.5 and 58.5 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively). Seminiferous tubular degeneration and testicular atrophy was seen after 6, 12 and 24 months of treatment at 58.5 mg B/kg bw/day. At the end of treatment (24 months), the incidence of testicular atrophy was 10%, 40% and 100% at 5.9, 17.5 and 58.5 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively. Based on these findings, the NOAEL and LOAEL for rat fertility were 17.5 and 58.5 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively.

Nine-week oral repeated dose toxicity study (boric acid) (Ku et al. 1993)

Male rats (6 rats/dose group) were administered 0, 3000, 4500, 6000 and 9000 ppm (equivalent to 26, 38, 52 and 68 mg B/kg bw/day) for 9 weeks.

By week 5 of the treatment with 26 mg B/kg bw/day, rats displayed mildly inhibited spermiation (i.e. in 25 - 50% of tubules, incidence not reported), which continued until week 9. This effect was correlated with a $5 - 6 \mu g$ B/g testicular level. At 38 mg B/kg bw/day, severe and widespread spermiation (i.e. in > 50% of tubules, incidence not reported) occurred by week 2 and was maintained until the end of the treatment. This latter effect was associated with a boron testicular level of $8 - 9 \mu g/g$ and statistically significant decreases in epididymal sperm count (ESC) (i.e. 72 - 97%) and epididymis absolute weight (i.e. 10 - 29%), during weeks 4 - 9.

The testicular lesions observed at the highest dose levels (52 and 68 mg B/kg bw/day) had a similar progression. The initial marked inhibition of spermiation appeared at week 2 and progressed dose-dependently to severe testes atrophy by weeks 9 and 6, respectively.

At 52 mg B/kg bw/day, the male rats displayed adverse effects on the reproductive organs characterised by initially increased testicular spermatid head count (TSHC) (by 31 - 51% for both dose levels), followed by a statistically significant decrease in TSHC (by 16 - 99%) at the end of the treatment. Statistically significant decreases in absolute testes (by 12 - 68%) and absolute epididymis weights (by 12 - 57%), accompanied by a profoundly decreased ESC (by 78 - 99%), were observed. These adverse effects were associated with boron testicular levels of $11 - 12 \mu g/g$.

At 68 mg B/kg bw/day, an initially increased TSHC (by 31 - 51%), statistically significant decreased absolute testes (by 12 - 68%) and epididymis (by 12 - 57%) absolute weights, and decreased ESC (by 78 - 99%) were seen. These effects were associated with boron testicular levels of $15 - 16 \mu g/g$. While post-treatment recovery from severe atrophy did not occur for the highest exposure levels, at 38 mg B/kg bw/day the severely inhibited spermiation was partially reversible 16 weeks after treatment (areas of focal atrophy that did not recover were detected).

At 68 mg B/kg bw/day, general toxicity was observed as decreased absolute body weights (by 16%, as compared to controls) and reduced feed consumption (by 11%, as compared to controls). No feed consumption or body weight changes were reported at 26, 38 or 52 mg B/kg bw/day.

In conclusion, the observed effects on fertility were considered treatment-related. These findings showed that (i) inhibited spermiation did not appear exclusively at high doses and it was expressed at different testicular levels of B than testicular atrophy, (ii) the progression to testicular atrophy was dose-dependent and (iii) a relationship between dietary and testis levels of boron could be established.

28-day oral repeated dose toxicity study (boric acid) (Treinen and Chapin 1991)

Male rats (6/time-point/dose level) were administered 0 and 9000 ppm boric acid (equivalent to 0 and 189 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively), daily (in feed) for 28 days. The development of lesions was assessed through electron microscopy, histology and serum testosterone measurements.

At day 4 of the treatment, 1/6 males showed disrupted spermatogenesis and no epididymal sperm. The basal testosterone level was significantly lower than controls (by approx. 65%; p<0.05) for 6/6 males.

At day 7, inhibited spermiation and cell sloughing/epithelial disorganisation were observed for 3/6 males, with a significantly decreased basal testosterone level as compared to controls (by approx. 89%; p<0.05). At day 10 of treatment, effects such as inhibited spermiation and peripheral spermatid nuclei were observed in all male rats (6/6).

For days 14, 21 and 28 of treatment, changes such as advanced epithelial disorganisation, significant loss of spermatocytes and spermatids from all stage tubules and cell exfoliation were seen in 6/6 male rats. The basal testosterone levels were significantly decreased (by 65 - 89%; p<0.05) for all evaluated time-points. General toxicity was expressed as significantly reduced absolute body weight (by approx. 8%; p<0.05), with no other effects reported at any of the investigated time-points.

In conclusion, already after 4 days of treatment of 189 mg B/kg bw/day serum testosterone levels were significantly decreased, and after 7 days inhibited spermiation and histopathological changes in seminiferous tubules were observed with increasing severity and incidences during the treatment period. There were no indications that the adverse effects on the male reproductive organs were secondary to general toxicity.

60-day oral repeated dose toxicity study (boric acid) (Marat et al. 2018)

In a recent study, male rats (6 rats per dose group) were administered 0, 1 and 10 mg B/kg bw/day for 60 days prior to mating. The male rats were mated with untreated females after the cessation of treatment, and the females were sacrificed on GD 20. Decreased fertility indices for both exposure levels (86% and 62.5% vs. 89% in controls, respectively) were seen. Pre-implantation loss was statistically significantly increased at 10 mg B/kg bw/day (23.81% compared to 2.69% in control). There is no information available on clinical conditions, body weights or body weight gains of the animals, and it is therefore not possible to conclude that the observed findings are not a secondary consequence of general toxicity.

30-day and 60-day oral repeated dose toxicity study (borax) (Lee et al. 1978)

Male rats (18/dose group) were administered 0, 50, 100 and 200 mg B/kg bw/day as borax in diet, for a period of 30 or 60 days. At the end of the exposure periods, 5 male rats from each dose group were serially mated with untreated females.

After 30 days of treatment at 100 mg B/kg bw/day, significantly decreased absolute epididymis weight (by approx. 19%; p<0.05) and a marked testicular reduction of spermatocytes, spermatids and mature spermatozoa were seen (incidence not reported, not clear if statistically significant). At 200 mg B/kg bw/day, effects such as significantly decreased absolute epididymis weight (by approx. 30%; p<0.05), severe loss of germinal elements and a reduced tubular diameter (by approx. 15%; p>0.05) were reported. No statistically significant changes in testis or body absolute weight or other signs of general toxicity were seen at any dose level.

After 60 days of treatment, a significant decrease (by approx. 16%; p<0.05) in seminiferous tubular diameter, but no body, testis or epididymis changes were observed at 50 mg B/kg bw/day. At 100 mg

B/kg bw/day, significantly decreased absolute testis and epididymis weights (by approx. 62% and 37%, respectively; p<0.05) and a reduction in seminiferous tubular diameter (by approx. 34%; p<0.05) were seen. The rats at 200 mg B/kg bw/day displayed significantly decreased testis and epididymis absolute weights (by approx. 65% and 34%, respectively; p<0.05), decreased seminiferous tubular diameter (by approx. 38%; p<0.05) and complete germinal aplasia that persisted up to 32 weeks post-treatment (incidence not reported). Moreover, a correlation between the dose-dependent germinal depletion and the increased plasma FSH concentrations was observed for the 60-day treatment (i.e. statistically significant increase in mean plasma FSH concertation by 139%, 175% and 236% for the 50, 100 and 200 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively, as compared to controls). No statistically significant body or other organ weight changes or other signs of general toxicity were reported at any dose level.

The serial mating results showed significantly reduced pregnancy rates (100%; p<0.05) up to 8 weeks after treatment at 200 mg B/kg bw/day for 30 days, with a partial recovery during weeks 9 and 10 after treatment. At 100 mg B/kg bw/day for 30 days, the pregnancy rates were significantly reduced during the first 3 weeks post-treatment (by 33%; p<0.05). The pregnancy rates were comparable to controls at the lowest dose level (50 mg B/kg bw/day), after both treatment periods. The high dose males treated for 60 days were infertile (100%) throughout 12 weeks (and additional 20 weeks) post-treatment. At 100 mg B/kg bw/day, no pregnancies were reported during weeks 2 - 3 after the cessation of treatment of 60 days.

To conclude, the reported adverse effects on fertility were observed in the absence of general toxicity (body weight or clinical observations). The dose-dependent germinal aplasia, complete and partially reversible infertility in male rats (at 200 mg B/kg bw/day for 60- and 30-day treatments, respectively), and the decreased epididymis weights are considered treatment-related.

Summary of animal studies on barium diboron tetraoxide, boric acid and borate salts

According to Annex I, paragraph 3.7.1.3 of the CLP Legislation, any effect of substances that has the potential to interfere with sexual function and fertility *includes, but is not limited to, alterations to the female and male reproductive system, adverse effects on onset of puberty, gamete production and transport, reproductive cycle normality, sexual behaviour, fertility, parturition, pregnancy outcomes, premature reproductive senescence, or modifications in other functions that are dependent on the integrity of the reproductive systems.* The above presented animal data on barium diboron tetraoxide, boric acid and borate salts show evidence of adverse effects on sexual function and fertility, mainly expressed as:

1) Alterations to the female and male reproductive system

Females

The test guideline 90-day oral repeated dose toxicity study on barium diboron tetraoxide does not provide evidence on alterations to the female reproductive system since organ weights for ovaries or uteri were not reported and no histopathological examination of the female reproductive organs was performed. Furthermore, in the non-guideline 90-day oral repeated dose toxicity study significantly decreased absolute uterus weight (by 27% for boric acid and 42% for borax treatment; p<0.05) was seen in female rats at 157.5 mg B/kg bw/day. In the non-guideline three-generation reproductive toxicity study, decreased ovulation was observed in P0 rats at 58.5 mg B/kg bw/day, but the incidence or information on general toxicity in females were not reported.

The available data do not show clear evidence of alterations to the female reproductive system and thus, are considered as supportive information.

<u>Males</u>

The test guideline 90-day oral repeated dose toxicity study on barium diboron tetraoxide shows evidence of adverse effects on fertility at 63.6 mg B/kg bw/day, mainly expressed as severe aspermatogenesis (10/10), absence of spermatocytes from the tubules of the epididymides (9/10), small (9/10) and soft (7/10) testes. These histopathological changes correlated with significantly decreased absolute and relative testes weight (by 61% and 57%, respectively, as compared to controls; p<0.05) and were observed in the absence of marked general toxicity.

The NTP-guideline study of boric acid performed in F0 mice revealed dose-dependent adverse effects on the male reproductive system at 26.6 and 111.3 mg B/kg bw/day, observed in the absence of general toxicity. At 26.6 mg B/kg bw/day, sperm motility was significantly lower than controls (by approx. 13%; p<0.05). Significant reductions in the mean percentage of motile sperm and mean concentration of sperm (by approx. 32% and 72%, respectively; p<0.05) were seen at 111.3 mg B/kg bw/day. Moreover, a marked increase in the percentage of abnormal sperm (by 439%; p<0.05) was noted for the mid-dose level. Similar but more severe effects were observed in F0 mice at 221 mg B/kg bw/day, in the presence of general toxicity (significantly decreased body weight by approx. 16% and reduced body weight gain). The mean sperm concentration was markedly reduced (by 95%; p<0.05) as compared to controls, where 12/15 male mice had no sperm, and the number of spermatids/testis was statistically significantly reduced by approx. 65%.

Moreover, in the non-guideline 90-day oral repeated dose toxicity study, partial testes atrophy (5/10) and spermatogenic arrest (10/10) at 47.2 mg B/kg bw/day, in the absence of general toxicity was seen in rats and severe testicular atrophy with complete degeneration of the spermatogenic epithelium (4/4) was observed in dogs, at 43.7 mg B/kg bw/day, in the presence of general toxicity (Weir and Fisher 1972; Weir 1966). In the non-guideline three-generation reproductive toxicity study, testes atrophy (8/8) and lack of viable sperm (8/8) were seen in P0 rats at 58.5 mg B/kg bw/day, in the absence of general toxicity.

Severe and widespread spermiation (incidence not reported) and significantly decreases epididymal sperm counts (72 - 97%; p<0.05) were seen at 38 and 52 mg B/kg bw/day in the non-guideline nine-week oral repeated dose toxicity study in rats (Ku et al. 1993). However, no information on general toxicity was reported for either of the dose levels.

In the non-guideline 28-day oral repeated dose toxicity study, inhibited spermiation, epithelial disorganisation, cell exfoliation and significant loss of spermatocytes and spermatids were seen at 189 mg B/kg bw/day, in the absence of marked general toxicity. The basal testosterone level was significantly reduced during the whole treatment (by 65 - 89%; p<0.05).

Moreover, dose-dependent germinal aplasia, marked reductions of spermatocytes, spermatids and spermatozoa, and reduced tubular diameter were observed at 100 and 200 mg B/kg bw/day, in the absence of general toxicity in the non-guideline 30-day and 60-day oral repeated dose toxicity studies (Lee et al. 1978).

Statistically significantly reduced testis and epididymis weights were consistently reported by both guideline- and non-guideline oral repeated dose toxicity studies, starting from 38 and 52 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively. In rats, decreased absolute epididymis weight (by 10 - 29%) was observed at 38 mg B/kg bw/day and a profound decrease (12 - 68%; p<0.05) in testis weight was seen at 52 mg B/kg bw/day. In dogs, a significant decrease in testes relative to body weight (by approx. 50%; p<0.05) was reported at 43.7 mg B/kg bw/day, in the presence of general toxicity.

The significantly decreased testis and epididymis weights in mice (by approx. 51% and 21%, respectively; p<0.05) at 111.3 mg B/kg bw/day correlated with the histopathology results that revealed degenerative changes in the majority of tubules, few mature spermatozoa and few germ cells organised into layered epithelium (Fail et al. 1991). These effects were seen in the absence of general toxicity and are considered as a direct effect of the treatment and thus, relevant for classification purposes.

2) Fertility

In the test guideline continuous breeding reproductive toxicity study performed in mice, fertility indices decreased from 95% for the first litter to 85%, 30% and 5% for the second, third, fourth and fifth litter, respectively, at 111.3 mg B/kg bw/day. None of the F0 pairs were fertile at 221 mg B/kg bw/day (Fail et al. 1991).

In the non-guideline three-generation reproductive toxicity study performed in rats at 58.5 mg B/kg bw/day, the P0 parent groups were sterile (testes atrophy and lack of viable sperm in 8/8 males) and only one female (1/16) produced one litter when mated with control males. In the F3 generation significantly higher fertility indices, as compared to controls (by approx. 45%; p<0.05) at 5.9 and 17.5 mg B/kg bw/day were reported. However, it has to be noted that the fertility indices in controls were

unusually low (ranging from 60% - 81.3 %) for all three filial generations. The serial mating of treated male rats with untreated females (30-day oral repeated dose toxicity study) revealed significantly reduced pregnancy rates (by approx. 33%; p<0.05) for the first 3 weeks post-treatment at 100 mg B/kg bw/day (Lee et al. 1978). At 200 mg B/kg bw/day, the pregnancy rates were significantly reduced (100%; p<0.05) during 8 weeks post-treatment. However, a 50% recovery during weeks 9 and 10 after treatment was observed. Moreover, at 200 mg B/kg bw/day, the males of the 60-day oral repeated dose reproductive toxicity study were infertile during 12 weeks (and additional 20 weeks) after treatment. At 100 mg B/kg bw/day, significantly reduced (by approx. 80 – 100%; p<0.05) pregnancy rates were observed during weeks 2 - 4 post-treatment.

Data on barium chloride

Non-guideline 90-day oral repeated dose toxicity and reproductive toxicity screening study (barium chloride) (Dietz et al. 1993)

The 90-day oral toxicity study performed in both mice and rats administered 0, 125, 500, 1000, 2000 and 4000 ppm barium chloride (equivalent to 0, 11.25, 45, 90, 180 and 360 mg/kg bw/day, respectively, in rats, and 0, 18.75, 75, 150, 300 and 600 mg/kg bw/day, respectively, in mice) did not reveal clear evidence of adverse effects on reproductive organs. It should be noted that only the average results of the controls and the high dose groups of each species were presented and no individual animal data or histopathology examination results were available.

Within the same study (but on separate groups of animals), the authors conducted a reproductive and fertility assessment during premating for both rats and mice where the males of each species were treated for 60 days and the female rats and mice were treated for 30 days before mating. The dose ranges differed from the sub-chronic study, mice were administered 0, 500, 1000 and 2000 ppm barium chloride (equivalent to 0, 90, 180 and 360 mg/kg bw/day, respectively) and rats to 0, 1000, 2000 and 4000 ppm barium chloride (equivalent to 0, 120, 240 and 480 mg/kg bw/day, respectively). Pregnancy rates for both mice and rats ranged from 55 - 70% in the treated groups, but since the pregnancy rates of control groups of both species were lower or similar (40% in rats and 55% in mice) compared with the treated groups these findings are not considered toxicologically relevant. No histopathological examination was performed in the animals of the reproductive screening study and no other effects were observed on sexual function or fertility of either species.

Conclusion on animal studies of barium chloride

Since there was no evidence of adverse effects on reproductive organs in the 90-day repeated dose toxicity study and no impairment of fertility after barium treatment during premating either in rats or mice, the data on barium were not considered further for classification purposes.

10.10.2.2 Human data

No information on human exposure to barium diboron tetraoxide was found in the open literature. Therefore, information was read-across from boric acid and borate salts. Several epidemiological studies carried out on occupationally and/or environmentally boron-exposed populations from Turkey, China and United States of America (USA) are described below.

A recent study performed by Duydu et al. 2018a was designed to assess the effects of occupational boron exposure on the male reproductive system, covering workers with blood boron levels higher than 400 ng B/g blood. A total number of 212 workers from a borate-processing plant (Bandirma) and a boron-mining plant (Bigadic Boron Works), both located in Turkey, participated in the study. The authors collected food, water, biological (i.e. blood, semen and urine), static and personal air samples in order to estimate the daily boron exposure (DBE) levels. Based on the calculated blood boron values, the workers were divided into 4 different groups, as follows: low exposure with a DBE of 15.07 ± 10.50 (74.03 ± 28.16 ng B/g blood; n = 12), medium exposure with a DBE of 19.85 ± 15.06 mg B/day (126.6 ± 14.41 ng B/g blood; n = 17), high exposure with a DBE of 26.84 ± 15.03 mg B/day (269.2 ± 73.81 ng B/g blood; n = 85) and extreme exposure with a DBE of 47.17 ± 17.47 mg B/day (570.6 ± 160.1 ng B/g blood; n = 98). The measured sperm quality parameters (i.e. motility, morphology and concentration) as well as the measured hormone levels (i.e. luteinizing hormone

(LH), follicle-stimulating hormone (FSH) and total testosterone) did not show any statistically significant differences in pairwise comparisons of the four exposure groups. However, statistical significance was achieved when comparing the blood boron concentrations to the urine and DBE levels (Pearson's correlation, p<0.01). The measured semen levels were 6.4, 8.0, 4.3 and 3.1 higher than the blood boron levels of the low, medium, high and extreme exposure groups, which indicates that the male reproductive organs represent an accumulation site for boron. Based on these results, the authors concluded that extreme occupational exposure to boron (i.e. > 400 ng B/g blood) did not adversely affect male fertility. However, the results of this study might have been influenced by limitations such as the small sample size (i.e. n = 12 for the low exposure group and n = 17 for the medium exposure group), the fact that the different exposure groups were assigned based on blood boron concentrations instead of DBE and that the low exposure group was also environmentally exposed to boron through drinking water. Furthermore, based on an average body weight of 70 kg, the extreme DBE values calculated by this study will be 0.67 ± 0.25 mg B/kg bw/day, and the maximum individual DBE (i.e. 106.8 mg B/day) will be converted into 1.52 mg B/kg bw/day, both values being lower than the LOAEL for fertility in rats (58.5 mg B/kg bw/day) and the NOAEL for rat fertility (i.e. 17.5 mg B/kg bw/day), set by the RAC (RAC Opinion on boric acid, 2014). These results are in line with those reported previously by the same authors (Duydu et al. 2011; Basaran et al. 2012) and show that the assessed DBE levels from Turkish workers are not associated with statistically significant changes on semen parameters, FSH, LH and total testosterone levels.

The study conducted by Duydu et al. 2011 investigated the reproductive toxicity of both occupational and environmental boric acid/borates exposure of populations residing in Turkey. Boron levels from workplace air, food, water sources and biological samples such as blood, urine and semen were determined. Only 102 out of 428 workers involved directly in the manufacturing of boron products participated in the study. The calculated DBE level for the high exposure group 14.45 ± 6.57 mg B/day which, based on an estimated average body weight of 70 kg, can be converted into a value of 0.2 ± 0.09 mg B/kg bw/day. The investigated fertility parameters (i.e. motility, concentration and morphology of sperm) indicated that boron exposure does not affect the male reproductive system. The mean luteinizing hormone (LH), follicle-stimulating hormone (FSH) and testosterone concentrations of the exposed group were not statistically significantly different from the control group levels. However, this study presents several limitations that could have influenced the results. Firstly, only 102 (i.e. 24%) of the occupationally exposed workers participated in the study, out of which only 39 constituted the high exposure group. Thus, having such a small sample size leads to low statistical power. Secondly, the control groups were environmentally exposed to boron through drinking water and further along the study these groups were re-constituted according to blood concentrations of boron instead of occupational exposure. Ultimately, as also stated in the RAC Opinion on boric acid (2014), the high boron exposure level in this study was lower than the NOAEL $(0.2 \pm 0.09 \text{ mg B/kg bw/day vs. } 17.5 \text{ mg B/kg bw/day})$ set for male rat fertility, and therefore, could explain the absence of any adverse effects on sexual function and fertility.

Basaran et al. 2012 further investigated the reproductive toxicity parameters in the highly exposed workers in the same occupationally exposed population as in the studies described above. Both exposed and control groups were recruited from the same boron mining area (i.e. Bandirma Boric Acid Production Plant), with the same participation rate as the previous study (i.e. 24%). The calculated mean blood boron level in the highly exposed group was 223.89 ± 69.49 ng B/g blood. At the investigated blood boron levels, the authors did not find statistically significant changes on semen parameters, hormone levels (LH, FSH and testosterone) or DNA integrity in sperm cells. However, this study presents the same study design limitations as the ones described above (Duydu et al. 2018a; Duydu et al. 2011).

Sayli et al. 1998 conducted an observational study on residents of different Turkish villages exposed through drinking water to either elevated (8.5 to 29 mg B/L and 2.05 to 2.5 mg B/L) or lower (0.03 to 0.04 mg B/L) boron levels. The authors compared the reproductive history of the residents living in the two boron-exposed regions through gathering data on the pedigrees of the interviewed families (covering three generations), considering the birth of living children as proof of fertility. The study showed infertility rates of 2.34% for the region exposed to elevated levels of boron was 2.34% where

96% of the families had at least one child, while the infertility rate for the region with the lower boron exposure was 2.62% where 96% of the residents had minimum one child. Based on the collected information, the authors concluded that levels of 8.5 to 29 mg B/L and 2.05 to 2.5 mg B/L found in drinking water did not induce any adverse effects on the fertility of the residents living in the exposed villages. In another study (Sayli 2003), the same main author investigated 191 occupationally exposed workers from two borates and acid plants in Turkey. For data collection under the first phase of the study, a questionnaire was used in order to cover marital status and childbearing properties as well as age at marriage, number of pregnancies and the number of children both dead and alive, births, foetal losses and congenital malformations. The second phase of the study consisted of gathering information covering three-generations on certain parameters (duration of job, involved section, wedding year and number and sex of children) through checking the computerised individual files of 712 workers, without conducting any interviews. While only 3.1 % (6 out of 191) first phase workers were childless, approx. 3.4% (24 out of 712) second phase workers had no children. Based on the observed nonstatistically significant differences, it was concluded that occupational boron exposure does not impair human fertility. However, the statistical power of this study is lowered by several study design limitations such as small sample size for the first phase of investigation, not clearly describing the selection criteria for the second phase workers, not conducting any laboratory tests or physical examination of the exposed workers and not deriving any DBE level.

Furthermore, Chang et al. 2006 conducted a cross-sectional, descriptive epidemiological study with occupationally exposed male workers coming from boron mines in China and control groups selected from low environmental boron levels. A total number of 936 exposed workers and a comparison group composed of 251 controls participated in the study. Interviews were conducted in order to collect information on the diet, work history, fertility and health history of the participants, while data on reproductive health parameters were gathered through self-reporting. The mean environmental boron exposure in surface water was between 2.6 - 3.8 mg/L and 0.005 - 0.67 mg/L for the exposed workers and control group, and between 1.2 - 25.1 mg/L and 0.002 - 0.67 mg/L in well water for the exposed workers and control group, respectively. No statistically significant differences in reproductive health outcomes (i.e. delayed pregnancies, multiple births, spontaneous miscarriages, stillbirths and tubal or ectopic pregnancies) for the exposed workers were observed. However, several limitations of this study such as self-reporting of data and the fact that no exposure measurements were performed for the wives of the workers, might have influenced the reported results.

The reproductive effects of borates exposure on male workers and the standardised birth ratio (SBR) for fertility assessment were investigated by Whorton et al. 1994a,b in occupationally exposed workers from a borate mining facility located in the state of California, USA. Out of 753 eligible workers, 542 (i.e. 72%) participated in the study by completing questionnaires for data collection. The participants were divided into five different exposure groups according to the following mean borate exposure values: 0.37 mg/m³, 1.34 mg/m³, 2.23 mg/m³, 3.98 mg/m³ and 8.58 mg/m³. The average exposure for the highest exposure group (n = 109) was calculated at a level of 28.4 mg B/day, which based on an estimated average body weight of 70 kg, can be converted into a value of 0.4 mg B/kg bw/day. The SBR for the workers with low (< 3 mg/m³) exposure levels was not different from the SBR of those with medium (3 – 8 mg/m³) and high (> 8 mg/m³) exposure levels, thus the number of offspring did not indicate any boron-induced adverse effects on male fertility. As also stated in the RAC Opinion on boric acid (2014), the highest average daily exposure (0.4 mg B/kg bw/day) was lower than the LOAEL (26.6 mg B/kg bw/day) for mice fertility according to Fail et al. 1991, and below the NOAEL for fertility in rats (17.5 mg B/kg bw/day) set by RAC on the results reported by Weir et al. 1966.

Conclusion on human studies of boron

Overall, the available epidemiological data did not show clear boron-induced adverse effects on sexual function and fertility. As described above, the studies had several methodological limitations and were designed to investigate male fertility only. Other limitations are generally small sample sizes and/or decreased participation rates. It should also be noted that the estimated human exposure levels (DBE) of the "high" and "extreme" exposure groups in these studies were considerably lower than the NOAELs and LOAELs reported for both rats and mice fertility. No studies on effects on fertility and sexual function in humans are available at exposure levels corresponding to the animal LOAELs.

Hence, as was also highlighted by the RAC (Opinions on boric acid (2014), disodium octaborate anhydrate (2014) and disodium octaborate tetraborate (2014)) it is concluded that the available human data on fertility and sexual function do not contradict the animal data. The human data is therefore considered as additional information.

10.10.3 Comparison with the CLP criteria

In line with the Repr. 1B classification criteria, the available 90-day oral repeated dose toxicity study on barium diboron tetraoxide (Study report 1993a) shows clear evidence of adverse effects on the male rat reproductive system expressed as severe aspermatogenesis, the absence of spermatocytes in the tubules of the epididymides and statistically significant decreased absolute testes weight (by approx. 61%), at a dose of 707 mg barium diboron tetraoxide/kg bw/day (corresponding to 63.6 mg B/kg bw/day).

The findings for barium diboron tetraoxide (significantly decreased weight of testes, aspermatogenesis, absence of spermatocytes in the tubules of the epididymis) are supported by readacross data from boric acid and borate salts showing similar findings (testicular atrophy, lack of viable sperm, seminiferous tubular degeneration), at a level of 63.6 mg B/kg bw/day and 58.5 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively. The alterations to the male reproductive system, which are dose-dependent and consistent across different species (i.e. mice, rats and dogs), are described in several studies of boric acid and borate salts. Moreover, impaired fertility was reported in a multigeneration reproduction toxicity study of boric acid and borax in the rat. At 58.5 mg B/kg bw/day, P0 parent groups were found to be sterile due to testes atrophy (8/8 male rats), lack of viable sperm (8/8 male rats) and decreased ovulation (incidence not reported). Only 1/16 female from the high dose group produced one litter when mated with control males. In addition, in a reproductive toxicity study in mice none of the F0 pairs were fertile at 221 mg B/kg bw/day in the absence of marked general toxicity, also indicating that boron significantly impairs fertility.

In conclusion, the overall weight of evidence of available information, experimental data on the substance itself and a large body of evidence from read-across data on animal studies showing adverse effects of boron on sexual function and fertility, fulfil the classification criteria requirements for barium diboron tetraoxide as **Repr. 1B, H360F**.

Classification Repr. 1A as is not appropriate as it should be based on human data and no human data on barium diboron tetraoxide were available. Moreover, human data on boric acid and borate salts from read-across do not provide clear evidence of adverse effects on sexual function and fertility. Thus, the overall negative human data do not contradict the animal data, and there is no evidence to indicate that the observed effects in animal studies are not relevant for humans.

Classification in Repr. 2 is not justified since the evidence for adverse effects on sexual function and fertility from existing experimental data on barium diboron tetraoxide and read-across from boric acid and borate salts is considered to be clear and not only *some evidence from humans or experimental animals*.

Concentration limits

In line with the CLP guidance (2017), concentration limits for effects on sexual function and fertility are derived by calculating the reproductive toxicity dose descriptor, i.e. ED10 (the dose level at which a change of 10% compared to the concurrent control group is observed). It should be noted that, with the exception of testes weight (Study report, 1993a), the available data on barium diboron tetraoxide were not transparently reported enough in order to derive the ED10, and thus read-across data on boric acid and borate salts were used.

According to the RAC (RAC opinions on boric acid, disodium octaborate anhydrate and disodium octaborate tetrahydrate, 2014), testes atrophy was identified as the most sensitive effect on fertility in rats, based upon a 2-year feeding study with boric acid (Weir 1966). At the end of the treatment (24 months), the incidence of testicular atrophy was 30%, 10%, 40% and 100% at 0, 5.9, 17.5 and 58.5 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively. Based upon these results, the ED10 would therefore be 17.5 mg B/kg bw/day (equivalent to 100 mg boric acid/kg bw/day).

Correcting for the percentage of boron, a level of 17.5 mg B/kg bw/day would correspond to 194.4 mg barium diboron tetraoxide/kg bw/day. The medium potency group with a GCL of 0.3% would therefore be assigned to barium diboron tetraoxide since the ED10 is \geq 4 mg/kg bw/day and \leq 400 mg/kg bw/day.

Conclusion

Setting of specific concentration limit for adverse effects on sexual function and fertility is not considered justified, and thus the GCL of 0.3% applies.

10.10.4 Adverse effects on development

Since only one study with barium diboron tetraoxide was found for the assessment of adverse effects on the development of the offspring, read-across from developmental toxicity data on boric acid and borate salts were included to support the conclusion on classification.

One new animal study investigating the reproductive toxicity of boron in rats has been published in 2018 (Marat et al. 2018). With the exception of this new study, the studies on boric acid and borate salts presented in Table 20 were appointed key studies by the RAC in their 2014 opinion documents on boric acid, disodium octaborate anhydrate and disodium octaborate tetrahydrate. Two epidemiological studies assessing the effects of boron on the development of the offspring, which have been published since 2014 (Duydu et al. 2018b and Igra et al. 2016) are presented in Table 21.

In addition, data on the counter ion from a sub-chronic oral toxicity study and a prenatal developmental toxicity study on barium chloride in rats have been included in Table 20 in order to provide a complete picture of the toxicological profile of barium diboron tetraoxide.

Method, guideline, deviations if any, species, strain, sex, no/group ¹⁸ Barium diboron tet	exposure	Results	Reference
Darium aiboron iei	Τασχίαε		
Prenatal Developmental Toxicity Study GLP-compliant	Test material: Busan 11-M1 (barium metaborate monohydrate)	 NOAEL (maternal toxicity): 10 mg/kg/day, equivalent to 0.9 mg B/kg bw/day NOAEL (developmental toxicity): 20 mg/kg/day, equivalent to 1.80 mg B/kg bw/day 	Study report 1993b
US EPA guideline 83-3, the bodyweights were not measured with the frequency recommended by the guideline.	Purity: 94.3% Form: powder <u>Doses/conc.:</u> 0, 2, 10, 20 mg/kg bw/day, cominalant to 0	Maternal effects: - at 1.8 mg B/kg bw/day, 1 dam died on GD 16, and at necropsy 3 normally developing implantations and 5 early resorptions were observed <i>in utero</i> (no clinical signs were noted in this female during the study); - at 1.8 mg B/kg bw/day, 1 dam aborted on GD 22 (this dam was hypoactive on GD 20-21) 7 late resorptions and 2	
Rabbit (New Zealand), female n = 20/dose group	equivalent to 0, 0.18, 0.9 and 1.8 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively	 adm was hypoactive on GD 20-21) / late resorptions and 2 early resorptions; 0/20, 1/20, 1/20 and 2/18 dams were non-gravid at 0, 0.18, 0.9 and 1.8 mg B/kg bw, respectively; 	

Table 20: Summary table of animal studies on adverse effects on development

¹⁸ Where applicable and unless stated otherwise, the reliability scores of the studies presented in Table 20 are according to the CLH dossier of boric acid, assessed by RAC in 2013.

Mathad	Test substance	Results	Defenence
Method,	Test substance,	Kesuits	Reference
guideline,	dose levels		
deviations if any,	duration of		
species, strain, sex, no/group ¹⁸	exposure		
sex, no/group ¹⁰	Exposures	- no statistically significant changes in mean body weight	
Reliability ¹⁹ : 1	Exposure: gestation days 7-	and body weight, mean gravid uterine weights and food	
(reliable without	19 via oral	consumption were reported at any dose level.	
restriction), key	gavage. The	consumption were reported at any dose rever.	
study	animals were	Foetuses:	
study	observed until	- No statistically significant differences on the mean foetal	
	gestation day 29	body weights were reported. The number of foetuses	
	at which point	(litters) available for morphological examination were:	
	they were	124(20), 129(19), 119(19) and 103(16) at 0, 0.18, 0.9 and	
	sacrificed.	1.8 mg B/kg bw, respectively;	
		- external malformations were observed in 3, 0, 0, and 1	
		foetuses at 0, 0.18, 0.9 and 1.8 mg B/kg bw, respectively.	
		In the control group, 2 foetuses with short tail and 1 foetus	
		with omphalocele were reported. One foetus with carpal	
		flexure on the right front limb was reported at 1.8 mg B/kg	
		bw;	
		- <u>soft tissue malformations</u> were observed in 1, 0, 0 and 3	
		foetuses at 0, 0.18, 0.9 and 1.8 mg B/kg bw, respectively.	
		At 1.8 mg B/kg bw, one foetus with diaphragmatic hernia	
		was observed. At 1.8 mg B/kg bw, hydrocephaly	
		(consisting of increased cavitation of the lateral ventricles)	
		was seen in 2 foetuses from separate litters, and,	
		diaphragmatic hernia was observed in 1 foetus at the same	
		dose level. In the control group, 1 foetus with bulbous aorta	
		(ascending and arch along with a stenotic pulmonary trunk) was observed.	
		was observed.	
		-skeletal malformations were observed in 7, 1, 5 and 3	
		foetuses at 0, 0.18, 0.9 and 1.8 mg B/kg bw, respectively.	
		These malformations consisted of:	
		- in the control group, vertebral anomalies	
		with/without associated rib anomaly in 6 foetuses, and	
		severely malaligned sternebrae with a rib anomaly in 1	
		foetus;	
		- an extra site of ossification anterior to sternebra no.	
		1 was observed in 1 foetus at 0.18 mg B/kg bw;	
		- at 0.9 mg B/kg bw, vertebral anomalies	
		with/without associated rib anomaly in 4 foetuses, and	
		costal cartilage anomaly with fused sternebrae in 1 foetus;	
		- at 1.8 mg B/kg bw/day, vertebral anomalies	
		with/without associated rib anomaly in 2 foetuses, and an	
		extra site of ossification anterior to sternebra no. 1 in 1	
Boric acid and bor	ax	foetus.	
	-		
Prenatal	Test material:	LOAEL (developmental toxicity): 13.3 mg B/kg bw/day,	Price et al.
Developmental	boric acid	based on reduced foetal body weight and increased	1996a
Toxicity Study	Duraiter (190/	incidence of short rib XIII	Drice -+ -1
l	Purity: 98%		Price et al.

¹⁹ The reliability score for this study is according to the publically disseminated REACH Registration dossier of barium diboron tetraoxide, available at <u>https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered-dossier/15812/7/9/3</u>

Method,	Test substance,	Results	Reference
guideline,	dose levels		
deviations if any,	duration of		
species, strain,	exposure		
sex, no/group ¹⁸		NOAEL $(1, \dots, 1, 1, \dots, 1, 1, 1, \dots, 1, 1, \dots, 1, 1, \dots, \dots, \dots, 1, \dots, \dots,$	1007
GLP-compliant	David	NOAEL (developmental toxicity): 9.6 mg B/kg bw/day	1997
Dat (Cal. CD	$\frac{\text{Doses/conc.:}}{250} 0,$	Matamalaffasta	
Rat (Crl: CD VAF/Plus	250, 500, 750,	Maternal effects No maternal deaths occurred and no treatment-related	
(Sprague	1000, 2000 ppm boric acid	clinical signs of toxicity were observed in the dams, at any	
(Sprague Dawley))	equivalent to 0,	dose level.	
Dawley))	19, 36, 55, 76 and	Increasing dietary concentrations of boric acid were	
n = groups of 14 -	143 mg boric	positively associated with whole blood boron	
17 females/dose	acid/kg bw/day,	concentrations in confirmed pregnant rats: 0.229 ± 0.143 ,	
group/phase	respectively	$0.564 \pm 0.211, 0.975 \pm 0.261, 1.27 \pm 0.298, 1.53 \pm 0.546,$	
8 T T	(equivalent to 0,	or $2.82 \pm 0.987 \ \mu g \ B/g$ whole blood for the control through	
Reliability: 1	3.3, 6.3, 9.6, 13.3	high-dose groups.	
(reliable without	and 25 mg B/kg		
restriction), key	bw/day)	Effects on the offspring	
study		Phase I: Statistically significant reductions in the mean	
	Exposure phase I:	foetal body weight per litter at the two highest dose levels	
	days 0 - 20 post	(i.e. by approx. 6 % at 13.3 mg B/kg bw/day and by approx.	
In phase I the	mating (nominal	13% at 25 mg B/kg bw/day compared to controls).	
dams were	in diet)	The following skeletal changes were observed:	
sacrificed on Day	Evenose stars	- Statistically significant increase in the incidence of short	
20 for detailed	Exposure phase II: days 0 - 20	rib XIII amongst offspring (i.e. by approx. 1.5% at 13.3 mg B/kg bw/day and by approx. 3.4% at 25 mg B/kg bw/day,	
foetal examination.	<u>n</u> : days 0 - 20 post mating	compared to controls);	
examination.	(nominal in diet),	- Statistically significant increase in the incidence of wavy	
In phase II the	then on normal	rib amongst offspring (i.e. by approx. 2.1% at 13.3 mg B/kg	
dams were	diet until	bw/day and by approx. 10% at 25 mg B/kg bw/day,	
allowed to deliver	termination on	compared to controls);	
and the pups	day 21	At the highest dose (25 mg B/kg bw/day), these changes	
reared to weaning	postpartum	were more pronounced.	
and then killed			
for full visceral		Phase II: No reduction in pup bodyweight in any group at	
and skeletal		any time point compared to controls. The rib variations	
examination as		observed in the foetuses from Phase I were not observed at	
for phase I.		any dose group in Phase II.	
		Only at the highest dose in Phase II (25 mg B/kg bw/day), a	
Maternal blood		statistically significant increased incidence of short rib XIII	
samples were		was observed (by approx. 4% compared to controls).	
collected at termination on			
GD 20. Boron			
concentration in			
these blood			
samples was			
subsequently			
determined by			
inductively			
coupled plasma			
(ICP) optical			
emission			
spectrometry.			
Fauinalant	Test motorial.	I OAEI (motornal torristry), 11 ma D/ha hardan hard	Drigs at -1
Equivalent or similar to OECD	Test material: boric acid	LOAEL (maternal toxicity): 44 mg B/kg bw/day, based on reduced food intake, reduced body weight gain and	Price et al. 1996b
TG 414		abortions	17700
(Prenatal	Purity: unknown		Heindel et
(I I Chatal	r anty: unknown		

			7.0
Method,	Test substance,	Results	Reference
guideline,	dose levels		
deviations if any,	duration of		
species, strain,	exposure		
sex, no/group ¹⁸			
Developmental		NOAEL (maternal toxicity): 22 mg B/kg bw/day	al. 1994
Toxicity Study)	Doses/conc.: 0,		
	62.5, 125 or 250	LOAEL (developmental toxicity): 44 mg B/kg bw/day,	
GLP-compliant	mg/kg bw/day	based on increased resorptions and cardiovascular	
	boric acid,	malformations in surviving foetuses	
Rabbit (New	equivalent to 0,		
Zealand White),	11, 22 and 44 mg	NOAEL (developmental toxicity): 22 mg B/kg bw/day	
female	B/kg bw/day,		
	respectively	Maternal effects	
n = 30 pregnant	F	One dam from the 101 mg B/kg bw/day group died on GD	
female rabbits/	Exposure:	25 and one dam from the mid-dose group died on GD 22, but the deaths were not considered treatment-related.	
treatment group	treatment on days		
	6 - 19 post- mating, via oral	A high vaginal bleeding incidence was observed in the highest dosa group, where 2, 11 program families (day bled	
Reliability: 1	gavage	highest dose group, where 2 - 11 pregnant females/day bled between GD 19 - 30.	
(reliable without	gavage	At 44 mg B/kg bw/day, the food intake and body weight	
restriction), key		gain were statistically significantly decreased, by approx.	
study		31% and by approx. 10%, respectively compared to	
		controls.	
The females were			
sacrificed on GD		Foetal effects	
30 and the		At 44 mg B/kg bw/day, a statistically significantly	
numbers of		increased rate of resorptions per litter ($89.9 \pm 5.0 \%$; 73%	
uterine		of all the does had 100% resorptions) was observed. Only 6	
implantations,		litters survived to GD 30 (compared to 18 – 23 litters for	
resorptions, dead		the control and other dose levels).	
foetuses and live			
foetuses were		The incidence of skeletal malformations (i.e. cleft sternum,	
examined.		detached extra rib – lumbar 1, fused sternebrae and fused	
		rib) was increased, but not statistically significantly	
		different from controls (19, 22, 29 and 29% for the controls,	
		11, 22 and 44 mg B/kg bw/day dose groups, respectively.	
		The incidence of visceral malformations (cardiovascular)	
		was 8.2, 6.3, 7.8 and 78.6% in control, 11, 22 and 44 mg	
		B/kg bw/day dose groups. Statistically significant	
		differences compared to control were only seen at the	
		highest dose level, as follows:	
		- interventricular septal defect in 0.6, 1.7, 1.3 and 57%	
		foetuses (control to high-dose group);	
		- enlarged aorta in 0, 0.6, 0.7 and 36% foetuses (control to	
		high-dose group);	
		- papillary muscle malformations in 3, 2, 4 and 14%	
		foetuses (control to high-dose group);	
		- double outlet right ventricle (pulmonary artery and aorta	
		both arising from the right ventricle) in 0, 0, 0 and 14%	
		foetuses (control to high-dose group).	
Prenatal	Test material:	NOAFI (developmental toxicity for rate): < 14 mg P/l_{ca}	Heindel et
developmental	boric acid	NOAEL (developmental toxicity for rats): < 14 mg B/kg bw/day	al. 1992
toxicity of boric		•	ai. 1992
acid in mice and	Purity: 98 – 99%	LOAEL (developmental toxicity for rats): 14 mg B/kg	
rats	Rats:	bw/day, based on statistically significantly reduced average	
	Doses/conc.: 0,	foetal body weight	
GLP-compliant	0.1, 0.2 or 0.4 %	NOAEL (developmental toxicity for mice): 43 mg B/kg	
	. ,		

Method,	Test substance,	Results	Reference
guideline,	dose levels	Kesuits	Kututut
deviations if any,	duration of		
species, strain,	exposure		
sex, no/group ¹⁸			
Cesarean-	and 0.8%	bw/day	
originated,	equivalent to 0,	LOAEL (developmental toxicity for mice): 79 mg B/kg	
barrier-sustained	78, 163, 330 and	bw/day, based on statistically significantly reduced foetal	
CWD1 (ICR) VAF/Plus outbred	539 mg boric acid (mg B)/kg	body weight and increased incidence of skeletal	
Swiss albino	bw/day,	malformations (i.e. short rib XIII)	
(CD-l) mice	equivalent to 0,	Observed effects in rats	
	14, 29, 58 and 94	Maternal effects:	
Crl:CD BR	mg B/kg bw/day,	Statistically significant increases compared to control:	
VAF/:Plus	respectively	-relative liver weight by 5% and by 6%, at 29 and 58 mg	
outbred Sprague-		B/kg bw/day, respectively;	
Dawley (CD) rats	NC	-relative kidney weight by 11% and by 12% for 29 and 58	
n = 26 - 28	Mice: Doses/conc.: 0,	mg B/kg bw/day, respectively.	
I = 20 - 28 female mice or	<u>Doses/conc</u> 0, 0.1, 0.2 or 0.4 %	Statistically significantly decreased body weight by 11%	
rats/dose group	equivalent to 0,	and by 35%, at the dose levels of 58 and 94 mg B/kg	
C T	248, 452 and	bw/day, respectively, compared to controls.	
	1003 mg boric		
Reliability: 2	acid/ kg bw/day,	Embryo/foetal effects:	
(reliable with	equivalent to 0,	Statistically significantly increased prenatal mortality at 94	
restrictions) key	43, 79 and 175	mg B/kg bw/day (36% resorptions/litter compared to 4%	
study	mg B/kg bw/day, respectively	for the controls).	
	respectively	Statistically significantly reduced average foetal body	
		weight for all treated groups compared to controls:	
	Exposure (daily	- 7% decrease at 14 mg B/kg bw/day;	
	in feed):	- 13 % decrease at 29 mg B/kg bw/day;	
		- 37 % decrease at 58 mg B/kg bw/day;	
	<u>Rats:</u> GD 0 – 20	- 50 % decrease at 94 mg B/kg bw/day.	
	for the dose	T 1 ' ' 1 C 1 C	
	levels of 14 up to 58 mg P/kg	Increased incidences of malformations were observed: - malformations of the eyes (i.e. displaced eye in 7/136	
	58 mg B/kg bw/day;	foetuses and convoluted retina in 9/136 foetuses) at 94 mg	
	GD 6 - 15 only	B/kg bw/day, compared to the and $0/215$ in the control	
	for the highest-	group;	
	dose level (i.e. 94	- enlarged lateral ventricles of the brain (in 21/386 foetuses	
	mg B/kg	at 58 mg B/kg bw/day and in 36/136 foetuses at 94 mg B/kg	
	bw/day), with a	bw/day), compared to the respective control groups, 0/431	
	separate control group with the	and 0/215; - agenesis of rib XIII was observed in 24/386 foetuses at 58	
	same exposure	mg B/kg bw/day and in 17/136 foetuses at 94 mg B/kg	
	time;	bw/day, compared to the respective control groups, 1/431	
	,	and 0/215.	
	<u>Mice:</u> GD 0 – 17		
		Statistically significantly increased incidence of short rib	
		XIII observed in 39% and 37% of the foetuses at 58 mg	
		B/kg bw/day and 94 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively (compared to their respective control groups, 0.23% and	
		(compared to their respective control groups, 0.25% and 0.46%).	
		0.70703.	
		Statistically significantly increased incidence (100%) of	
		litters with 1 or more foetuses with a skeletal malformation	
		was reported for both 58 mg B/kg bw/day and 94 mg B/kg	
		bw/day dose levels (24/24 litters and 14/14 litters,	
		respectively compared to their respective control groups,	

Method,	Test substance,	Results	Reference					
guideline,	dose levels		Reference					
deviations if any,	duration of							
—	exposure							
sex, no/group ¹⁸		4/20						
		4/28 and 2/14).						
		Statistically significantly increased incidence of foetuses						
		with visceral or external malformations for all dose groups						
		compared to controls.						
		At 29 and 58 mg B/kg bw/day, increases in incidence of foetuses with visceral or external malformations of 8% and						
		50% compared to 2% for the control group, respectively,						
		were reported. The incidence of foetuses with visceral or						
		external malformations was statistically significantly						
		increased for the highest dose level (i.e. 73% at 94 mg B/kg						
		bw/day as compared to 2.79% in the control group).						
		Observed effects in mice						
		Maternal effects:						
		At 175 mg B/kg bw/day, maternal body weight was						
		statistically significantly reduced (by approx. 25%) during the treatment period.						
		A dose-related increase in the incidence of renal tubular						
		dilation was observed at microscopic examination.						
		At the dose levels of 43 and 175 mg B/kg bw/day, ovarian						
		cysts were seen in 1 dam of each dose group.						
		Embryo/foetal effects:						
		At 175 mg B/kg bw/day, statistically significantly increased						
		resorptions (approx. 19% per litter compared to 6% in						
		controls) was observed. Statistically significantly reduced foetal body weights were						
		observed at 79 and 175 mg B/kg w/day (by approx. 12%						
		and 33%, respectively compared to controls).						
		At the 175 mg B/kg bw/day, a statistically significantly						
		increased incidence (approx. 8%) in foetuses with malformations as compared to the control groups (approx.						
		2%) was reported.						
		Statistically significantly increased incidence of short rib						
		XIII was observed in 10/250 foetuses at 175 mg B/kg bw/day, compared to 0/311 in controls. Agenesis of one or						
		more vertebra (lumbar) was reported for 3/250 foetuses (as						
		compared to 1/311 in controls) for the highest dose level.						
Doming days of	T	For all filled comparations (i.e. E1 E2 and E2). for both 1	Weir and					
Reproductive toxicity	Test material: boric acid or	For all filial generations (i.e. F1, F2 and F3), for both low- and mid-dose groups, the litter size, weights of progeny and Fis						
assessment study	borax	appearance were not statistically significantly different	1972					
		from controls (data not shown). No information on maternal						
<u>N</u> o guideline specified, but	Purity: unknown	toxicity is reported.						
conforms to the	Doses/conc.: 0,	At 58.5 mg/kg bw/day there were no offspring produced from P1 animals.						
standard three-	117, 350 and							
generation, 2	1170 ppm boron,	The live birth indices for both boric acid and borax						
litters per generation multi-	equivalent to 0, 5.9, 17.5 and 58.5	treatment, at 5.9 and 17.5 mg B/kg bw/day are presented below:						
generation studies	5.9, 17.5 and 58.5 mg B/kg bw							
normally used at	6 6 - 7	Index Control 5.9 mg 17.5 mg Control 5.9 mg 17.5 mg						
the time.	-	B/kg B/kg I B/kg B/kg bw/day bw/day bw/day bw/day bw/day						
The first filial	Exposure: from							

Method,	Test substance,	Results						Reference	
guideline,	dose levels		RESUILS						Reference
deviations if any,	duration of								
species, strain,	exposure								
sex, no/group ¹⁸									
generation (F1A)	the beginning of		Borax						
was carried through weaning	the study (14	ıg	P1-F1A P1-F1B						
and discarded.	weeks pre-mating exposure) until sacrifice of				100	0.01			
The parental			98.4	98.4	100	99.1	99.2	99.4	
generation (P1)	parents P1, and			P2-F2A			P2-F2B		
was rebred to	from weaning		97.8	99.4	96.9	98.6	92.4	98.8	
produce their	until sacrifice of				,,,,,	,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,		20.0	
second litter	the F1- and F2-			P3-F3A			P3-F3B		
(F1B). At the time of weaning,	generations (daily in feed).		100	100	99.4	100	100	100	
16 females and 8	III ICCU).	Live				ic acid			
males each from		birth index ^a			BOI	ic acid			
the control and				P1-F1A			P1-F1B		
test groups were			98.4	96	97.2	99.1	99.4	100	
selected at									
random and designated the				P2-F2A			P2-F2B		
second parental			97.8	100	99.4	98.6	99.4	97.9	
generation (P2)				P3-F3A			P3-F3B		
for continuation				РЭ-ГЭА			Рэ-гэр		
of the			100	99.5	97.9	100	99	98.8	
reproduction		^a Live bir	th index =	number of	ups born a	live/numb	er of born p	oups x 100.	
study. These animals were bred									
to produce the									
F2A and F2B									
litters as before.									
The F2B litter									
became the P3									
generation and									
were bred to									
produce the F3A and F3B litters.									
and 1 5D inters.									
Rat (Sprague-									
Dawley)									
male/female									
n = 8 males/dose									
n = 8 males/dose group and 16									
females/dose									
group									
8 1									
Reliability: 2									
(reliable with									
restrictions)									
Reproductive	Test material:	Materr							Fail et al.
assessment by	boric acid			nificantly					1991
continuous	Durity: $> 0.00/$			emales of	the high	dose gro	oup (221	mg B/kg	
breeding	Purity: >99%	bw/day).						
	Doses/conc.: 0,	Effects	on the	offspring					
Performed	1000 ppm, 4500			ivalent to		<u>B/kg/da</u>	<u>y):</u>		

Method,	Test substance,	Results	Reference
guideline,	dose levels		Reference
deviations if any,	duration of		
species, strain,	exposure		
sex, no/group ¹⁸			
sex, no/group ¹⁸ according to the NTP's Reproductive Assessment by Continuous Breeding Protocol Mouse (Swiss) male/female n = 19/sex/dose groups No litters were born to F0 parents exposed to 9000 ppm, and only three litters were born alive to the 4500 ppm breeding pairs after cohabitation ended. Thus, F1 animals in the control and 1000 ppm groups were chosen for assessing the F1 generation.	ppm or 9000 ppm equivalent to 0, 152, 636 and 1262 mg boric acid/kg bw/day, equivalent to 0, 26.6, 111.3 and 221 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively. Exposure: 27 weeks (daily in feed)	 F1 pups: no statistically significant changes were observed. F2 pups: statistically significantly (p<0.05) decreased adjusted live pup weight (by approx. 3% compared to control). 4500 ppm (equivalent to 111.3 mg B/kg/day): F1 pups: statistically significant decreased parameters compared to controls: adjusted live pup weight by approx. 14%; number of litters/pair by approx. 51%; live birth index by approx. 11%. Only 1/19 F1 dams had 5 litters and all her pups in the 4th litter were born dead. 9000 ppm (equivalent to 221 mg B/kg/day): F0: No litters were born to F0 animals. 	
Reliability: 2 (reliable with restrictions) Assessment of embryonic or foetal death after treatment of male rats during spermatogenesis No guideline specified Rats (white outbred), male n = 6 males/dose group Males were administered test substance during the entire	Test material: boric acid Purity: unknown <u>Doses/conc.:</u> 0, 1 and 10 mg B/kg bw/day Exposure: 60 days, daily oral gavage	1 mg B/kg bw/day Statistical significant ($p \le 0.05$) changes compared to control were observed for the following parameters: - living embryos/female: 8 ± 0.62 (controls: 9.71 ± 0.33); - dead embryos/female: 1.3 ± 0.35 (controls: 0.714 ± 0.45); - post-implantation loss: 13.62 ± 5.1 % (controls: $6.92 \pm$ 1.67). 10 mg B/kg bw/day Statistically significant ($p \le 0.05$) changes compared to controls were observed for the following parameters: - living embryos/female: 6 ± 0.61 (controls: 9.71 ± 0.33); - dead embryos/female: 1.3 ± 0.25 (controls: 0.714 ± 0.45); - post-implantation loss: 18.0 ± 6.1 % (controls: $6.92 \pm$ 1.67).	Marat et al. 2018

Method,	Test substance,	Results	Reference
guideline,	dose levels	Kesuits	Reference
deviations if any,	duration of		
species, strain,	exposure		
sex, no/group ¹⁸	-		
spermatogenesis			
cycle. At the end			
of the exposure			
period, the males			
were mated with			
untreated females			
at a 1:1 ratio. Gestation was			
terminated at day			
20 and the			
number of			
implantation sites,			
resorptions, and			
embryos on the			
uterine horns and			
the corpus luteum			
count in the			
ovaries were investigated.			
Barium chloride			
Dariam entoriae	1	F	
			D: / / 1
Reproductive	Test material:	Observed effects in rats	Dietz et al.
and fertility assessment	barium chloride dihydrate	Maternal effects: At 480 mg/kg bw/day, one dam died during the last week of	1992
assessment	-	the treatment, the necropsy revealing 7 foetuses and one	
No guideline	Purity: 99.5%	resorption site. No information is presented on the maternal	
specified	Rats:	body weight or on signs of general toxicity.	
-	Doses/conc.: 0,		
Rat (Fischer 344)	1000, 2000, and	Embryo/foetal effects:	
male/female	4000 ppm barium	The live pup weight at birth was statistically significantly	
	chloride	$(p<0.01)$ reduced $(5.20 \pm 0.06 \text{ g vs.} 5.70 \pm 0.09 \text{ g in})$	
Mice (B6C3F1)	dehydrate,	controls). The average litter size on postpartum day 5 was reduced	
male/female	equivalent to 0, 120, 240 and 480	compared to controls (7.1 \pm 0.56 vs. 9.3 \pm 1.16 pups in	
n = 20/sex/dose	mg/kg bw/day,	controls). Pup survival until postnatal day 5 was $>99\%$ in	
group/species	respectively	all treated groups and controls (data not shown).	
5 · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	·····	No external abnormalities were observed in the offspring.	
Differences when	Mice:		
comparing to	Doses/conc.: 0,	Observed effects in mice:	
OECD TG 421:	500, 1000 and	Maternal effects:	
dosing only prior	2000 ppm,	There was no evidence of maternal toxicity in the treated	
to mating, no individual animal	equivalent to 0, 90, 180 and 360	mice: maternal weight gain during pregnancy was comparable to controls for all dose groups (data not shown).	
data/tables	mg/kg bw/day,	comparable to controls for an dose groups (data not shown).	
provided,	respectively	Embryo/foetal effects:	
histopathologic	······································	At the 180 mg/kg bw/day, a statistically significant	
examination, data	Exposure:	(p<0.05) reduction in the average litter size was observed	
on food	The males were	on postnatal day 0 (7.9 \pm 1.02 pups vs. 10.7 \pm 0.40 pups in	
consumption only	exposed prior to	the control group) and postnatal day 5 (7.7 \pm 0.97 pups vs.	
provided for core	mating, for 60	10.8 ± 0.38 pups in the control group).	
study animals, no	days, and the	A few pups (number not reported) were found dead at birth	
humidity, sex of pups, and data on	females for 30	for all dose levels (not specified for controls), and survival from postnatal day 0 to postnatal day 5 ranged between 98	
stability of test	days, daily in drinking water.	-100% (dose level not specified, data not shown).	
substance in	umining water.	No statistical differences in live pup body weights and no	
Substance III	I	The statistical anterences in five pup body weights and no	

Method,	Test substance,	Results	Reference
guideline,	dose levels		
deviations if any,	duration of		
species, strain,	exposure		
sex, no/group ¹⁸			
vehicle given.		external anomalies were seen in the offspring.	
Only the average results of the			
controls and the			
high dose groups			
of each species			
are available.			
The reproductive			
and fertility			
assessment was			
performed on			
separate groups of rats and mice than			
the ones used for			
the sub-chronic			
toxicity study.			
Prenatal	Test material:	NOAEL (maternal toxicity): 30 mg/kg body weight	Study
developmental	barium chloride	NOAEL (prenatal developmental toxicity): ≥ 100 mg/kg	report,
toxicity study	dihydrate	body weight	2014 ²¹
Performed		Maternal effects:	
according to	0, 10, 30 and 100	Two dams from the 100 mg/kg bw group died on the last	
OECD TG 414	mg/kg bw	day of treatment. Another dam showed conditional decline	
and GLP guidelines		until last day of treatment, the necropsy showing	
guidennes		hydrothorax, haemorrhages in the liver and haemorrhagic	
	Exposure:	discharge in the vagina.	
Rat (Wistar),	$GD \ 0 - 20$, (oral	A slightly, but statistically significantly reduced body weight gain was observed in the high dose group as	
female	gavage, daily)	compared to the control group during the first three days of	
n = 24 rats/dose		dosing (data not shown).	
group			
		Embryo/foetal effects:	
Reliability: 1 (reliable without		The mean foetus weight was comparable in all dose groups	
restrictions) key		(data not shown). Foetal external, visceral and skeletal	
study ²⁰		examinations did not reveal any treatment-related effects. At 100 mg/kg by all features of the 3 dams that diad and/or	
,		At 100 mg/kg bw all foetuses of the 3 dams that died and/or showed severe clinical signs of toxicity were dead.	
		showed severe enhiear signs of toxicity were dead.	

Type of data/report	Test substance	Relevant about the applicable)	information study (as	Observations	Reference	
Boric acid and bo	Boric acid and borate salts					

²⁰ The reliability score for this study is according to the publically disseminated REACH Registration dossier of barium chloride, available at <u>https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered-dossier/15037/7/9/3</u>

²¹ As presented in the publically disseminated REACH registration dossier for barium chloride, available at <u>https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered-dossier/15037/7/9/3</u>

Type of	Test	Relevant information	Observations	Reference
data/report	substance	about the study (as applicable)		
Study type: cohort study (retrospective)	The study investigated boron- environmental exposure of	HYPOTHESIS TESTED: The global hypothesis was that the means of the three groups were equal (Kruskal-Wallis test).	Bandirma: Although significant boron exposure occurs in employees of the local boric acid production plant and the commercial port	Duydu et al. 2018b
Questionnaire survey Epidemiological studies on	women residing near a borate- processing plant	METHOD OF DATA COLLECTION Details: Demographic information and	of Bandirma, environmental boron exposure is negligible for the general population living in Bandirma.	
reproductive boron effects on women are scarce. The present study was designed to	(Bandirma) and a boron- mining plant (Bigadic Boron Works), both	information on pregnancy outcomes were obtained by a questionnaire survey. Information on possible confounders (alcohol consumption, smoking,	Bigadic: Boron concentrations in the drinking water (environmentally) of Iskele were very high, i.e. around 12.2 mg B/L.	
fill this gap, investigating possible boron- mediated developmental effects in women	located in Turkey.	pesticide application) was also obtained. This study did not include pregnant women, as pregnancy monitoring was not within the scope of the	Boron concentrations in air samples taken from Bandirma and Bigadic were lower than the limit of quantitation (LOQ). Therefore, environmental boron exposure	
environmentally exposed in boron-rich areas.		project. All participating women, both in Badirma and in Bigadic, accepted to provide biological samples (blood and urine) and	by inhalation was not taken into account when estimating DBE levels. The major and relevant sources of boron exposure, in both Bandirma and Bigadic, were drinking	
		specimens of food from their meals (breakfast, lunch, dinner), as well as drinking water samples.	water and food. The daily drinking water consumption of all participating females was assumed to be 2 L/day. The daily boron exposure via food was estimated using the	
		Air sampling was performed at two and five different sites of Bandirma and Bigadic, respectively. The sampling	"double plate method" for both lunch and dinner (i.e. the provided food samples from lunch and dinner menus were equal to the amounts actually	
		sites were representative of the appropriate study area. Static air sampling was performed using IOM samplers and personal air sampling pumps (SKC, AirCheck 2000). The flow	consumed). Local bread, cheese, eggs and olives were mostly consumed for breakfast. Boron concentration in these food samples was negligible. Therefore, boron exposure via breakfast was neglected.	
		rate was 2 L/min, and the sampling time was 8 h. SKC (GLA-5000), 5-µm and 25-mm filters, were used to sample inhalable dust.	$\frac{\text{DBE levels (mg B/day, Mean}}{\pm \text{SD (range)):}}$ Low exposure group: 9.73 ± 5.29 (2.26–38.27); Medium exposure group: 21.62 ± 7.87 (8.08–39.71);	
		- Biological sampling: Bandirma: sampling was performed on pre-scheduled dates in the guesthouse of	High exposure group: $24.67 \pm 11.39 (10.47-57.86)$. Blood boron levels (ng B/g	

Туре	of	Test	Relevant information	Observations	Reference
data/report		substance	about the study (as		
			applicable)		
			Eti Mine Works General	blood, Mean \pm SD (range)):	
			Management that is located distant from both the local	Low exposure group: 39.74 ± 27.60 (3.28–99.28);	
			boric acid production plant	Medium exposure group:	
			and the commercial port.	$124.19 \pm 13.10 (100.35 -$	
			The participants were asked	1496.74);	
			to bring samples of their	High exposure group: 274.58 \pm	
			actual meals (breakfast,	213.00 (151.81–975.66).	
			lunch, dinner) and of their		
			drinking water. Containers for food and water were	The study covered a number of 199 women who altogether	
			provided. After completing	gave birth to 326 children (i.e.	
			the questionnaire, blood	162 girls and 164 boys), with	
			and urine samples were	the following measured	
			taken and stored.	parameters:	
			Bigadic : sampling was	Number of childless women:	
			performed by visiting the	Low exposure group: 14;	
			participants at home. Again,	Medium exposure group: 1;	
			after completing the	High exposure group: 0.	
			questionnaire, blood, urine,		
			drinking water and meal	Number of low body weight	
			samples (breakfast, lunch and dinner) were stored.	<u>children (<2500 g):</u> Low exposure group: 21;	
			and difficitly were stored.	Medium exposure group: 6;	
			Vein blood samples were	High exposure group: 7.	
			drawn into Vacutainer		
			collection tubes containing	Number of very low body	
			heparin and stored at 4 °C	weight children(<1500g):	
			for subsequent boron	Low exposure group: 2;	
			determination. Spot urine samples of all volunteers	Medium exposure group: 1; High exposure group: 1.	
			were collected in	Ingli exposure group. 1.	
			polypropylene containers	Number of preterm births:	
			and kept at – 20 °C until	Low exposure group: 12;	
			analysis of boron and	Medium exposure group: 1;	
			creatinine. Creatinine	High exposure group: 4.	
			analysis was performed using the creatinine assay	Number of children with	
			kit of Cayman Chem. Corp.	congenital anomalies:	
			Drinking water and food	Low exposure group: 6;	
			samples were stored in	Medium exposure group: 1;	
			polypropylene containers at	High exposure group: 1.	
			-20 °C until boron analysis.	Number of spontaneous	
			STUDY PERIOD:	abortions (miscarriages):	
			2014 - 2017	Low exposure group: 21;	
				Medium exposure group: 6;	
			STUDY POPULATION	High exposure group: 6.	
			- Total population: 199		
			women residing near	Number of stillbirths:	
			Bandirma and Bigadic, divided into 3 different	Low exposure group: 0; Modium exposure group: 1:	
			groups based on the	Medium exposure group: 1; High exposure group: 1.	
			measured blood boron	ingn exposure group. 1.	
			levels, as follows:	Number of infant deaths:	
			, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	Low exposure group: 2;	

Туре	of	Test	Relevant information	Observations	Reference
data/report		substance	about the study (as applicable)		
				M. I'	
			-Low exposure group: blood boron concentrations	Medium exposure group: 2; High exposure group: 0.	
			< 100 ng B/g blood were (n	Ingu en posare Break, et	
			= 143);	Birth weight of newborns (g.	
			-Medium exposure group:	$\frac{\text{Mean} \pm \text{SD} (\text{range})):}{1 \text{ and a sum a group } 2212 + 1}$	
			with blood boron concentrations between 100	Low exposure group: 3213 ± 561 (1140 - 5000);	
			-150 ng B/g blood (n =	Medium exposure group: 3083	
			29);	± 563 (1400 - 4200);	
			-High exposure group: with blood boron concentrations	High exposure group: 3112 ± 709 (1200 - 4750).	
			between >150 ng B/g blood	709 (1200 - 4750).	
			(n = 27).	Birth weight of newborns -	
				girls (g, Mean ± SD (range)):	
			$\frac{-\text{ Age of the study}}{\text{population (mean } \pm \text{ SD}}$	Low exposure group: 3154 ± 536 (1140 - 4250);	
			(range):	Medium exposure group: 2991	
			Low exposure group $(n =$	$\pm 615 (1400 - 4000);$	
			143): $32.31 \pm 6.77 (17-49);$	High exposure group: $3057 \pm (74)(2000 - 4000)$	
			Medium exposure group (n =29): 36.28 ± 6.95 (23–49);	674 (2000 - 4000).	
			High exposure group $(n = 2\pi)$	Birth weight of newborns –	
			27): 34.56 ± 6.10 (24–46).	$\frac{boys (g, Mean \pm SD (range)):}{Low exposure group: 3269 \pm}$	
			MEASURED	580 (1400 - 5000);	
			PARAMETERS:	Medium exposure group: 3209	
			-DBE (daily boron	$\pm 464 (2000 - 4200);$	
			exposure), boron concentrations in biological	High exposure group: 3142 ± 745 (1200 - 4750).	
			fluids (i.e. blood, urine),	113 (1200 1130).	
			preterm births, numbers	Birth weights of newborns	
			of children, birth weights of newborns, congenital	(girls, boys, girls + boys) were statistically not different	
			anomalies, abortions,	between low, medium and high	
				exposure groups ($p < 0.05$).	
			neonatal death, neonatal	The boron-mediated effects on	
			death and infant death.	the birth weights analysed using linear spline regression	
				models with two knots at 100	
				and 150 ng B/g blood, did not	
				show any statistically	
				significant associations. The numbers of newborns with	
				LBW and VLBW were also	
				compared between the low,	
				medium and high exposure groups, and no statistically	
				significant differences were	
				reported.	
				Conclusions:	
				Based upon the presented	
				results, the authors concluded	
				that environmental exposure to boron does not have an adverse	
				effect on the development of	
				the offspring.	

Type of	Test	Relevant	information	Observations	Reference
data/report	substance	about the	study (as		
-		applicable)			
Mother-child	Boron	METHOD OF	DATA	Parameters measured in the	Igra et al.
cohort study	environmental	COLLECTION	N	mothers <u>:</u>	2016
(prospective)	exposure of	Details: intervi		-Average pre-pregnancy	
	pregnant	conducted by t		weight: 55 kg (range 38–86	
Endpoint	women	At enrolment,		kg);	
addressed: foetal	residing in	were interview		- <u>Average height</u> : 153 cm	
development	northern	family charact		(range 134–169 cm);	
Interviews	Argentina.	including know preferred diet,		- <u>BMI</u> : 24% had a BMI above 25;	
Interviews		menstrual peri		- <u>Time of residing in the area</u> :	
The study was		and pre-pregna		96% had lived in the study area	
designed to see		Data on materi		for several years (mean time 18	
the pregnant		parity (number		years, range 0.1–40 years);	
women at least		children), pare		-Median boron levels in	
once during		income, years	of maternal	drinking water (µg/L)	
pregnancy;		education, smo		-tertile 1 (n=60): 5246;	
preferably 2–3		consumption, o		-tertile 2 (n=60): 5965;	
times (once per		coca leaves, ar		-tertile 3 (n=60): 6072;	
trimester) in order to obtain		vitamin supple were collected		-Median serum boron levels	
repeated		follow-up visit		$(\mu g/L)$ (range):	
measures of		ionow-up visit	18.	-first trimester (n=31): 118	
exposure.		Biological sam	nples:	(32-232);	
1		-Serum sample		-second trimester (n=99):	
		fractionated fr	om whole	131 (20-273);	
		blood samples		-third trimester (n=152): 135	
		Trace Element		(26-315);	
		Activator tube		XX71 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	
		Greiner bio-on Kremsmunster		<u>-Whole blood boron levels</u> (µg/L) (range):	
		-Spot urine sar		-first trimester (n=31): 131	
		collected in dis		(55-245);	
		element-free p		-second trimester (n=99):	
		and transferred		119 (38-210);	
		polyethylene b		-third trimester (n=152): 139	
		(Zinsser Analy		(47-280);	
		Frankfurt, Ger			
		and spot-urine were collected		<u>-Urinary boron levels (µg/L)</u> (range):	
		at which time		-first trimester (n=31):	
		were also inter		10 076 (3107-19681);	
		encountered he		-second trimester (n=99):	
		problems.		9881 (2803-23058);	
				-third trimester (n=152):	
		Waters sample		10 307 (2972-21144);	
		repeatedly coll		Whole blood lithing long l	
		the study period mL polyethyle		<u>-Whole blood lithium levels</u> (µg/L) (range):	
		Inc poryeuryle	ne ootties.	-first trimester (n=31): 21	
		Boron concent	trations were	(6.6-54);	
		measured usin		-second trimester (n=99): 23	
		coupled plasm	a mass	(4.1-52);	
		spectrometry (-third trimester (n=152): 26	
		Agilent 7700×	-	(5.7-63);	
		Technologies,	Tokyo,		
	<u> </u>	Japan).		-Urinary lithium levels (µg/L)	

~ 1	of	Test	Relevant	information	Observations	Reference
data/report		substance	about the applicable)	study (as		
			applicable)			
			Because arseni	ic cesium	(range): -first trimester (n=31): 1117	
			and lithium we		(209-3768);	
			present at elev		-second trimester (n=99):	
			concentrations		1398 (262-3509);	
			drinking water		-third trimester (n=152):	
			elements may foetal growth,		1465 (273-3732);	
			to these was co		-Whole blood cesium levels	
			We additional		<u>(µg/L) (range):</u>	
			lead, cadmium		-first trimester (n=31): 132	
			selenium to tes		(12-288);	
			confounding. (lithium were n		-second trimester (n=99):	
			whole blood a		107 (8.3-220); -third trimester (n=152): 111	
			and cadmium i		(8.9-253);	
			blood and sele	nium in		
			serum, all by I		-Urinary arsenic levels (µg/L)	
			Exposure to an		$\frac{(\text{range})}{\text{first trimester } (n-21); 08}$	
			assessed by the concentrations		-first trimester (n=31): 98 (31-458);	
			arsenic (iAs) a		-second trimester (n=99):	
			and dimethylat	ted	104(26-282);	
			metabolites (M		-third trimester (n=152): 129	
			DMA) in urine		(33-414);	
			using HPLC-H	IO-ICFIVIS.	Pregnancy outcomes:	
			STUDY PERI	OD:	-Mean birth weight: $3022 \pm$	
			2012 - 2013		459 g (range 1250–4500 g),	
					with 9.4% weighing < 2500 g.	
			STUDY POPU <u> - Total populat</u>		- <u>Average birth length</u> : 48 ± 2.3 cm (range 39–53 cm)	
			women (out of		- <u>Average head circumference:</u>	
			194 women en		34 ± 1.7 cm (range 26–40cm)	
			study, 182 wer		-Average gestational age at	
			interviewed an	-	birth: 39 weeks (range 29–42	
			samples and 2/ miscarriages).	182 had	weeks), and 18% of the infants were born pre-term (before 37	
			miscarriages).		gestational weeks).	
			- Age of the st			
			population: av		The adjusted mixed effect	
			years old (13 -	-41 years)	linear models showed that the	
			MEASURED		serum boron concentration increased by 3.1 µg/L per	
			PARAMETER	RS:	gestational week on average	
			-water boron le	evels, boron	(95% CI 1.9; 4.4, p-value <	
			concentrations	-	0.001). The effect estimate for	
			fluids (i.e. bloo	od, serum and	the inverse association between	
			urine); -pregnancy ou	tcomes:	serum boron concentrations (above 80 μ g/L) and birth	
			birthweight (g)		length increased by 28% when	
			and head circu	mference	considering only the third	
			(cm), (measure		trimester instead of the whole	
			health care per		pregnancy (B –0.088 for each	
			immediately at most women)		10 μg/L increase in serum boron concentration, 95% CI	
			hours for seven		-0.14; -0.036 , p-value =	
		l	10015 101 50 101		,	

Type of		Relevant information	Observations	Reference
data/report	substance	about the study (as applicable)		
		(3.9%) who delivered at home).	0.001). The inverse association between serum boron concentrations (above 80 µg/L) and birth weight was statistically significant, and the fully adjusted effect estimate increased >2.5 times (from -4.5 to -12 g per 10 µg/L increase in serum boron) when considering only exposure in the third trimester. No statistically significant associations between serum boron concentrations > 80 µg/L and birth head circumference was found in any model. <u>Conclusions:</u> The results of this study show that elevated environmental boron levels have a statistically significant effect on the birth size of newborn.	
Cohort study (retrospective) Endpoint addressed: toxicity to reproduction Criteria for selection was the presence of legal marriage regardless of whether one member was dead or whether there had been a divorce. The study was carried out by home visits. Workers and other related individuals were contacted at borate plants and pits. Questionnaires were arranged in order to obtain	The study investigated boron- environmental exposure of residents from villages located near the borate- processing plant Bigadic, Balikesir county, Turkey.	Details on study design: The study population was divided into three sub- groups. The individuals that were interviewed in each subgroup served as probands for the study. The first subgroup of probands was identified in Region 1 which covers an area near boron-rich territories. Dwellings of Region 1 were located close to borate pits and a processing plant. Region 2 probands were from villages far from boron deposits, but were within the same zone. Region 3 probands were born and lived in areas with a mixed group, some near to and some far from deposits and pits. In Region 1, drinking water forming from (natural) springs and wells contained 29 ppm boron, but in Region 2 the concentration was between 0.3 and 0.50 ppm. In the third region, no measurements were regularly made but boron	The infant death rate in Region 2 (low boron area) was higher than those of other regions (significantly different). Although difficult to recognise spontaneous abortions and stillbirths in a retrospective study based solely on the description of the probands (mostly females), these were considered separately, but no differences were found. The observed number of congenital malformation was not sufficient within the study groups to perform statistical tests.	Tuccar et al. 1998

Type of	Test	Relevant information	Observations	Reference
data/report	substance	about the study (as		
		applicable)		
the number of pregnancies, early infant deaths, congenital malformations, stillbirths and spontaneous abortions.		content was not known to be too high. In all three areas there were active and former borate workers. From Region 1, 226 families over three generations with respect to probands (that of the proband being the second) and from Region 2, 164 families were included. There were 177 families from Region 3 and 80 from		
		Kirka.		
Retrospective study Endpoint addressed: developmental toxicity / teratogenicity. This study was based on interview data from a larger study of workplace exposure to boron-containing compounds and adverse male reproductive effects. The reproductive effects data were obtained by self- report of delays in pregnancy, pregnancy outcomes, total number of children, and gender of	The study investigated occupational boron- exposure of workers from boron mines and processing plants located in the city of Kuandian, China.	The authors evaluated reproductive health in a cohort of boron mining and processing male workers (N=936) and a comparison group of males (N=251) in northeast China. The comparison group was selected from a community 30 miles away from the boron mines and processing plants with a known low background of environmental boron. No exposure measurements were available for the wives of the workers whose boron exposure would be through environmental sources such as food and water. However, concentrations of boron in the surface water, well water, soil, legumes and potatoes of the boron workers group were greater than in the comparison group.	Exposure estimates for the boron workers was 31.3 mg boron/day and 1.40 mg B/day for the comparison group (Scialli et al. 2010). Well water in the boron group ranged from 37 to 600 times the comparison group, and the mean boron concentrations in vegetables and potatoes from the boron group was approximately double those found in the comparison group. Reproductive health parameters evaluated included: delay in pregnancy, multiple births, spontaneous miscarriage, induced abortion, stillbirth, tubal or ectopic pregnancy, and boy/girl ratio. No statistically significant differences were observed between the boron workers and the comparison group after adjustment for age, educational level, race, smoking, ethanol use, and soybean intake.	Chang et al. 2006
children. Assessment of environmental daily boron exposure limits	The study investigated environmental exposure to boron of residents of Balikesir area.	The aim of the study was to estimate daily boron exposure in 66 males in Turkey living in a B-rich area using water containing at least 2 mg/L boron with an average age of 38 - 55 (SE 1.66) years and an average number of years of	The average daily boron exposure was calculated as 6.77 (SE 0.47) mg in the study group and 1.26 (SE 0.1) mg in the controls. None of the subjects reported any health problems that may be linked to high boron exposure.	Korkmaz et al. 2007

Type of data/report		Relevant information	Observations	Reference
data/report	substance	about the study (as applicable)		
		residence in the boron rich area of 35 - 89 (SE 1.73). Another group of 57 males living in the city centres of Balikesir and Ankara were taken as controls; the average age and number of years of residence for this group were 29.44 (SE 1.43) and 10.26 (SE 1.83) years respectively. As it is assumed that boron levels in urine reflect daily boron exposure, the amount of urinary boron of both the study and control groups was analysed using an inductively coupled plasma optical emission spectrometry technique (ICP-OES).		
Case control study (retrospective) Endpoint addressed: developmental toxicity / teratogenicity Supporting study	The study investigated the effect of vaginal tablets containing boric acid.	The effects of the use of boric acid vaginal tablets for treatment of infectious diseases of the genital organs were evaluated in a Hungarian Case Control Surveillance of Congenital Abnormalities (HCCSCA) study. In most cases, treatment consisted of two vaginal tablets of 30 mg each daily for 7 days.	For the 22843 infants born with congenital abnormalities in the study group, 43 mothers (0.19%) had received boric acid treatment and for the 38151 controls, 52 mothers (0.14%) had received boric acid treatment. There were no significant differences between the groups in maternal sociodemographic characteristics, occurrence of acute and chronic diseases and frequently used drugs. The extremely high prevalence of acute infectious diseases of the genital organs (85.8% in the study group and 91.9% among controls) explains the use of the boric acid. Cases of congenital abnormalities affecting the skeletal system only occurred in the offspring of others who were treated with boric acid during their entire pregnancy. In this study there was a higher risk of neural tube defects when boric acid was used during the second and third months of pregnancy, but this finding was based on only two cases.	Acs et al. 2006

Type of data/report	Test substance	Relevant about the applicable)	informa study	ation (as	Observations	Reference
					It is suggested that topical exposure to boric acid is unlikely to induce developmental toxicity because unless the skin or vaginal epithelium is severely damaged, boric acid absorption is limited.	

Table 22: Summary table of other studies relevant for developmental toxicity
--

Type of data/report ²²	Test substance	Relevant information about the study (as applicable)	Observations	Reference
Boric acid		-		
Benchmark dose (BMD) approach Rat (Sprague-	Test material: boric acid Exposure: 20 days (oral:	In this analysis of the developmental toxicity observed in rats exposed to boric acid in their diet, benchmark dose (BMD) analyses have been	BMD (developmental toxicity): 59 mg/kg bw/day, equivalent to 10.3 mg B/kg bw/day, based on decreased foetal body weight provided the best basis for BMD	Allen et al. 1996
Dawley) Reliability: 2 (reliable with restrictions)	feed).	conducted using two existing studies. By considering various endpoints and modelling approaches for those endpoints, the best approach for incorporating all of the information available from the studies could be determined. In this case, the approach involved combining data from two studies which were similarly designed and ware	calculations. The benchmark dose is defined as the 95 % lower bound on the dose corresponding to a 5 % decrease in the mean fetal weight (BMDL05). Results are based on the studies of Heindel et al. 1992 and Price et al. 1996a,b.	
		similarly designed and were conducted in the same laboratory to calculate BMDs that were more accurate and more precise than from either study alone.		

 $^{^{22}}$ The reliability score of the study presented in Table 22 is according to the CLH dossier of boric acid, assessed by RAC in 2013.

10.10.5 Short summary and overall relevance of the provided information on adverse effects on development

10.10.5.1 Animal studies

Data on barium diboron tetraoxide

US EPA test guideline prenatal developmental toxicity study (Study report, 1993b)

In the prenatal developmental toxicity study performed according to US EPA guidelines and in compliance with GLP, 20 pregnant female rabbits were treated with 0, 2, 10, 20 mg barium diboron tetraoxide (equivalent to 0, 0.18, 0.9 and 1.8 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively) via oral gavage. The treatment was administered during gestation days (GD) 7 - 19 and observed until GD 29, when gross necropsy was carried out following sacrifice. At 1.8 mg B/kg bw/day, 1 dam died on GD 16 and another dam aborted on GD 22, and two other dams were found to be non-pregnant. No clinical signs attributable to the treatment were observed in the high dose-group dam that died on GD 16. No statistically significant changes in food consumption, body weight, mean body weight and gravid uterine weights were reported.

At the highest dose level, the necropsy examination of the foetuses revealed increased incidence (not clear if stat. sign.) of visceral malformations expressed as hydrocephaly in 12.5% of the litters (2/16 litters) and diaphragmatic hernia observed in one foetus (1/16 litters). However, due to the historical data showing hydrocephaly in control animals, this developmental effect was not considered treatment-related by the study director. Skeletal malformations, primarily expressed as fused sternebrae, extra ossification sites, vertebral anomalies with/without associated rib anomalies were seen in 5.6%, 0.78%, 4.2% and 2.91% of foetuses at 0, 0.18, 0.9 and 1.8 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively. At the highest dose level, 1/103 foetuses presented carpal flexure on the right front limb. However, it has to be noted that unusually high external, visceral and skeletal malformation incidences were reported for the control groups of this study.

According to the presented findings, the NOAEL for maternal toxicity in rabbits was 0.9 mg B/kg bw/day, while the NOAEL for developmental toxicity was set at 1.8 mg B/kg bw/day. No information was available from the necropsy examination performed on the foetuses of the high-dose group dam that died during the treatment. The dose-rationale of this study was based on a preliminary range-finding study where pregnant female rabbits were administered via oral gavage doses of 0, 20, 55, 90, 125 and 160 mg/kg bw/day (equivalent to 0, 1.8, 4.95, 8.1, 11.25 and 14.4 mg B/kg bw/day), during GD 7 – 19. One out of 7 dams died at 1.8 mg B/kg bw/day. Maternal toxicity, expressed as mortality and changes in the general clinical condition of the animals, was observed from 1.8 mg B/kg bw/day and higher. No information was available on the performed foetal examinations. No adverse effects on development were reported at the dose levels available for evaluation (i.e. 20, 55 and 90 mg/kg bw/day, equivalent to 1.8, 4.95 and 8.1 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively) (data not shown).

Data on boric acid and borate salts

The assessment of adverse effects on the development of the offspring of barium diboron tetraoxide is supported with read-across data from studies via oral exposure of boric acid and borate salts. In aqueous solutions at physiological and acidic pH, low concentrations of simple borates such as boric acid and borate salts will predominantly exist as undissociated boric acid. The toxicokinetics and toxicological effects of systemic barium diboron tetraoxide after oral exposure are therefore expected to be similar as boric acid and borate salts.

Prenatal developmental toxicity in rats (Price et al. 1996a)

Price et al. 1996a conducted a GLP-compliant study where female rats were administered 0, 19, 36, 55, 76 and 143 mg boric acid (equivalent to 0, 3.3, 6.3, 9.6, 13.3, 25 mg B/kg bw, respectively) via diet in two different phases: Phase I when teratologic evaluation was performed (days 0 - 20 postmating) and Phase II for postnatal evaluation (the dams delivered and the pups were sacrificed after weaning). No maternal deaths occurred and no treatment-related clinical signs of general toxicity were observed in the dams, at any dose level. A statistically significant reduction in the mean foetal body

weight per litter was observed at the two highest dose levels (i.e. by approx. 6% at 13.3 mg B/kg bw/day and by approx. 13% at 25 mg B/kg bw/day, compared to controls). The viability of the offspring was not affected in any dose group. Treatment-related skeletal changes were observed at the highest dose levels. Thus, statistically significant increases in the incidence of short rib XIII (i.e. by approx. 1.5% at 13.3 mg B/kg bw/day and by approx. 3.4% at 25 mg B/kg bw/day, compared to controls) and wavy rib (by approx. 2.1 at 13.3 mg B/kg bw/day and by approx. 10% at 25 mg B/kg bw/day, compared to controls) amongst offspring were reported. Based on the observed results, the LOAEL for skeletal effects in rats was 13.3 mg B/kg bw/day and the NOAEL was 9.6 mg B/kg bw/day.

Moreover, the authors collected blood samples from the pregnant female rats used for Phase I investigation and prepared the samples for boron analysis through inductively coupled plasma optical emission spectrometry (Price et al. 1997). The average blood concentrations of boron increased with increasing dietary levels of boron, giving rise to 0.229 ± 0.143 , 0.564 ± 0.211 , 0.975 ± 0.261 , 1.27 ± 0.298 , 1.53 ± 0.546 , or $2.82 \pm 0.987 \ \mu g$ B/g whole blood for the control through all the dose levels, respectively. The maternal blood levels of boron were positively correlated with embryo/foetal toxicity. Dams exposed to 9.6 mg B/kg bw/day, had a level of $1.27 \pm 0.298 \ \mu g$ B/g whole blood which corresponded with the NOAEL for developmental toxicity (9.6 mg B/kg bw/day). The developmental toxicity LOAEL (13.3 mg B/kg bw/day) corresponded to a blood boron concentration of $1.53 \pm 0.546 \ \mu g$ B/g whole blood of the dams exposed to 76 mg boric acid/kg bw/day.

Prenatal developmental toxicity studies in rabbits (Price et al. 1996b; Heindel et al. 1994)

In two prenatal developmental toxicity studies, pregnant female rabbits were administered 0, 62.5, 125 and 250 mg/kg bw/day boric acid (equivalent to 0, 11, 22 and 44 mg B/kg bw/day) via oral gavage during GD 6 – 19. Increased incidence of vaginal bleeding, considered to be treatment-related (2 - 11 pregnant females/day bled between GD 19 - 30), was observed at the highest dose level 44 mg B/kg bw/day. All does with vaginal bleeding had no live foetuses on GD 30. Reduced food intake and body weight gain were reported at the highest dose level (statistically significantly reduced by approx. 31% and 10%, respectively, as compared to controls) during the treatment period. However, the corrected (for gravid uterus weight) maternal weight change was increased.

At 44 mg B/kg bw/day statistically significant increased rate of resorptions per litter was reported (89.9% versus 6.3 in control, p<0.05) and 73% of the does had 100% resorptions. Consequently, the average number of live foetuses per litter in this dose group was severely reduced (2.3 compared to 8.8 in control, p<0.05).

The incidence of external malformations was also statistically significantly increased in the 44 mg B/kg bw/day dose group compared to controls (11.1% versus 0.8%, p<0.05).

Furthermore, statistically significantly increased incidences of visceral malformations were observed only at the highest dose level, i.e. interventricular cardiovascular septal defect (0.6% in controls vs. 57% at 44 mg B/kg bw/day), enlarged aorta (0% in controls vs. 36% at 44 mg B/kg bw/day), papillary muscle malformations (3% in controls vs. 14% at 43.5 mg B/kg bw/day) and double outlet right ventricle (0% in controls vs. 14% at 44 mg B/kg bw/day). Other visceral effects were agenesis of the gall bladder, enlarged gall bladder and enlarged heart. Based on the results reported by this study, the LOAELs for both maternal and developmental toxic effects were set at 44 mg B/kg bw/day.

It is also noted that the incidence of skeletal malformations was increased at 44 mg B/kg bw/day, although not statistically significant compared to control due to high background incidence of cleft sternum in the controls. The findings of increased incidences of fused ribs and fused sternebrae (7% versus 1.3% in control, and 7% versus 0% in control) at 44 mg B/kg bw/day (each effect seen in only 1 foetus, in separate litters) were also considered equivocal.

The studies performed in rats and rabbits by Price and colleagues (1996a and b) show that boron treatment led to maternal toxicity only for the female rabbits and adverse effects on the development of both rabbit and rat offspring, mainly expressed as visceral and skeletal malformations. Moreover, the developmental effects in rats were observed in the absence of maternal general toxicity and are thus considered relevant for classification purposes.

Prenatal developmental toxicity study in rat and mouse (Heindel et al, 1992)

Heindel et al. 1992 investigated the developmental toxicity of boric acid in both rat and mouse pregnant females. Rats were administered 0, 78, 163 and 330 mg/kg bw boric acid (equivalent to 0, 14, 29 and 58 mg B/kg bw) via feed during GD 0 - 20 and 539 mg boric (equivalent to 94 mg B/kg bw) acid during GD 6 - 15. In rats, at 29 and 58 mf B/kg bw/day, maternal toxicity was reported as kidney lesions in mice and increased liver and kidney weights for both species. In mice, at the highest dose level (175 mg B/kg bw/day) statistically significantly reduced body weight gain (by approx. 25%) of the dams was also observed. However, when correcting for gravid uterus weight, there was no statistically significant difference compared to control.

In the rat, developmental toxic effects such as statistically significantly decreased average foetal body weight for all treated groups ranging from 7% decrease (at 14 mg B/kg bw) to 50 % (at 94 mg B/kg bw), malformations of the central nervous system (i.e. enlarged lateral ventricles of the brain) in 5.5% of the foetuses at 58 mg B/kg bw/day and 26.5% of the foetuses at 94 mg B/kg bw/day, eyes (i.e. displaced eyes, convoluted retina) in 11% of the foetuses at 94 mg B/kg bw/day, were observed. Moreover, increased incidences of skeletal malformations such as agenesis of rib XIII in 6.2% and 12.5% of foetuses (compared to 0.23 and 0% in the respective control groups) at 58 and 94 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively, were reported. Shortening of rib XIII was also seen in 39% and 37% of foetuses. at 58 and 94 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively. Cardiovascular and central nervous system morphological defects were absent in mice foetuses. A statistically significantly increased resorption rate was reported at 175 mg B/kg bw/day (approx. 19% per litter vs. 6% in controls). Furthermore, statistically significantly reduced foetal body weight by approx. 12% at 79 mg B/kg bw/day and by approx. 33% at 175 mg B/kg bw/day, and an increased incidence of short rib XIII (4% vs. 0% in controls) at the highest dose level, were observed. Based on the findings of this study, the LOAEL for developmental toxicity in rats was 14 mg B/kg bw/day while the LOAEL for developmental effects in mice was 79 mg B/kg bw/day. The results of this study showed that rats had a greater sensitivity to the developmental effects of boric acid than mice.

Multi-generational reproduction toxicity studies in rat (Weir and Fisher 1972) and mouse (Fail et al., 1991)

The three-generation study performed by Weir and Fisher 1972 in rats showed that live birth indices, litter size, weights and external appearance of the offspring for all filial generations (F1, F2 and F3) at both 5.9 and 17.5 mg B/kg bw/day, were comparable with those of the control groups. No information on the developmental effects of boric acid or borax was available at 58.5 mg B/kg bw/day because the parents of the highest dose group were sterile. Furthermore, in a multi-generation study in mice, the lowest dose level (26.6 mg B/kg bw/day) revealed statistically significantly decreased live pup weight (by approx. 3% as compared to controls) in the pups of the F2 generation. At the same dose level, there were no statistically significantly decreased live birth index (by approx. 11% vs. controls) and number of litters per pair (by approx. 51% vs. controls) were reported at the mid dose level (111.3 mg B/kg bw/day) for the F1 generation. None of the parental pairs produced any offspring at the highest dose level (221 mg B/kg bw/day).

Rodent dominant lethal test (Marat et al. 2018)

In a recent study, male rats were administered 0, 1 and 10 mg B/kg bw/day via oral gavage for 60 days and mated with untreated females after the cessation of the treatment (Marat et al. 2018). While a 94% increase in post-implantation loss and 82% increase in the number of dead embryos per female were reported at 1 mg B/kg bw/day, the post-implantation loss index increased by 157% at 10 mg B/kg bw/day.

Benchmark dose approach (Allen et al. 1996)

The summary table of other studies relevant for developmental toxicity (Table 12) presents a benchmark dose (BMD) approach performed by Allen et al. 1996. A BMD was developed based on the studies described above (Heindel et al. 1992; Price et al. 1996a) as an alternative for reference value calculations, instead of only using the NOAEL, since the BMD can be applied in a consistent

manner throughout different studies and is not limited to one of the experimental doses. The authors considered decreased foetal body weight as the most suitable basis for calculating the BMD of 59 mg boric acid/kg bw/day (10.3 mg B/kg bw/day), which is very close to the NOAEL value for developmental toxicity (55 mg boric acid/kg bw, equivalent to 9.6 mg B/kg bw) set by Price et al. 1996a.

Conclusion on animal studies of barium diboron tetraoxide, boric acid and borate salts

There are no clear findings of barium diboron tetraoxide developmental toxicity in rabbit offspring. The reported developmental effect (i.e. hydrocephaly) seen at 1.8 mg B/kg bw/day was not considered treatment-related by the study director, due to an increased incidence of hydrocephaly seen in the historical control data of the testing facility. Non-statistically significant incidences of other developmental effects (i.e. external and skeletal malformations) have been reported, but due to the control animals showing unusually high incidences of such effects, a clear conclusion regarding the developmental toxicity of barium diboron tetraoxide cannot be made solely based upon this study. Furthermore, the preceding dose-range finding study reported maternal toxicity expressed as mortality from 1.8 mg B/kg bw and higher. However, no information on the maternal (or foetal) examinations was available for this study. Since the dam that died in the PNDT study was internally normal and did not present any treatment-related clinical signs, it is thus not clear if maternal mortality was due to general toxicity or a gavage error.

Moreover, in a boric acid PNDT study performed in rabbits, no maternal deaths occurred and the LOAEL for maternal toxicity (based on reduced body weight gain and abortions) was the same as the LOAEL for developmental toxicity (based on increased resorptions and cardiovascular malformations), i.e. 43.5 mg B/kg bw/day (Price et al. 1996b). Given that the doses administered in the barium diboron tetraoxide PNDT study are considerably lower than those used in the PNDT study with boric acid, it is therefore not possible to conclude that barium diboron tetraoxide does not affect the development of the offspring.

According to Annex I, paragraph 3.7.1.4 of the CLP Regulation, developmental toxicity primarily consists of the following major manifestations: (1) death of the developing organism, (2) structural abnormality, (3) altered growth and (4) functional deficiency. The above presented animal data on boric acid and borate salts show clear evidence of boron developmental effects in different species, i.e. rats, mice and rabbits, as follows:

1) Death of the developing organism

In a continuous breeding study in mice, statistically significantly decreased live birth index (by approx. 11% vs. controls) and number of litters per pair (by approx. 51% vs. controls) were observed at 111.3 mg B/kg bw/day (Fail et al. 1991). In rabbits, markedly increased rates of resorptions per litter (89.9 %) where only 6 litters survived until GD 30 (compared to 18 – 23 litters in controls) were seen in the presence of some maternal toxicity at 44 mg B/kg bw/day (Price et al. 1996b; Heindel et al. 1994). Moreover, in rats at 94 mg B/kg bw/day (Heindel et al. 1992) the rate of resorptions was also increased (36% resorptions per litter vs. 4% in controls) at the highest dose tested (94 mg B/kg bw/day).

2) Structural abnormality

In rats, skeletal malformations such as agenesis of rib XIII in 6.2% and 12.5% of foetuses and shortening of rib XIII in 39% and 37% of foetuses, at 58 and 94 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively, were seen in the absence of maternal toxicity (Heindel et al. 1992). Increased incidence of short rib XIII (i.e. by approx. 1.5% at 13.3 mg B/kg bw/day and by approx. 3.4% at 25 mg B/kg bw/day, compared to controls) in absence of maternal toxicity was also observed in the study by Price et al. (1996a). Similarly, in mice, significantly increased incidence of short rib XIII (4% vs. 0% in controls) was reported at 175 mg B/kg bw/day, in the absence of maternal toxicity.

Moreover, visceral malformations such as enlarged lateral ventricles of the brain in 5.5% of foetuses at 58 mg B/kg bw/day and 26.5% of the foetuses at 94 mg B/kg bw/day, as well as malformations of the eyes (i.e. displaced eyes, convoluted retina) in 11% of the foetuses at 94 mg B/kg bw/day, were also observed in rat (Heindel et al. 1992). While skeletal malformations were seen in both rat and mice

pups, the effects on the CNS and eyes were reported only for rats.

In rabbits, cardiovascular malformations such as interventricular septal defects (57% vs. 0.6% in controls), enlarged aorta (36% vs. 0% in controls), papillary muscle malformations (14% vs. 3% in controls) and double outlet right ventricle (14% vs. 0% in controls) were seen at the highest dose level (43.5 mg B/kg bw/day) where some maternal toxicity was also present (Price et al. 1996b). The incidence of skeletal defects (i.e. cleft sternum, detached extra rib – lumbar 1, fused sternebrae and fused rib) was increased for all dose levels (11, 22 and 44 mg B/kg bw/day), but not statistically significantly different from controls. As presented above, the effects on the skeletal system were consistently observed in rats, mice and rabbits while the cardiovascular defects were specific only for the rabbit offspring.

3) Altered growth

Markedly reduced (p<0.05) mean foetal body weights per litter were observed in rat pups, i.e. by approx. 6% at 13.3 mg B/kg bw/day and 13% at 25 mg B/kg bw/day, compared to controls, in the absence of maternal toxicity (Price et al. 1996a). Moreover, a severely dose-dependent decrease in average rat pup foetal body weight as compared to controls was noted for all dose levels (7, 13, 37 and 50% at 14, 29, 58 and 94 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively) where no marked maternal toxicity was evident.

Moreover, a significant decrease (p<0.05) in mouse foetal body weight was reported at 79 and 175 mg B/kg bw/day, where some maternal toxicity (effects on the kidneys) was observed only at the highest dose level (Heindel et al. 1992).

4) Functional deficiency

The CNS morphological defects (i.e. enlarged lateral ventricles of the brain) were seen in rats at 58 and 94 mg B/kg bw/day, and were considered to be developmental effects *per se* and not due to growth retardation (Heindel et al. 1992). The implication of these neurodevelopmental effects on the functional development of rats is however not clear.

Data on barium chloride

Test guideline prenatal developmental toxicity study in rats (Study report, 2014)

In a prenatal developmental toxicity study (OECD TG 414, GLP guidelines) female rats were administered 0, 10, 30 and 100 mg/kg bw/day throughout GD 0 – 20, via oral gavage (Study report, 2014). The rationale for the administered doses was based on a dose range finding study where mated females (n = 5/dose group) were administered 0, 50, 175 and 250 mg/kg bw/day during GD 0 – 21 via oral gavage. In the dose-range finding study, three dams from the mid-dose group and 2 dams from the high dose group died after a single administration and thus, the remaining animals were re-distributed in a mid-dose group receiving 100 mg/kg bw/day from GD 2 onwards. No effects on the implantation sites, early and late resorption or the mean number of live pups were reported in any dose group of the dose range finding study.

In the main PNDT study, two dams died on the last day of treatment at 100 mg/kg bw/day. At the same dose level, another dam showed conditional decline until GD 21, the necropsy revealing effects such as hydrothorax, haemorrhages in the liver and haemorrhagic discharge in the vagina. These maternal toxicity effects were considered treatment-related. All foetuses were found dead at necropsy in these three dams and the cause was ascribed to maternal toxicity. The mean foetus weight was comparable in all dose groups (data not shown). Foetal external, visceral and skeletal examinations did not reveal any treatment-related effects (data not shown). The NOAEL for prenatal developmental toxicity according to the findings of this study was 100 mg/kg bw/day.

Non-guideline reproductive toxicity study in rats and mice (Dietz et al. 1992)

Dietz et al. 1992 investigated the effects of barium chloride on rats administered 0, 1000, 2000 and 4000 ppm (equivalent to 0, 120, 240 and 480 mg /kg bw/day, respectively) and on mice administered 0, 500, 1000 and 2000 ppm (equivalent to 0, 90, 180 and 360 mg /kg bw/day) via drinking water. Male

rats and mice were treated for a pre-mating period of 60 days, while the females of both species were treated 30 days prior to mating. One rat dam died at the highest dose level, the necropsy revealing 7 foetuses and one resorption site. No information on maternal body weight, body weight gain or feed consumption is given for either rats or mice.

At 480 mg/kg bw/day, the rat pup weight at birth was significantly (p<0.01) reduced by 9%, as compared to controls. Pup survival until PND 5 was >99% for all dose levels. No external anomalies were observed in the rat offspring at any dose level.

In mice, at 180 mg/kg bw/day, a significant reduction (p<0.05) in litter size on PND 0 (by approx. 26%) and PND 5 (by approx. 29%) as compared to controls, was observed in the absence of maternal toxicity. Since this effect on pup viability was not seen in the high dose group, it is considered of less toxicological relevance. A few pups were found dead at birth (number not reported) for all dose groups (not specified for controls) and pup survival until PND 5 ranged between 98 - 100 % (dose level not specified, data not shown). No statistically significant changes in live pup body weights and no external abnormalities were reported.

Conclusion on animal studies of barium chloride

From the available studies on developmental toxicity of barium chloride in mice and rats there is not sufficient evidence to conclude that barium has the potential to exert adverse effects on development of the offspring. Thus, barium cannot be considered to be responsible for the adverse effects on the development of the offspring for barium diboron tetraoxide and the data are thus not further considered for classification purposes.

10.10.5.2 Human data

There is no available information on human exposure to barium diboron tetraoxide. However, data were read-across from epidemiological studies on boric acid and borate salts exposure. Several epidemiological studies performed on occupationally and/or environmentally exposed populations to boron from Turkey, Argentina, China and Hungary were assessed.

A recent retrospective cohort study was performed in order to investigate environmental boron exposure effects on women and their offspring (Duydu et al. 2018b). A total number of 199 women residing near a borate-processing plant (Bandirma) and a boron-mining plant (Bigadic Boron Works) both located in Turkey, participated in the study. Biological (i.e. blood and urine) as well as food, air and water samples were collected. Data on pregnancy outcomes were collected through a questionnaire survey that included series of questions on age, duration of marriage, preterm birth, numbers of children, birth weights of newborns, congenital anomalies, abortions, miscarriage, stillbirth, early neonatal death, neonatal death, infant death and possible confounders (smoking, alcohol consumption and pesticide application). The questionnaires were filled in by the participants and information on a total number of 326 children (162 girls and 164 boys) was collected. Based upon the measured blood boron levels, the participants were assigned into three groups: low exposure group (n = 143) with 39.74 ± 27.60 ng B/g blood and a DBE of 9.73 ± 5.29 mg B/day; medium exposure group (n = 29) with 124.19 \pm 13.10 ng B/g blood and a DBE of 21.62 \pm 7.87 mg B/day and high exposure group (n = 27) with 274.58 \pm 213.00 ng B/g blood and a DBE of 24.67 \pm 11.39 mg B/day. The correlation between the DBE and blood boron concentrations was statistically significant (Pearson's correlation, p<0.01). However, no statistically significant differences were observed when comparing the reproductive outcomes between each exposure group. No statistically significant associations between the measured blood boron levels of mothers and the birth weights of newborns were observed either. For the medium exposure group, it was found however that an increase of 1 ng B/g blood resulted in a decrease of birth weight by 4.1 g, but no statistical significance was achieved (p>0.05). Taking into account the results of this study, the authors concluded that environmental exposure to boron (at the above measured DBE levels) appears to be irrelevant for humans and thus, does not induce adverse effects on the development of the offspring.

As also stated by the authors, the main limitations of this study are represented by the low sample size and self-reporting of data. The time difference between the time of birth and the time of collecting the data represents another limitation, since the birth weights of the newborns were provided retrospectively by the mothers. Therefore, the above described limitations could have impacted the statistical power of the reported results. Moreover, the highest individual blood boron concentration measured by this recent study (975.66 ng B/g blood) is evidently below the blood level (1270 ng B/g blood) corresponding to the NOAEL for developmental toxicity in rats (i.e. 9.6 mg B/kg bw/day) set by the RAC for boric acid (RAC Opinion on boric acid, 2014), based on the results of Price et al. 1997.

Furthermore, a prospective mother-child cohort study investigated environmental exposure of boron through drinking water on pregnant women residing in Salta, Argentina (Igra et al. 2016). The study was designed so that they would be seen 2-3 times, in order to repeatedly measure environmental exposure to boron via drinking water during the whole length of the pregnancies. Biological (urine and blood) and water samples as well as data on maternal age, parity (number of born children), parental monthly income, years of maternal education, smoking, alcohol consumption, chewing of coca leaves, and prenatal vitamin supplementation were gathered at the follow-up visits. The pregnancy outcomes, i.e. weight, length and head circumference, were measured at birth. Arsenic, cesium and lithium were also present in the drinking water, but were adjusted for in the statistical models used by the authors. The median serum boron concentration during pregnancy was 133 μ g/L (ranging between 0.73 – 605 μ g/L) and resembled the median level measured in the whole blood, i.e. 134 μ g/L (ranging between 12 $-542 \mu g/L$), while the mean urine boron level was higher, i.e. 10 494 $\mu g/L$ (ranging between 1590 -35 551 μ g/L). A statistically significant (p = 0.043) inverse association was found between serum blood boron levels >80 µg/L and birth length, i.e. newborns were 0.7 cm shorter per each 100 µg/L increase in serum boron levels. Moreover, this association was more pronounced (increased by 28%) during the third trimester of pregnancy, when the highest serum boron concentrations were the highest $(0.73 - 447 \mu g/L)$. An increase in serum boron of 100 $\mu g/L$ in the third trimester was associated with a 0.9 cm reduction in length and 120 g decrease in the birth weight of newborns (p = 0.001 and 0.021, respectively).

As part of a more comprehensive investigation of human exposure to boron, Tuccar et al. 1998 assessed reproductive and developmental effects in families (covering three generations) living in Turkey. Three regions were identified based upon environmental boron exposure: Region I (high boron levels due to being closely located to processing plants and borate pits, with a drinking water level of 229 ppm B), Region II (located far from borate pits, with a drinking water level of 0.30 - 0.50ppm B) and Region III (the population of this region represented a mixture of residents coming from both high- and low-exposure areas). The sample size consisted of 226 families (covering three generations) for Region I, 164 families for Region II and 177 families coming from Region III. Region II (low boron exposure) had the highest infant death rate as compared to the other regions (39 vs. 30 and 15 for Region I and Region III, respectively). Based on the gathered results (through questionnaires), the authors concluded that environmental, and both environmental and occupational exposure to boron do not induce developmental effects in humans. Nevertheless, this study presents several limitations that could have negatively influenced the results such as small sample size and the fact that prenatal development was not assessed. As presented above in Table 21, Korkmaz et al. 2007 estimated a daily exposure of 6.77 mg B/kg bw/day for the high-exposure area (Region I) which is however below the NOAEL for developmental toxicity in rats (9.6 mg B/kg bw/day).

Chang et al. 2006 investigated the developmental effects in the children born to boron mining and processing workers from China. A total number of 936 exposed workers and a comparison group composed of 251 controls participated in the study. The exposure estimates were 31.3 mg B/day and 1.4 mg B/day, which can be converted into values of 0.45 mg B/kg bw/day and 0.02 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively, assuming an average body weight of 70 kg. The evaluated parameters (i.e. stillbirths, delayed pregnancies, multiple births, spontaneous miscarriages and tubal or ectopic pregnancies) did not show any statistical difference from controls. Thus, the authors concluded that the offspring coming from parents occupationally exposed to boron do not present developmental toxic effects. However, since no exposure measurements were carried out for the wives of the workers, this conclusion is solely based on the occupational exposure of the fathers, which is below the NOAEL for developmental toxicity in rats (9.6 mg B/kg bw/day).

Acs et al. 2006 carried out a case-control study in Hungary in order to investigate the occurrence of congenital abnormalities of infants born to mothers using vaginal tablets containing boric acid as treatment for infectious diseases of the genital organs (two tablets of 30 mg each, daily for 7 days). A percentage of 0.14 mothers (52 out of 38 151) from the control group and 0.19% (43 out of 22 843) from the study group received boric acid tablets. The results of this study show a higher risk of neural tube defect (2 cases) when the exposure to boric acid appeared during the second and third months of pregnancy. In addition, skeletal defects occurred in the infants of mothers exposed to boric acid treatment for the whole length of the pregnancy. The authors conclude that boric acid might have a weak teratogenic potential, but taking into account the reduced absorption through topical exposure, this would most likely appear in the case of a damaged vaginal epithelium.

Conclusion on the human studies of boron

The only prospective mother-child cohort study available on boron environmental exposure shows a significant inverse association between serum boron levels >80 μ g/L and birth size. Moreover, this association increased by 28% in the third trimester of pregnancy, when the serum boron concentrations were higher. The serum boron concentrations during pregnancy ranged between 0.73 – 605 μ g/L (median of 133 μ g/L) and correlated strongly with the whole-blood boron levels (Igra et al. 2016). A serum level of 80 μ g/L would correspond to 75 ng B/g blood (blood density level of 1060 kg/m³), which is lower than the blood level (1270 ng B/g blood) associated with the NOAEL of developmental toxicity in rats (Price et al. 1997). These recent epidemiological data thus indicate that environmental exposure to boron might have an adverse effect on the development of offspring. However, it cannot be excluded that the observed effects can be the result of a combined exposure to lithium.

The other retrospective studies on environmental and/or occupational boron exposure did not provide clear evidence of developmental effects. These studies are however associated with limitations such as small sample size, self-reporting of data, and the fact that high boron exposure levels were still lower than the NOAEL for developmental toxicity in rats. The epidemiological data do not contradict the animal data and therefore, there is no reason to question the relevance for humans of the developmental toxicity observed in the animal studies.

10.10.6 Comparison with the CLP criteria

As stated in the CLP Regulation (EC) No 1272/2008, the classification of substances in category 1A for reproductive toxicity (known human reproductive toxicant) is "*largely based on evidence from humans*". No human data on developmental toxicity of barium diboron tetraoxide are available, but read-across epidemiological information on developmental toxicity of boron was assessed. These studies do not provide clear evidence of developmental effects and present various methodological limitations that might have influenced the reported results. Therefore, classification of barium diboron tetraoxide as Repr. 1A is not appropriate.

In accordance with the CLP criteria for classification, the available animal data provide clear evidence of developmental toxicity manifestations (death of the developing organism, structural abnormality and altered growth) in different species (i.e. rats, mice and rabbits). These are primarily expressed as severely decreased foetal weight observed in the absence of maternal toxicity, effects on the CNS that are not due to growth retardation, anomalies of the eyes, and cardiovascular and skeletal malformations. While the most common developmental effects (i.e. agenesis or shortening of rib XIII) were observed in both rats and mice, the developmental cardiovascular effects (i.e. interventricular septal defects, enlarged aorta, pulmonary artery and aorta arising from the right ventricle) were seen only in rabbits.

Furthermore, an increased prenatal mortality consistent across species was observed, i.e. 73% for rabbits, 36% for rats and 19% for mice at 44, 94 and 111.3 mg B/kg bw/day, respectively. The available data indicate that the rat is the most sensitive species to boron developmental effects, with an overall NOAEL of 9.6 mg B/kg bw/day.

Therefore, based on the observed developmental toxic effects that are not considered to be nonspecific secondary consequences of maternal toxicity, classification of barium diboron tetraoxide as **Repr. 1B, H360D** is warranted.

Concentration limits

In line with the CLP guidance (2017), concentration limits for developmental toxicity are derived by calculating the reproductive toxicity dose descriptor, i.e. ED10 (the dose level at which a change of 10% compared to the concurrent control group is observed). It should be noted that the available data on barium diboron tetraoxide itself were not sufficient in order to derive the ED10 since there was no clear evidence of developmental toxicity, and thus read-across data on boric acid and borate salts were used.

According to the RAC (RAC opinions on boric acid, disodium octaborate anhydrate and disodium octaborate tetrahydrate, 2014), increased incidence of short rib XIII considered as a malformation, was identified as the most sensitive effect on the development of the offspring in rats, based upon a prenatal developmental toxicity study with boric acid (Price et al. 1996a). As also stated by RAC in the respective opinions on boric acid and borate salts in 2014, the foetal incidence of short rib XIII was 1.2% at 13.3 mg B/kg bw/day (LOAEL) and 1.5% at 25 mg B/kg bw/day. Since the incidences are low, an ED10 cannot be derived and thus, the LOAEL of 13.3 mg B/kg bw/day is used for setting the concentration limits.

Correcting for the percentage of boron, a level of 13.3 mg B/kg bw/day would correspond to 147.8 mg barium diboron tetraoxide/kg bw/day. Barium diboron tetraoxide is therefore assigned to the medium potency group with a GCL of 0.3% since the ED10 is \geq 4 mg/kg bw/day and \leq 400 mg/kg bw/day.

Conclusion

Setting of specific concentration limit for adverse effects on the development of the offspring is not considered justified, and thus the GCL of 0.3% applies.

10.10.7 Adverse effects on or via lactation

No information was available for the assessment of effects on or via lactation of barium diboron tetraoxide. Read-across data on boric acid and borate salts from multi-generation animal studies are presented below. The available epidemiological studies investigating boron environmental and/or occupational exposure did not provide information on this endpoint. No animal data on barium effects on or via lactation were available.

Method, guideline, deviations if any, species, strain, sex, no/group ²³	Test substance, dose levels duration of exposure					Reference			
Boric acid and b	orax (disodium tet	raborate de	cahydra	te)					
Reproductive toxicity assessment study <u>No guideline</u> specified, but conforms to the standard three- generation, 2	Test material: boric acid or borax Purity: unknown <u>Doses/conc.</u> : 0, 117, 350 and 1170 ppm boron,	Effects on Significan observed a acid and b P3-F3A ge significant (presented	tly highe at 5.9 and orax trea eneration ly (p<0.0	r (p<0.0 l 17.5 m tments, adminis	5) lactati g B/kg b and at 17 stered bo	w/day, fo /.5 mg B rax show	or both b /kg bw/c ved a	lay, the	Weir and Fisher 1972 Weir 1966

 Table 23: Summary table of animal studies on effects on or via lactation

²³ Where applicable and unless stated otherwise, the reliability scores of the studies presented in Table 23 are according to the CLH dossier of boric acid, assessed by RAC in 2013.

Method,	Test substance,			l	Results					
guideline, deviations if	dose levels			-						
any, species, strain, sex,	exposure									
no/group ²³										
itters per generation	equivalent to 0, 5.9, 17.5 and			bw/day				bw/day		
nulti-	58.5 mg B/kg				Bora					
generation	bw				Bora	x				
studies normally used					P1-F1A			P1-F1B		
at the time.	Exposure: from		56.3	63.6	82.3 ^b	58.8	60	74.2		
The first filial	the beginning of the study (14			P2-F2A			P2-F2B	1		
eneration F1A) was	weeks pre-		48.3	79.8b	82.7 ^b	92.1	93.2	95.5		
arried through	mating exposure) until			P3-F3A			P3-F3B	<u> </u>		
eaning and iscarded. The	sacrifice of parents P1, and		91.5	81.1	79.1°	89.7	91.8	95.9		
eneration (P1)	from weaning	Lactation index ^a			Boric	acid	1	1		
as rebred to	until sacrifice of the F1- and F2-			P1-F1A			P1-F1B			
roduce their econd litter	generations		56.3	96.2	70.3 ^b	58.8	85.6b	80 ^b		
F1B). At the	(daily in feed).	(daily in feed).	(daily in feed).			P2-F2A			P2-F2B	<u> </u>
me of veaning, 16					48.3	79.2 ^b	83.1 ^b	92.1	81	98
emales and 8					P3-F3A			P3-F3B		
nales each rom the				91.5	82.5	86.5	89.7	86.7	87.9	
ontrol and test		^a Lactation in								
oups were lected at		^b Significantl ^c Significantl	y higher th	an control	s	iumber iei	t to nurse 2	X 100.		
ndom and			•							
esignated the										
cond parental eneration (P2)										
r										
ntinuation of										
e 1										
production 1dy. These										
imals were										
red to produce e F2A and										
B litters as										
fore. The										
B litter										
came the P3										
neration and										
ere bred to										
roduce the										
3A and F3B										
ters.										
at (Sprague-										
awley)										
ale/female										

Method,	Test substance,	Results	Reference
guideline,	dose levels	Kesuits	Reference
deviations if			
any, species,	exposure		
strain, sex,			
no/group ²³			
n = 8			
males/dose			
group and 16			
females/dose			
group			
Reliability: 2			
(reliable with			
restrictions)			
Donnod	Test moterial:	Effects on on via lastation	Eail at cl
Reproductive assessment by	Test material: boric acid	Effects on or via lactation During the lactation period, there were no effects on	Fail et al. 1991
continuous		viability or growth of F1 or F2 pups at any dose level.	1771
breeding	Purity: >99%		
Performed	Doses/conc.: 0,		
according to	<u>Doses/conc</u> 0, 1000 ppm, 4500		
the NTP's	ppm or 9000		
Reproductive	ppm equivalent		
Assessment by	to 0, 152, 636		
Continuous	and 1262 mg		
Breeding	boric acid/kg		
Protocol	bw/day,		
Mouse (Swiss)	equivalent to 0, 26.6, 111.3 and		
male/female	2010, 111.5 and 221 mg B/kg		
	bw/day,		
n = 19/sex/dose	respectively.		
groups			
No litters were			
born to F0	Exposure: 27		
parents	weeks (daily in		
exposed to	feed)		
9000 ppm, and only three			
litters were			
born alive to			
the 4500 ppm			
breeding pairs			
after			
cohabitation ended. Thus,			
F1 animals in			
the control and			
1000 ppm			
groups were			
chosen for			
assessing the			
F1 generation.			
Reliability: 2			
(reliable with			

Method,	Test substance,	Results	Reference
guideline,	dose levels		
deviations if			
any, species,	exposure		
strain, sex,			
no/group ²³			
restrictions)			
Prenatal	Test material:	Effects on or via lactation	Price et al.
Developmental	boric acid	During lactation and until PND 21, there were no effects on	1996a
Toxicity Study	some uclu	viability or growth of the offspring at any dose level.	17700
1 onlong Study	Purity: 98%	······································	
GLP-compliant	· · · · · · ·		
r	Doses/conc.: 0,		
Rat (Crl: CD	250, 500, 750,		
VAF/Plus	1000, 2000 ppm		
(Sprague	boric acid		
Dawley))	equivalent to 0,		
	19, 36, 55, 76		
n = groups of	and 143 mg		
14 - 17	boric acid/kg		
females/dose	bw/day,		
group/phase	respectively		
Daliah 11:4-1	(equivalent to 0 ,		
Reliability: 1 (reliable	3.3, 6.3, 9.6, 13.3 and 25 mg		
without	B/kg bw/day)		
restriction), key	D, Kg Uw/uay)		
study	Exposure phase		
Study	$\underline{\text{II}}$: days 0 - 20		
In phase II the	post mating		
dams were	(nominal in		
allowed to	diet), then on		
deliver and the	normal diet until		
pups reared to	termination on		
weaning and	PND 21		
then killed for			
full visceral			
and skeletal			
examination.			

Table 24: Summary table of human data on effects on or via lactation

Type of data/report	Test substance,	Relevant information about the study (as applicable)	Observations	Reference				
No human studies showing effects on or via lactation were available.								

Table 25: Summary table of other studies relevant for effects on or via lactation

J 1 -	Test substance,	Relevant information about the study (as applicable)	Observations	Reference					
No other stud	No other studies relevant for effects on or via lactation were available.								

10.10.8 Short summary and overall relevance of the provided information on effects on or via lactation

10.10.8.1 Animal studies

Data on barium diboron tetraoxide

No information on the effects of barium diboron tetraoxide on or via lactation was available.

Data on boric acid and borate salts

In a three-generation study (Weir and Fisher 1972) performed in rats administered boric acid or borax via feed, significantly (p<0.05) higher lactation indices (i.e. higher rate of surviving pups from birth to weaning) were observed for F1 and F2 generations (by approx. 34% and 71%, respectively, as compared to controls), at 5.9 and 17.5 mg B/kg bw/day. However, at 17.5 mg B/kg bw/day administered as borax in the F3 generation, a significantly (p<0.05) decreased lactation index was observed (by approx. 14%, as compared to controls). This effect was not seen at an equivalent dose of boric acid. The filial generations (F1, F2 and F3) did not differ statistically significantly from controls in terms of litter size, foetal weight and external appearance during lactation (data not shown). No information on maternal toxicity was reported. Due to the ambiguous data on pup viability during the lactation periods, and the unusually low survival rate in control pups of F1 and F2 generations, these data are not considered sufficient for classification for effects via lactation.

In a multi-generation study in mice administered boric acid (NTP continuous breeding protocol), no statistically significantly differences were observed in the body weight or viability of the F1 or F2 pups in any dose group, as compared to control pups, during lactation.

Data on barium chloride

No information on the effects of barium chloride on or via lactation was available.

10.10.8.2 Human data

Data on boric acid and borate salts

Administered doses of 1 - 13 g boric acid to breastfeeding mothers, gave rise to levels of 10 - 250 mg/L B in breast milk (Moseman 1994).

Data on barium compounds

No information on the effects of barium on or via lactation was available.

10.10.9 Comparison with the CLP criteria

As stated in the CLP Regulation (EC) No 1272/2008, the classification of substances for effects on or via lactation is assigned on the *a*) human evidence indicating a hazard to babies during the lactation period; and/or b) results of one or two generation studies in animals which provide clear evidence of adverse effects in the offspring due to transfer in the milk or adverse effects on the quality of the milk; and/or c) absorption, metabolism, distribution and excretion studies that indicate the likelihood that the substance is present in potentially toxic levels in breast milk.

There was no human evidence indicating a hazard of barium diboron tetraoxide or boron to babies during the lactation period.

There was no evidence of adverse effects in the offspring due to transfer in the milk or adverse effects on the quality of the milk in the available multi-generational studies of boric acid and borax in mouse and rat.

Based on the Moseman (1994) study, the data are not sufficient to conclude that boron is present in potentially toxic levels in breast milk.

Therefore, classification of barium diboron tetraoxide for adverse effects on or via lactation is not warranted.

10.10.10 Conclusion on classification and labelling for reproductive toxicity

Based on the total weight of evidence, classification as toxic to reproduction in category 1B for adverse effects on sexual function and fertility and the development of offspring, with a GCL of 0.3% for both hazard classes is considered appropriate.

Thus, the resulting classification proposal for barium diboron tetraoxide is Repr. 1B, H360FD.

10.11 Specific target organ toxicity-single exposure

Hazard class not assessed in this dossier.

10.12 Specific target organ toxicity-repeated exposure

Hazard class not assessed in this dossier.

10.13 Aspiration hazard

Hazard class not assessed in this dossier.

11 EVALUATION OF ENVIRONMENTAL HAZARDS

Enivironmental hazards were not assessed in this dossier.

12 EVALUATION OF ADDITIONAL HAZARDS

Additional hazards were not assessed in this dossier.

13 ADDITIONAL LABELLING

Not relevant.

14 REFERENCES

Acs, N., Bánhidy, F., Puhó, E. and Czeizel, A. E. (2006). Teratogenic effects of vaginal boric acid treatment during pregnancy. International Journal of Gynecology and Obstetrics, 93(1), 55-56.

Allen BC, Strong PL, Price CJ, Hubbard SA & Daston GP (1996). Benchmark dose analysis of developmental toxicity in rats exposed to boric acid. Fundamental and Applied Toxicology 32: 194 - 204.

ATSDR Report on boron, 2010. https://www.atsdr.cdc.gov/toxprofiles/tp.asp?id=453&tid=80

ATSDR Report on barium and barium compounds, 2007.<u>https://www.atsdr.cdc.gov/toxprofiles/tp.asp?id=327&tid=57</u>

Başaran N, Duydu Y, Bolt HM (2012). Reproductive toxicity in boron exposed workers in Bandirma, Turkey. Journal of Trace Elements in Medicine and Biology 26, 165–167.

Cain, W. S., Jalowayski, A. A., Kleinman, M., Lee, N. S., Lee, B. R., Ahn, B. H. and Culver, B. D. (2004). Sensory and associated reactions to mineral dusts: sodium borate, calcium oxide, and calcium sulfate. Journal of occupational and environmental hygiene, 1(4), 222-236.

Cain, W. S., Jalowayski, A. A., Schmidt, R., Kleinman, M., Magruder, K., Lee, K. C. and Culver, B. D. (2008). Chemesthetic responses to airborne mineral dusts: boric acid compared to alkaline materials. International archives of occupational and environmental health, 81(3), 337-345.

Chang, B. L., Robbins, W. A., Wei, F., Wu, G. and Elashoff, D. A. (2006). Boron workers in China: exploring work and lifestyle factors related to boron exposure. Aaohn Journal, 54(10), 435-443.

CICAD WHO Report on barium and barium compounds, 2001.<u>https://www.who.int/ipcs/publications/cicad/pdf/en/</u>

CLP (2017) Guidance Document. Guidance on the application of the CLP criteria. https://echa.europa.eu/documents/10162/23036412/clp_en.pdf/58b5dc6d-ac2a-4910-9702e9e1f5051cc5

Deng, J. F., Jan, I. S. and Cheng, H. S. (1991). The essential role of a poison center in handling an outbreak of barium carbonate poisoning. Veterinary and human toxicology, 33(2), 173-175.

Diengott, D., Rozsa, O., Levy, N. and Muammar, S. (1964). Hypokalaemia in barium poisoning. The Lancet, 284(7355), 343-344.

Dietz, D. D., Elwell, M. R., Davis Jr, W. E. and Meirhenry, E. F. (1992). Subchronic toxicity of barium chloride dihydrate administered to rats and mice in the drinking water. Fundamental and applied toxicology, 19(4), 527-537.

Downs, J. C., Milling, D. and Nichols, C. A. (1995). Suicidal ingestion of barium-sulfide-containing shaving powder. The American journal of forensic medicine and pathology, 16(1), 56-61.

Duydu, Y., Başaran, N., Üstündağ, A., Aydın, S., Ündeğer, Ü., Ataman, O. Y. and Golka, K. (2011). Reproductive toxicity parameters and biological monitoring in occupationally and environmentally boron-exposed persons in Bandırma, Turkey. Archives of toxicology, 85(6), 589-600.

Duydu, Y., Başaran, N., Aydın, S., Üstündağ, A., Yalçın, C. Ö., Anlar, H. G., and Ickstadt, K. (2018a). Evaluation of FSH, LH, testosterone levels and semen parameters in male boron workers under extreme exposure conditions. Archives of toxicology, 92(10), 3051-3059.

Duydu, Y., Başaran, N., Üstündağ, A., Aydın, S., Yalçın, C. Ö., Anlar, H. G. and Ickstadt, K. (2018b). Birth weights of newborns and pregnancy outcomes of environmentally boron-exposed females in Turkey. Archives of toxicology, 92(8), 2475-2485.

ECHA (2013) CLH Report on boric acid. <u>https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registry-of-clh-intentions-until-outcome/-/dislist/details/0b0236e180a10277</u>

ECHA (2013) CLH report on disodium octaborate, anhydrous. https://www.echa.europa.eu/documents/10162/be21c7a8-0dbe-d4d4-0f0a-0e50eb6ededf ECHA (2013) CLH report on disodium octaborate

tetrahydrate.https://www.echa.europa.eu/documents/10162/793cf4a0-398e-6d37-29c2-6f2040f61268

ECHA (2014) RAC Opinion on boric acid. <u>https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registry-of-clh-intentions-until-outcome/-/dislist/details/0b0236e180a10277</u>

ECHA (2014) RAC opinion on disodium octaborate anhydrate.<u>https://www.echa.europa.eu/documents/10162/7d740d8c-5cd5-872b-5da2-e549983a9ff9</u>

ECHA (2014) RAC opinion disodium octaborate tetrahydrate.<u>https://www.echa.europa.eu/documents/10162/658b802c-1ca3-663e-4bd4-437369d715de</u>

ECHA dissemination, [2018], REACH Registration for barium diboron tetraoxide.<u>https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered-dossier/15812</u>

ECHA dissemination, [2019], REACH Registration for barium. https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered-dossier/19625

EFSA (2012) Scientific Opinion. Guidance on selected default values to be used by the EFSA Scientific Committee, Scientific Panels and Units in the absence of actual measured data. https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/2579

FAO/WHO (2000) Guidance document. Guidelines for the preparation of toxicological working papers for the Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives. https://www.who.int/foodsafety/chem/jecfa/en/tox_guidelines.pdf

Fail, P. A., George, J. D., Seely, J. C., Grizzle, T. B., and Heindel, J. J. (1991). Reproductive toxicity of boric acid in Swiss (CD-1) mice: assessment using the continuous breeding protocol. Fundamental and Applied Toxicology, 17(2), 225-239.

Friis-Hansen, B., Aggerbeck, B., & Jansen, J. A. (1982). Unaffected blood boron levels in newborn infants treated with a boric acid ointment. Food and Chemical Toxicology, 20(4), 451-454.

Heindel, J. J., Price, C. J., Field, E. A., Marr, M. C., Myers, C. B., Morrissey, R. E., & Schwetz, B. A. (1992). Developmental toxicity of boric acid in mice and rats. Fundamental and applied toxicology, 18(2), 266-277.

Heindel, J. J., Price, C. J., & Schwetz, B. A. (1994). The developmental toxicity of boric acid in mice, rats, and rabbits. Environmental health perspectives, 102(Suppl 7), 107.

Igra, A. M., Harari, F., Lu, Y., Casimiro, E. and Vahter, M. (2016). Boron exposure through drinking water during pregnancy and birth size. Environment international, 95, 54-60.

Jourdan, S., Bertoni, M., Sergio, P., Michele, P. and Rossi, M. (2001). Suicidal poisoning with barium chloride. Forensic science international, 119(2), 263-265.

Korkmaz, M., Şaylı, U., Şaylı, B. S., Bakırdere, S., Titretir, S., Ataman, O. Y. and Keskin, S. (2007). Estimation of human daily boron exposure in a boron-rich area. British journal of nutrition, 98(3), 571-575.

Ku, W. W., Chapin, R. E., Wine, R. N. and Gladen, B. C. (1993). Testicular toxicity of boric acid (BA): relationship of dose to lesion development and recovery in the F344 rat. Reproductive toxicology, 7(4), 305-319.

Ku, W. W., Chapin, R. E., Moseman, R. F., Brink, R. E., Pierce, K. D. and Adams, K. Y. (1991). Tissue disposition of boron in male Fischer rats. Toxicology and applied pharmacology, 111(1), 145-151.

Lee, I. P., Sherins, R. J. and Dixon, R. L. (1978). Evidence for induction of germinal aplasia in male rats by environmental exposure to boron. Toxicology and applied pharmacology, 45(2), 577-590.

Marat, I., Arstan, M., Galymzhan, Y., Timur, J., Yerbolat, I. and Almasbek, Y. (2018). Impact of chromium and boron compounds on the reproductive function in rats. Toxicology and industrial health, 34(6), 365-374.

Minoia C, Sabbioni E, Apostoli P, Pietra R, Gallorini M, Nicolaou G, Alessio L and Capdoaglio E (1990). Trace element reference values in tissues from inhabitants of the European Community I. A study of 46 elements in urine, blood and serum of Italian subjects. The Science of the Total Environment 95, 89 - 105.

Moseman, R. F. (1994). Chemical disposition of boron in animals and humans. Environmental health perspectives, 102(suppl 7), 113-117.

Murray, F. J. (1998). A comparative review of the pharmacokinetics of boric acid in rodents and humans. Biological trace element research, 66(1-3), 331-341.

Pahl MV, Culver BD, Strong PL, Murray FJ and Vaziri ND (2001). The effect of pregnancy on renal clearance of boron in humans: A study based on normal dietary intake of boron. Toxicological Sciences 60: 252 - 256.

Price, C. J., Strong, P. L., Marr, M. C., Myers, C. B. and Murray, F. J. (1996a). Developmental toxicity NOAEL and postnatal recovery in rats fed boric acid during gestation. Fundamental and applied toxicology, 32(2), 179-193.

Price, C. J., Marr, M. C., Myers, C. B., Seely, J. C., Heindel, J. J., & Schwetz, B. A. (1996b). The developmental toxicity of boric acid in rabbits. Fundamental and applied toxicology, 34(2), 176-187.

Price, C. J., Strong, P. L., Murray, F. J., & Goldberg, M. M. (1997). Blood boron concentrations in pregnant rats fed boric acid throughout gestation. Reproductive Toxicology, 11(6), 833-842.

Sayli, B. S., Tüccar, E., and Elhan, A. H. (1998). An assessment of fertility in boron-exposed Turkish subpopulations. Reproductive Toxicology, 12(3), 297-304.

Sayli, B. S. (2003). Low frequency of infertility among workers in a borate processing facility. Biological trace element research, 93(1-3), 19-29.

Schroeder, H. A., Tipton, I. H., and Nason, A. P. (1972). Trace metals in man: strontium and barium. Journal of Chronic Diseases, 25(9), 491-517.

Shankle, R. and Keane, J. R. (1988). Acute Paralysis From Inhaled Barium Carbonate. Archives of neurology, 45(5), 579-580.

Study report (1979a). Acute oral toxicity of Busan 11-M1 in rats, as summarised in the publically disseminated REACH Registration for barium diboron tetraoxide.https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered-dossier/15812/7/3/2

Study report (1979b). Acute dermal toxicity of Busan 11-M1 in rats, as summarised in the publically disseminated REACH Registration for barium diboron

tetraoxide.https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered-dossier/15812/7/3/4

Study report (1983). Acute inhalation toxicity of Busan 11-M1 in rats, as summarised in the publically disseminated REACH Registration for barium diboron tetraoxide.<u>https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered-dossier/15812/7/3/3</u>

ter doxide.<u>mtps.//www.cena.europa.eu/web/guest/tegistration-dossiel/-/tegistered-dossiel/156</u>

Study report (1993a). 90-Day Oral Toxicity of Busan 11-M1 in rats.

Study report (1993b). Prenatal Developmental Toxicity study of Busan 11-M1 in rabbits, as summarised in the publically disseminated REACH Registration for barium diboron tetraoxide.<u>https://www.echa.europa.eu/web/guest/registration-dossier/-/registered-dossier/15812/7/9/3</u>

Taylor, D. M., Bligh, P. H. and Duggan, M. H. (1962). The absorption of calcium, strontium, barium and radium from the gastrointestinal tract of the rat. Biochemical journal, 83(1), 25.

Treinen, K. A., and Chapin, R. E. (1991). Development of testicular lesions in F344 rats after treatment with boric acid. Toxicology and applied pharmacology, 107(2), 325-335.

Tuccar, E., Elhan, A. H., Yavuz, Y. and Şayh, B. S. (1998). Comparison of infertility rates in communities from boron-rich and boron-poor territories. Biological trace element research, 66(1-3), 401-407.

Vaziri, N. D., Oveisi, F., Culver, B. D., Pahl, M. V., Andersen, M. E., Strong, P. L. and Murray, F. J. (2001). The effect of pregnancy on renal clearance of boron in rats given boric acid orally. Toxicological Sciences, 60(2), 257-263.

Weir, R. J. (1967). Two-year dietary feeding study-albino rats. Boric acid. Final Report. Hazleton Laboratories Inc., Falls Church, VA, July 8th, 1966 and Addendum to Final Report. Unpublished report to US Borax Research Corporation.

Weir Jr, R. J., and Fisher, R. S. (1972). Toxicologic studies on borax and boric acid. Toxicology and applied pharmacology, 23(3), 351-364.

Wester, R. C., Hui, X., Hartway, T., Maibach, H. I., Bell, K., Schell, M. J Northington DJ & Culver, B. D. (1998a). In vivo percutaneous absorption of boric acid, borax, and disodium octaborate tetrahydrate in humans compared to in vitro absorption in human skin from infinite and finite doses. Toxicological Sciences, 45(1), 42-51.

Wester, R. C., Hartway, T., Maibach, H. I., Schell, M. J., Northington, D. J., Culver, B. D., & Strong, P. L. (1998b). In vitro percutaneous absorption of boron as boric acid, borax, and disodium octaborate tetrahydrate in human skin. *Biological trace element research*, *66*(1-3), 111-120.

Whorton D, Haas J and Trent L. (1994a). Reproductive effects of inorganic borates on male employees: Birth rate assessment. Environ. Health Perspect. 102 (Suppl. 7) 129 - 131.

Whorton MD, Haas JL, Trent L and Wong O. (1994b). Reproductive effects of sodium borates on male employees: Birth rate assessment. Occupational and Environmental Medicine 51, 761 - 767.

Zschiesche, W., Schaller, K. H. and Weltle, D. (1992). Exposure to soluble barium compounds: an interventional study in arc welders. International archives of occupational and environmental health, 64(1), 13-23.

15 ANNEXES

Annex I to the CLH Report CONFIDENTIAL Annex: Constituents and concentration range